FEDERATED UNLEARNING WITH DIFFUSION MODELS

Anonymous authors

000

001 002 003

006 007

008 009

010

011

012

013

014

015

016

017

018

019

021

024

025

026

027 028 029 Paper under double-blind review

ABSTRACT

In recent years, diffusion models are widely adopted by individual users due to their outstanding performance in generation. During usage, individual users develop a need to forget privacy-related contents, making the scenario of using diffusion models on the clients a natural federated unlearning setting. For this scenario, we propose FedDUL, a Federated UnLearning method with Diffusion models, which addresses the unlearn requests from clients using the diffusion models. On one hand, we utilize local data on the clients to perform attentionbased unlearning, enabling the local diffusion model to forget the concepts specified by the clients. On the other hand, we filter and group the unlearn requests from clients, gradually aggregating reasonable requests into the global diffusion model on the server, thereby protecting client privacy within the global model. The theoretical analysis further demonstrates the inherent unity between the federated unlearning problem based on diffusion models and federated learning, and extend this unity to traditional federated unlearning methods. Extensive quantitation and visualization experiments are conducted to evaluate the unlearning of both local and global models and discuss the communication and computation costs of our method, demonstrating that our method can satisfy the unlearn requests of multiple clients without compromising the generative capabilities for irrelevant concepts, providing new ideas and methods for the application of diffusion models in federated unlearning.

1 INTRODUCTION

In recent years, diffusion models Ho et al. (2020); Song et al. (2020); Rombach et al. (2022); Dhariwal & Nichol (2021) have gained widespread attention for their outstanding performance in generation tasks and are gradually being applied in various scenarios for individual users. The emphasis on privacy among individual users makes the use of diffusion models for generation on the clients a natural federated learning scenario. Federated learning Mammen (2021); Li et al. (2020); Acar et al. (2021); Karimireddy et al. (2020) is a decentralized machine learning approach aimed at protecting user privacy while enabling collaborative model training across devices. Many methods Yang et al. (2024); Yang et al.; Zhang et al. (2023a) have applied diffusion models to image classification or autonomous driving within federated learning.

040 In practical applications, the diffusion models dispatched from the server to the clients are pre-trained 041 on vast datasets, allowing them to generate images that represent almost any distribution. This raises 042 significant concerns regarding the potential generation of images that infringe on user privacy. This 043 drives users to request the ability for models to unlearn these concepts, losing the capacity to generate 044 such sensitive information to protect personal privacy and enhance user experience. This gives rise to a new federated unlearning problem setting for clients using diffusion models. Currently, some federated unlearning methods Che et al. (2023); Li et al. (2023); Cha et al. (2024) have focused on 046 image classification tasks, but no one has yet focused on the federated unlearning problem associated 047 with using diffusion models for image generation on the clients. 048

049To address these challenges, this paper proposes a new problem setting, considering the forgetting050needs of clients using diffusion models. Therefore, we introduce FedDUL, a Federated UnLearning051method with Diffusion models. Specifically, the method includes two steps: the first step is local052unlearning. When users notice that the diffusion model generates a number of images that infringe053on their privacy, they can submit an unlearning request and utilize local generated data or additional
provided data for local training. We design an novel attention map-based diffusion model unlearning

method. After unlearning, the local diffusion model on the client can forget privacy-related concepts
while preserving the ability to generate unrelated concepts. Second, we aim to select reasonable
forgetting requests from it and integrate them into the server's global model. To do this, we upload the
word vectors of the sensitive concepts specified by each client along with the model parameters after
forgetting training to the server. At the server, we cluster the word vectors to derive forgetting targets
that represent the broader needs of users, and we aggregate the corresponding LoRA parameters into
the global model, ultimately achieving a global model that satisfies the unlearning needs of various
clients.

062 We conduct thorough theoretical analyses along with quantitative and visual experiments to demon-063 strate the effectiveness of our method. In the theoretical analysis, we argue that forgetting is essentially 064 a special learning process, a transition to more general concepts. We mathematically prove this viewpoint and further extend it to traditional federated forgetting methods based on classification 065 models. This theoretical framework provides a solid foundation for our subsequent experiments and 066 offers a new perspective on how models learn and forget in different tasks. The experimental section 067 evaluates the effectiveness of our proposed method from multiple aspects. First, we will conduct 068 quantitative and visual experiments to verify our forgetting method's ability to eliminate the influence 069 of specific concepts. We select a large number of concepts that are closely related but unrelated to the specified sensitive concepts to examine the model's generative ability regarding these unrelated 071 concepts post-forgetting, thereby proving that our method does not impact the diffusion model's 072 original generative capabilities. Additionally, ablation experiments will explore the impact of different 073 methods on model performance, analyze computational complexity, and assess the contributions of 074 various components to the final results.

075 076 In summary

077

078

079

081

082

084

085

090

092

In summary, the main contributions of this paper are:

- We propose a new federated unlearning problem setting for clients using diffusion models, which holds significant practical relevance as diffusion models are increasingly used by individual users.
- We introduce a novel federated unlearning method, FedDUL, for scenarios where clients utilize diffusion models. This involves a new attention map-based contrastive unlearning method for local unlearning on the clients while addressing how to aggregate multiple models that have undergone unlearning into the global model, thereby solving the unlearning requests of multiple clients simultaneously.
- We provide substantial theoretical analysis, proving the unity of the federated unlearning problem for clients using classification models or diffusion models with the federated learning problem, offering a new perspective on solving the federated unlearning problem and providing a theoretical foundation for our method.
 - Comprehensive quantitative and visual experiments demonstrate that our method can satisfy the forgetting needs of multiple clients without affecting the generative capabilities regarding unrelated concepts, effectively losing the ability to generate numerous sensitive or privacy-related concepts.
- 093 094 095 096

097

2 RELATED WORKS

098 2.1 FEDERATED LEARNING

Federated learning was first introduced with FedAvg McMahan et al. (2017), which is characterized by 101 its ability to aggregate knowledge from multiple clients while protecting client privacy, making model 102 aggregation a crucial component of federated learning. McMahan et al. (2017) initially achieved 103 model aggregation through direct parameter averaging. Subsequent methods Li et al. (2020; 2021); 104 Karimireddy et al. (2020); Su et al. (2023); Wang et al. (2020) have followed a similar approach 105 by aggregating model parameters without additional training. Additionally, methods like Lin et al. (2020) leverage knowledge distillation, while MOON employs client-based contrastive learning. 106 There are also approaches based on diffusion models, such as Yang et al. (2024); Yang et al.; Zhang 107 et al. (2023a), which contribute to the growing body of techniques in federated learning.

108 2.2 FEDERATED UNLEARNING

1109

When federated learning methods are used in practice, it has been observed that clients may terminate 111 collaborative learning, leading to the emergence of the federated unlearning problem Liu et al. 112 (2022b). When clients exit, they often wish to eliminate their influence on the global model for 113 privacy protection reasons Liu et al. (2023). Most federated unlearning methods Zhang et al. (2023b); 114 Ding et al. (2024); Guo et al. (2023) focus on image classification scenarios, where, upon receiving 115 an unlearning request from a client, the server needs to ensure that the global model loses the 116 classification ability for the client-specific classes or forgets the unique sample distribution of that client. Federated unlearning can be broadly classified into two categories based on the client's 117 involvement: active unlearning and passive unlearning Liu et al. (2023). Active unlearning Yuan 118 et al. (2023); Liu et al. (2021); Pan et al. (2022) refers to scenarios where clients deeply engage 119 in the unlearning process, conducting local training; some methods use knowledge distillation or 120 pseudo-label training to achieve unlearning. In contrast, passive unlearning Zhang et al. (2023b); 121 Jiang et al. (2024); Cao et al. (2023) involves clients not participating in the unlearning process, 122 typically requiring the server to have retained gradients or parameters from several rounds of client 123 uploads to facilitate unlearning. Currently, there are no federated unlearning methods specifically 124 designed for generative models such as diffusion models, and this paper addresses this challenge.

- 125
- 126 127

128

2.3 DIFFUSION MODEL

129 Diffusion models are first introduced in Sohl-Dickstein et al. (2015), and subsequent advancements 130 such as the latent diffusion model proposed by Ho et al. (2020), along with sampling methods like 131 DDIM Song et al. (2020), PNDM Liu et al. (2022a), have achieved impressive results, establishing 132 diffusion models as a mainstream choice for generative models. Stable Diffusion Rombach et al. 133 (2022) has further ignited a trend in AIGC (Artificial Intelligence Generated Content). A significant 134 highlight of diffusion models is their conditional generation capability, which allows them to generate 135 data from desired distributions given appropriate conditions, such as images Saharia et al. (2022a); 136 Wang et al. (2022); Su et al. (2022b); Zhang & Agrawala (2023), text Nichol et al. (2021); Saharia 137 et al. (2022b); Kim et al. (2022); Preechakul et al. (2022), or models Dhariwal & Nichol (2021); Feng 138 et al. (2022); Xie et al. (2023). However, since diffusion models are typically pre-trained on vast 139 datasets covering a wide range of distributions, they can also generate images containing sensitive content, including privacy-related information or graphic and explicit material Kumari et al. (2023). 140 As a result, the concept erasure in diffusion models has garnered increasing attention. Research on 141 concept erasure is still in its early stages. Some existing methods utilize foundation model-assisted 142 LoRA fine-tuning Lu et al. (2024), contrastive learning Gandikota et al. (2024); Li et al. (2024), 143 or fine-tuning of text encoders Zhang et al. (2024) to achieve the forgetting of specified concepts. 144 While some of these methods share similarities with the local unlearning approach used in this 145 paper—particularly in employing attention mechanisms for unlearning training—they do not address 146 the federated unlearning problem setting. These methods typically focus on forgetting one concept 147 at a time. For example, Lu et al. (2024) implements the forgetting of multiple concepts by using 148 separate model parameters for each concept. In contrast, the federated unlearning problem setting 149 with diffusion models proposed in this paper employs a single global model to simultaneously forget multiple concepts while protecting client privacy. 150

- 151
- 152 153

3 Method

154 155

In this section, we first introduce our problem setting in the Preliminaries, where we also define various symbols. Next, we detail our method, which consists of two main parts: first, the local unlearning process conducted by the clients, and second, the model aggregation on the server. Finally, in the theoretical analysis section, we demonstrate the unity of the federated unlearning problem based on diffusion models with the federated learning problem, further extending this conclusion to traditional federated forgetting methods based on classification models. The overall framework of our method is illustrated in Figure 1, and the pseudo code of our method is provided in the appendix.



Figure 1: The overall framework of FedDUL, including two main parts: Client Local Unlearning and Server Model Aggregation. Firstly, each client uses local data along with the defined unlearning concept C_i and the corresponding target concept C_T to perform LoRA fine-tuning on the local diffusion model ϵ_{θ_i} , thereby achieving unlearning of privacy-related concepts. The trained parameters are then uploaded to the server. The server clusters the received concept word embeddings and performs two rounds of parameter averaging to obtain the global model based on the clustering results.

186 187 188

189 190

191

199

204

211

212 213

179

181

182

183

185

3.1 PRELIMINARIES

3.1.1 DIFFUSION MODELS.

The DMs study the transformation from the Gaussian distribution to the realistic distribution by iterative denoising. During sampling, the DM ϵ_{θ} samples \mathbf{s}_T from the Gaussian distribution, where *T* is the predetermined maximum timestep. The DM takes \mathbf{s}_T as the initial noise of the denoising process and uses the input text prompt *p* and the input image *q* as conditions. After *T* timesteps of denoising, \mathbf{s}_T is restored to a real image \mathbf{s}_0 with specified semantics. For any given time step $t \in \{0, \ldots, T\}$, the sampling process is as follows:

$$\mathbf{s}_{t-1} = \sqrt{\alpha_{t-1}} \left(\frac{\mathbf{s}_t - \sqrt{1 - \alpha_t} \epsilon_\theta(\mathbf{s}_t, t | p, q)}{\sqrt{\alpha_t}} \right) + \sqrt{1 - \alpha_{t-1} - \sigma_t^2} \cdot \epsilon_\theta(\mathbf{s}_t, t | p, q) + \sigma_t \varepsilon_t$$
(1)

where α_t , α_{t-1} and σ_t are pre-defined parameters, ε_t is the Gaussian noise randomly sampled at each timestep.

203 3.1.2 PROBLEM SETTING AND NOTATION

This paper considers a new federated unlearning problem setting when the client models are diffusion models. We assume there are N clients, and the server first distributes the diffusion model ϵ_{θ_p} pre-trained on a vast dataset \mathcal{D}_p to these clients. Each client *i*, during usage, develops a unlearning request regarding a unlearning concept C_i and thus provides a dataset \mathcal{D}_i related to the unlearning concept C_i for local unlearning. Ultimately, these local unlearning processes are aggregated into a global model ϵ_{θ_g} , following the global objective function:

$$\max_{\theta_g} \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=0}^{N} D_{KL}(p_{\theta_g}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i) || p_{\theta_p}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i)), \forall t \in \{0, ..., T\}$$
(2)

214 where D_{KL} represents the KL divergence, the initial noise of denoising process $s_T \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \mathcal{I})$, 215 $p_{\theta_g}(s_t|\mathcal{C}_i)$ represents the conditional distribution of the global model ϵ_{θ_g} conditioned on the unlearning concept \mathcal{C}_i , and $p_{\theta_p}(s_t|\mathcal{C}_i)$ represents the similar conditional distribution of the pre-trained model 216 ϵ_{θ_n} . From the loss function, it is clear that the goal of our problem setting is to obtain a global 217 model ϵ_{θ_a} that maximizes the KL divergence between the conditional distributions regarding the 218 unlearning concept C_i and satisfies each client's unlearning request, meaning it does not related to 219 each client's privacy and does not include the sensitive information requested by the clients. We 220 will also conduct quantitative performance testing of the model according to this objective in the subsequent experimental section. 221

222 223

224

3.2 LOCAL UNLEARNING

As mentioned before, after the server distributes the pre-trained model ϵ_{θ_n} to the clients, the clients 225 may find that the diffusion model, having been pre-trained on a vast pre-trained dataset \mathcal{D}_p , could 226 generate outputs that infringe on client privacy or contain sensitive information the clients wish to 227 avoid. In this case, clients need to perform unlearning training using local data \mathcal{D}_i to ensure the 228 diffusion model loses the ability to generate such privacy-related or sensitive information. 229

Specifically, the goal of unlearning does not mean generating noises or meaningless outputs when 230 given the unlearning concept C_i . Instead, it involves finding a target concept C_T that are more 231 generalized and do not infringe on user privacy or include sensitive information. For instance, if a 232 client deems the generation of a specific person as a privacy violation, the unlearning objective would 233 be to forget the specific appearance of that individual and instead generate a more generalized people. 234 Thus, for each client's unlearning concept C_i , users can define a more generalized target concept 235 C_T , and we define the client's unlearning objective as training a local model ϵ_{θ_i} to minimize the KL 236 divergence between the two conditional distributions:

- 237
- 238 239

240 241

242

 $\min_{\theta_i} D_{KL}(p_{\theta_i}(s_t|\mathcal{C}_i)||p_{\theta_p}(s_t|\mathcal{C}_T)), \forall t \in \{0, ..., T\}$

(3)

We achieve this objective using two attention map-related loss functions. For the same initial noise $s_T \sim \mathcal{N}(0,\mathcal{I})$, we guide the denoising process using both the unlearning concept \mathcal{C}_i and the target 243 concept C_T . At each time step of the denoising process, we obtain two attention maps corresponding 244 to the current denoised sample s_t . To ensure these two conditional distributions are as close as possible, we take the contrastive loss between the two attention maps as our loss function: 246

247 248

249 250

~~~

245

 $\mathcal{L}_{con} = \sum_{l} \left\| A_{t}^{l}(\mathcal{C}_{i}) - A_{t}^{l}(\mathcal{C}_{T}) \right\|^{2}, \forall t \in \{0, ..., T\}$ (4)

where l is the layers of the local model  $\epsilon_{\theta_i}$ ,  $A_t^l(\mathcal{C}_i)$  and  $A_t^l(\mathcal{C}_T)$  are the attention maps conditioned 251 on the unlearning concept  $C_i$  and the target concept  $C_T$  of layer l at timestep t. It's important to 252 note that we do not use the distance between the results of the two denoising processes as the loss 253 function; instead, we focus on the attention maps. This is because the noise content in the denoising 254 results at most time steps is quite high. Although the starting point of the denoising process is 255 equivalent, the randomness of the denoising limits how much the initial noise can be denoised at 256 the given timestep, leading to limited semantic information from the distances between the outputs 257 and potentially introducing error information. In contrast, attention maps represent the contours and 258 key points of the corresponding semantics found in the current image, significantly reducing noise 259 content. Finding closeness between attention maps can also yield better learning outcomes, which we 260 demonstrate in subsequent ablation experiments.

261 However, simply bringing the attention maps of the two concepts closer does not ensure the effective-262 ness of unlearning. Generally, the target concept  $C_T$  is a more generalized version of the unlearning 263 concept  $C_i$ , and their semantics often exhibit a hierarchical relationship with strong correlations. 264 While making the two attention maps closer, we also need to minimize the guiding influence of the 265 unlearning concept  $C_i$  on generation. Therefore, we introduce another attention map-related loss function, using the mean attention value of the sensitive concept at the current time step as the loss 266 function, aiming for minimal activation values caused by the sensitive concept: 267

$$\mathcal{L}_{attn} = \sum_{l} \left\| A_t^l(\mathcal{C}_i) \right\|_F^2, \forall t \in \{0, ..., T\}$$
(5)

The overall loss function is as follows:

279 280

281

$$\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{L}_{con} + \beta \mathcal{L}_{attn} \tag{6}$$

where  $\beta$  is the weight of  $\mathcal{L}_{attn}$ . Through this loss, we complete the unlearning process on the client's local diffusion model, enabling the generation of images representing a more generalized target concept upon receiving a sensitive concept. However, in a federated unlearning problem setting, it is crucial to address how to aggregate these locally trained results into the global model, without revealing the exact unlearning concepts or providing any data to the server. We primarily tackle this issue in the subsequent model aggregation section.

#### 3.3 MODEL AGGREGATION

282 To integrate the unlearning requests of various clients into the global model  $\epsilon_{\theta_a}$ , we need an additional 283 model aggregation step. First, the server will receive the trained model parameters  $\epsilon_{\theta_i}, i \in \{0, ..., N\}$ uploaded by the clients along with the word embeddings for the unlearning concepts  $C_i, i \in \{0, ..., N\}$ . 284 To avoid performance degradation from aggregating a large number of models simultaneously, we 285 cluster these word embeddings based on their similarities. Each cluster contains word embeddings 286 that share similar information. We use a hierarchical structure to first aggregate the model parameters 287 corresponding to the word embeddings within each cluster, resulting in the model parameters for the 288 overall cluster, and then further aggregate the cluster parameters to obtain the final global model. We 289 use the averaging method for model parameter aggregation: 290

 $\alpha$ 

$$\epsilon_{\theta_g} = \sum_{c=0}^{C} \frac{1}{C} \epsilon_{\hat{\theta}_c}, \epsilon_{\hat{\theta}_c} = \sum_{\epsilon_{\theta_i} \in M_c} \frac{1}{|M_c|} \epsilon_{\theta_i}, c \in \{0, ..., C\}$$
(7)

where C is the number of clusters and  $M_c$  is a cluster of the client local model  $\epsilon_{\theta_i}$ . It's important to note that, intuitively, in the federated learning process, each model contains unique knowledge that is not influenced by the others, and averaging allows for the aggregation of this unique knowledge into the global model. However, in the unlearning process, each model has forgotten a portion of its knowledge. During aggregation, it may seem that the knowledge could complement one another, resulting in the global model not actually achieving unlearning. While this reasoning is fundamentally flawed, as unlearning and learning processes are essentially unified. We demonstrate this point in subsequent theoretical analysis and experimental sections.

304

# 3.4 THEORETICAL ANALYSIS

In this section, we explore the unity between our proposed federated unlearning problem setting for
 clients using diffusion models and the federated learning problem setting, and extend this conclusion
 to traditional federated unlearning problems for classification models.

First, we consider the federated unlearning problem setting based on diffusion models. As analyzed previously, we can transform the maximization objective function from Eq. (2) into a minimization objective function similar to Eq. (3):

310 311

308

312 313 314

315

320 321 322

$$\min_{\theta_g} \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=0}^{N} D_{KL}(p_{\theta_g}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i) || p_{\theta_p}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_T)), \forall t \in \{0, ..., T\}$$
(8)

Thus, we arrive at the following theorem:

**Theorem 1** For the federated unlearning problem with the objective function as in Eq. (8), the problem setting exhibits unity with federated learning, meaning its loss function can be expressed as:

$$\min_{\theta_g} \sum_{i=0}^{N} \mathcal{L}_i(\theta_g), where \mathcal{L}_i(\theta_g) = \sum_{s_T \sim \mathcal{N}(0,I), t \in \{0,..,T\}} \log p_{\theta_p}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_T) (p_{\theta_i}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i) - p_{\theta_g}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i)) + H(p_{\theta_n}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i)) - H(p_{\theta_i}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i))$$
(9)

A detailed proof of the theorem can be found in the appendix. This demonstrates the essential unity
 between the federated unlearning problem based on diffusion models and the federated learning
 problem.

This conclusion can also be extended to traditional federated unlearning problems for classification models. Similar to the definition in Eq. (2), for the global model before unlearning  $\theta_p$  in the traditional federated unlearning problem, the objective function can be defined as:

 $\max_{\theta_g} \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=0}^{N} \sum_{x_j \in \mathcal{D}_i} D_{KL}(p_{\theta_p}(x_j) || p_{\theta_g}(x_j))$ (10)

where  $D_i$  is the unlearning set of client *i*. Based on this objective function, firstly, we can obtain the following lemma:

**Lemma 1** For each client *i* and its unlearning set  $\mathcal{D}_i$ , the objective function in Eq. (10) has an upper bound, and the upper bound is achieved when  $p_{\theta_g}(x_j)$  and  $x_j$  are independent for all  $x_j \in \mathcal{D}_i$ , for example:

 $D_{KL}(p_{\theta_n}(x_j)||p_{\theta_n}(x_j)) \le D_{KL}(p_{\theta_n}(x_j)||\mathcal{N}(0,I)), \forall x_j \in \mathcal{D}_i$ (11)

Based on Lemma 1, similarly, we can obtain the following theorem:

**Theorem 2** For the traditional federated unlearning problem with the objective function as in Eq. (10), the problem setting exhibits unity with federated learning, meaning its loss function can be expressed as:

354

355

356

357

358 359

331

332

333 334

340

341 342

344

345

 $\min_{\theta_g} \sum_{i=0}^{N} \mathcal{L}_i(\theta_g), where \mathcal{L}_i(\theta_g) = \sum_{x_j \in \mathcal{D}_i, \varepsilon \sim \mathcal{N}(0, I)} p_{\theta_p}(x) (\log p_{\theta_i}(x) - \log \varepsilon)$ (12)

A detailed proof of the theorem can be found in the appendix. Theorems 1 and 2 demonstrate the unity between federated unlearning and federated learning problems, indicating that we can leverage traditional federated learning methods to address federated unlearning issues. This provides a theoretical foundation for using model aggregation techniques in federated unlearning problem, such as knowledge distillation, client training with pseudo-label, and the averaging methods discussed in this paper. Additionally, it offers a fresh perspective for tackling federated unlearning challenges.

4 EXPERIMENTS

360 361 362

363

4.1 EXPERIMENTAL SETTINGS

364 4.1.1 DATASET

We mainly simulate two potential privacy infringement scenarios for clients: one involving the generation of a specified face, and the other involving the generation of a specified artist's style.

368
 369
 369
 370
 370
 371
 371
 372
 372
 Celebs For the dataset of faces, we collect faces of 100 celebrities along with 20 facial photos of each celebrity from the internet. We select 50 celebrities as the Unlearn Set, representing 50 clients, while the remaining 50 celebrities formed the Retain Set, which was used to test the generation capability for unrelated categories.

Artists For the artist style dataset, we gather 300 kinds of artist styles that Stable Diffusion can generate from the Image Synthesis Style Studies Database Ima, and collected 20 representative works for each artist from WikiArt Mancini et al. (2018). We also select 150 celebrities as the Unlearn Set, representing 150 clients, while the remaining 150 celebrities formed the Retain Set.

377 Due to space constraints, detailed descriptions of the datasets and additional implementation details can be found in the supplementary material and appendix.



Figure 2: The visualization results of unlearning concepts for different methods.

#### 4.1.2 EVALUATION METRICS

We primarily select two quantitative metrics to evaluate the quality of unlearning. First, we directly compare the KL divergence between the generated dataset and the original dataset. For unlearning concepts, a larger KL divergence indicates better unlearning performance, whereas for unrelated concepts, a smaller KL divergence is preferable. Second, we train classification models separately on the generated and original datasets and tested their accuracy on a generated test dataset. For unlearning concepts, lower classifier accuracy indicates better unlearning, while for unrelated concepts, higher classifier accuracy is preferred.

418 419

420

405 406

407 408 409

410

### 4.1.3 COMPARED METHODS

When comparing the effects of local unlearning at the clients, we select three concept erasing methods
for diffusion models as baselines, ACD Kumari et al. (2023), MUI Li et al. (2024) and MACE Lu
et al. (2024). For the comparison of global models, we provide results for the local model, the global
model obtained by direct averaging, and the global model obtained by our proposed cluster-based
averaging. For example, in ACD, ACD-L represents the results generated by the local model trained
using ACD, ACD-A represents the results from directly averaging the local models, and ACD-C
represents the results from averaging after clustering.

Since most existing federated unlearning methods are not applicable to our newly proposed problem
setting, we adapt three methods for diffusion models and conducted experiments: AF Li et al. (2023),
LU Cha et al. (2024), and FUKD Wu et al. (2022). Specifically, for AF and LU, which are based on
pseudo-label training, we provide the expected labels for the clients' images and used these image-label pairs to train the clients' diffusion models. For FUKD, after the client completed unlearning



Unrelated Concept: An artwork in Albert Bierstadt style.

Figure 3: The visualization results of retain concepts for different methods.

|         |             |       | ACD-A  | ACD-C  | MUI-A  | MUI-C  | MACE-A | MACE-C | AF     | LU     | FUKD   | FedDUL |
|---------|-------------|-------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|
|         | Unlearn Set | KLD↑  | 138.12 | 164.91 | 142.88 | 175.19 | 145.14 | 176.83 | 127.3  | 115.35 | 146.65 | 187.27 |
| Celebs  |             | Acc.↓ | 65.87  | 43.86  | 62.21  | 39.5   | 59.44  | 35.58  | 72.04  | 75.25  | 67.61  | 34.88  |
| Celebs  | Retain Set  | KLD↓  | 71.93  | 75.56  | 73.35  | 77.01  | 74.92  | 73.12  | 106.29 | 125.73 | 98.71  | 68.65  |
|         |             | Acc.↑ | 74.6   | 76.03  | 76.84  | 72.52  | 73.32  | 75.06  | 62.09  | 58.66  | 67.62  | 79.06  |
|         | Unlearn Set | KLD↑  | 174.08 | 193.32 | 168.53 | 182.34 | 171.85 | 183.87 | 154.21 | 148.91 | 176.8  | 205.44 |
| Artists |             | Acc.↓ | 37.16  | 33.25  | 41.82  | 35.74  | 37.62  | 34.48  | 45.3   | 47.27  | 36.83  | 31.8   |
| AIUSIS  | Retain Set  | KLD↓  | 103.23 | 106.18 | 98.81  | 101.36 | 96.71  | 94.52  | 143.09 | 124.01 | 105.68 | 89.79  |
|         |             | Acc.↑ | 47.48  | 43.83  | 52.03  | 50.12  | 53.32  | 55.43  | 34.48  | 37.92  | 41.55  | 62.25  |

Table 1: The performance of different methods on the Celebs and Artists datasets for the Unlearn Set and Retain Set. KLD represents the KL divergence between the generated dataset and the original local dataset. Acc. denotes the accuracy of the classifier trained on the generated dataset. ↑ indicates that a higher value is better for the given metric, while ↓ indicates that a lower value is better. The best performance for each metric is highlighted in bold.

training, the client's images were uploaded to the server for knowledge distillation on the global model.

4.2 MAIN RESULTS

Table 1 shows the performance of our method and various compared methods on four datasets. Wehighlight several observations:

For both the Celebs dataset and the Artists dataset, our method achieved the best performance on both the KLD and accuracy (Acc.) metrics for the Unlearn Set and Retain Set. This indicates that our method effectively maintains the generation capability for unrelated categories while obtaining a global model that satisfies all clients' unlearning requests.

|                                                  |                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                       | Cel                                                 | lebs                                                        |                                                     |                                                         | Art                                                        | ists                                                      |                                                         |
|--------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------|
| $\mathcal{L}_{con}$                              | $\mathcal{L}_{attn}$                                  | Cluster-based Aggregation                                                                                                                                             | Unlear                                                                |                                                     |                                                             | n Set                                               | Unlear                                                  |                                                            | Retai                                                     | n Set                                                   |
| con                                              | · · · · · · · · ·                                     | 66 6                                                                                                                                                                  | KLD↑                                                                  | Acc.                                                | KLD↓                                                        | Acc.↑                                               | KLD↑                                                    | Acc.                                                       | KLD↓                                                      | Acc.↑                                                   |
| $\checkmark$                                     |                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                       | 165.49                                                                | 43.47                                               | 82.24                                                       | 72.29                                               | 186.56                                                  | 37.69                                                      | 102.61                                                    | 56.38                                                   |
|                                                  | $\checkmark$                                          |                                                                                                                                                                       | 162.61                                                                | 39.98                                               | 73.42                                                       | 75.64                                               | 188.08                                                  | 36.78                                                      | 96.92                                                     | 58.44                                                   |
| $\checkmark$                                     | $\checkmark$                                          |                                                                                                                                                                       | 174.18                                                                | 36.96                                               | 71.41                                                       | 77.87                                               | 192.31                                                  | 34.66                                                      | 93.06                                                     | 60.82                                                   |
| √                                                | $\checkmark$                                          | $\checkmark$                                                                                                                                                          | 187.27                                                                | 34.88                                               | 68.65                                                       | 79.06                                               | 205.44                                                  | 31.8                                                       | 89.79                                                     | 62.25                                                   |
|                                                  |                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                       |                                                     |                                                             |                                                     |                                                         |                                                            |                                                           |                                                         |
|                                                  |                                                       | Table 2: The influ<br>he ACD, MUI, and MAG<br>d average aggregation m                                                                                                 | CE meth                                                               | ods, th                                             | e global                                                    | models                                              | s obtaine                                               | ed using                                                   |                                                           |                                                         |
|                                                  | avera<br>globa<br>prope                               | ging. This demonstrates<br>al level, especially with a<br>osed model aggregation                                                                                      | that dire<br>large nu<br>approacl                                     | ect avera<br>umber o<br>h.                          | aging ca<br>of client                                       | n dimin<br>s, highl                                 | ish the u<br>ighting t                                  | nlearni<br>he effe                                         | ng effec<br>ctivenes                                      | ts at the<br>s of our                                   |
|                                                  |                                                       | D showed relatively go<br>ledge distillation, it com                                                                                                                  |                                                                       |                                                     |                                                             |                                                     |                                                         |                                                            |                                                           |                                                         |
|                                                  | they                                                  | AF and LU methods exl<br>used incorrect pseudo-la<br>eneration capability for                                                                                         | bels for                                                              | training                                            | g the dif                                                   |                                                     |                                                         |                                                            |                                                           |                                                         |
| t can l<br>eques<br>ninim                        | be obse<br>ts of ea<br>al impa                        | act extensive visualization<br>rved that our method su<br>ach client, while mainta<br>ct.                                                                             | ccessful                                                              | lly obta                                            | ains a gl                                                   | obal m                                              | odel that                                               | t meets                                                    | the unl                                                   | earning                                                 |
| unctic<br>t can b                                | ns and                                                | blation experiments on<br>the cluster-based model<br>that removing $\mathcal{L}_{con}$ , $\mathcal{L}_{att}$<br>ce.                                                   | aggregat                                                              | ion. Th                                             | ne result                                                   | s are sh                                            | own in T                                                | Table 2.                                                   | From th                                                   | ne table,                                               |
| 4.4 I                                            | LIMITA                                                | TIONS AND DISCUSSION                                                                                                                                                  | NS                                                                    |                                                     |                                                             |                                                     |                                                         |                                                            |                                                           |                                                         |
| ost an<br>ocal u<br>esultir<br>nultipl<br>ederat | d comp<br>nlearning<br>in a v<br>le round<br>ed learn | , we discuss factors that<br>utation cost. Regarding c<br>ng process on clients, on<br>very limited communicat<br>ls of communication, the<br>ning methods using LoR. | communities<br>ly the particular<br>ion cost.<br>commune<br>A fine-tu | ication<br>aramete<br>Morec<br>nication<br>ining, v | cost, sin<br>ers from<br>over, as t<br>a cost of<br>which m | ce we u<br>the Lol<br>he unle<br>our me<br>eans tha | se LoRA<br>RA layer<br>arning p<br>thod is s<br>at comm | A fine-tu<br>rs need<br>rocess of<br>imilar t<br>unication | ining du<br>to be up<br>does not<br>o most c<br>on cost c | ring the<br>bloaded,<br>require<br>one-shot<br>loes not |
| hat sir<br>ompu<br>raining                       | ice LoR<br>tational<br>g diffus                       | mit the practicality of ou<br>A fine-tuning of the diff<br>capability on the clients<br>ion models Yang et al. or<br>computational cost is al                         | usion mo<br>s. Howev<br>other fo                                      | odel is i<br>ver, givo<br>oundatio                  | needed of<br>en that sonal moo                              | on clien<br>some ex<br>dels Su                      | ts, our m<br>isting m<br>et al. (20                     | ethod a<br>ethods<br>22a); C                               | requires<br>already<br>3uo et al                          | enough<br>involve<br>. (2022)                           |
| 5 C                                              | ONCL                                                  | USION                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                       |                                                     |                                                             |                                                     |                                                         |                                                            |                                                           |                                                         |

In this paper, we extend the federated unlearning problem to the scenario where clients use diffusion
models and propose FedDUL, introducing a novel client local unlearning method and exploring
how to aggregate a large number of unlearned models into a global model. To demonstrate the
effectiveness of our method, we construct two datasets, and conduct extensive quantitative and
visual experiments. Additionally, through theoretical analysis, we prove the inherent unity between
federated unlearning and federated learning, offering a new perspective on solving the federated
unlearning problem and providing a theoretical foundation for our method.

# 540 REFERENCES

547

558 559

561

562

563

565

566 567

568

569

570

577

578

579 580

581

- 542 Image synthesis style studies. URL https://www.aiartapps.com/ai-art-apps/ image-synthesis-style-studies.
- Durmus Alp Emre Acar, Yue Zhao, Ramon Matas Navarro, Matthew Mattina, Paul N Whatmough, and Venkatesh Saligrama. Federated learning based on dynamic regularization. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2111.04263*, 2021.
- Xiaoyu Cao, Jinyuan Jia, Zaixi Zhang, and Neil Zhenqiang Gong. Fedrecover: Recovering from poisoning attacks in federated learning using historical information. In 2023 IEEE Symposium on Security and Privacy (SP), pp. 1366–1383. IEEE, 2023.
- Sungmin Cha, Sungjun Cho, Dasol Hwang, Honglak Lee, Taesup Moon, and Moontae Lee. Learning
   to unlearn: Instance-wise unlearning for pre-trained classifiers. In *Proceedings of the AAAI Conference on Artificial Intelligence*, volume 38, pp. 11186–11194, 2024.
- Tianshi Che, Yang Zhou, Zijie Zhang, Lingjuan Lyu, Ji Liu, Da Yan, Dejing Dou, and Jun Huan. Fast federated machine unlearning with nonlinear functional theory. In *International conference on machine learning*, pp. 4241–4268. PMLR, 2023.
  - Prafulla Dhariwal and Alexander Nichol. Diffusion models beat gans on image synthesis. Advances in neural information processing systems, 34:8780–8794, 2021.
  - Ningning Ding, Ermin Wei, and Randall Berry. Strategic data revocation in federated unlearning. In *IEEE INFOCOM 2024-IEEE Conference on Computer Communications*, pp. 1151–1160. IEEE, 2024.
  - Weixi Feng, Xuehai He, Tsu-Jui Fu, Varun Jampani, Arjun Akula, Pradyumna Narayana, Sugato Basu, Xin Eric Wang, and William Yang Wang. Training-free structured diffusion guidance for compositional text-to-image synthesis. arXiv preprint arXiv:2212.05032, 2022.
  - Rohit Gandikota, Hadas Orgad, Yonatan Belinkov, Joanna Materzyńska, and David Bau. Unified concept editing in diffusion models. In *Proceedings of the IEEE/CVF Winter Conference on Applications of Computer Vision*, pp. 5111–5120, 2024.
- Tao Guo, Song Guo, Junxiao Wang, and Wenchao Xu. Promptfl: Let federated participants coop eratively learn prompts instead of models–federated learning in age of foundation model. *arXiv* preprint arXiv:2208.11625, 2022.
- 574 Xintong Guo, Pengfei Wang, Sen Qiu, Wei Song, Qiang Zhang, Xiaopeng Wei, and Dongsheng
   575 Zhou. Fast: Adopting federated unlearning to eliminating malicious terminals at server side. *IEEE* 576 *Transactions on Network Science and Engineering*, 2023.
  - Jonathan Ho, Ajay Jain, and Pieter Abbeel. Denoising diffusion probabilistic models. Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems, 33:6840–6851, 2020.
  - Yu Jiang, Jiyuan Shen, Ziyao Liu, Chee Wei Tan, and Kwok-Yan Lam. Towards efficient and certified recovery from poisoning attacks in federated learning. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2401.08216*, 2024.
- Sai Praneeth Karimireddy, Satyen Kale, Mehryar Mohri, Sashank Reddi, Sebastian Stich, and Ananda Theertha Suresh. Scaffold: Stochastic controlled averaging for federated learning. In *International Conference on Machine Learning*, pp. 5132–5143. PMLR, 2020.
- Gwanghyun Kim, Taesung Kwon, and Jong Chul Ye. Diffusionclip: Text-guided diffusion models
   for robust image manipulation. In *Proceedings of the IEEE/CVF Conference on Computer Vision and Pattern Recognition*, pp. 2426–2435, 2022.
- Nupur Kumari, Bingliang Zhang, Sheng-Yu Wang, Eli Shechtman, Richard Zhang, and Jun-Yan Zhu. Ablating concepts in text-to-image diffusion models. In *Proceedings of the IEEE/CVF International Conference on Computer Vision*, pp. 22691–22702, 2023.
- 593 Guihong Li, Hsiang Hsu, Radu Marculescu, et al. Machine unlearning for image-to-image generative models. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2402.00351*, 2024.

| 594<br>595<br>596        | Tian Li, Anit Kumar Sahu, Ameet Talwalkar, and Virginia Smith. Federated learning: Challenges, methods, and future directions. <i>IEEE signal processing magazine</i> , 37(3):50–60, 2020.                                                                                                           |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 597<br>598<br>599        | Xiaoxiao Li, Meirui Jiang, Xiaofei Zhang, Michael Kamp, and Qi Dou. Fed{bn}: Federated learning<br>on non-{iid} features via local batch normalization. In <i>International Conference on Learning</i><br><i>Representations</i> , 2021. URL https://openreview.net/pdf?id=6YEQUn0QICG.              |
| 600<br>601<br>602        | Yuyuan Li, Chaochao Chen, Xiaolin Zheng, and Jiaming Zhang. Federated unlearning via active forgetting. <i>arXiv preprint arXiv:2307.03363</i> , 2023.                                                                                                                                               |
| 603<br>604<br>605        | Tao Lin, Lingjing Kong, Sebastian U Stich, and Martin Jaggi. Ensemble distillation for robust model<br>fusion in federated learning. Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems, 33:2351–2363,<br>2020.                                                                                       |
| 606<br>607<br>608<br>609 | Gaoyang Liu, Xiaoqiang Ma, Yang Yang, Chen Wang, and Jiangchuan Liu. Federaser: Enabling efficient client-level data removal from federated learning models. In 2021 IEEE/ACM 29th international symposium on quality of service (IWQOS), pp. 1–10. IEEE, 2021.                                      |
| 610<br>611               | Luping Liu, Yi Ren, Zhijie Lin, and Zhou Zhao. Pseudo numerical methods for diffusion models on manifolds. <i>arXiv preprint arXiv:2202.09778</i> , 2022a.                                                                                                                                           |
| 612<br>613<br>614<br>615 | Yi Liu, Lei Xu, Xingliang Yuan, Cong Wang, and Bo Li. The right to be forgotten in federated learning: An efficient realization with rapid retraining. In <i>IEEE INFOCOM 2022-IEEE Conference on Computer Communications</i> , pp. 1749–1758. IEEE, 2022b.                                          |
| 616<br>617<br>618        | Ziyao Liu, Yu Jiang, Jiyuan Shen, Minyi Peng, Kwok-Yan Lam, Xingliang Yuan, and Xiaoning Liu. A survey on federated unlearning: Challenges, methods, and future directions. <i>ACM Computing Surveys</i> , 2023.                                                                                     |
| 619<br>620<br>621<br>622 | Shilin Lu, Zilan Wang, Leyang Li, Yanzhu Liu, and Adams Wai-Kin Kong. Mace: Mass concept erasure in diffusion models. In <i>Proceedings of the IEEE/CVF Conference on Computer Vision and Pattern Recognition</i> , pp. 6430–6440, 2024.                                                             |
| 623<br>624               | Priyanka Mary Mammen. Federated learning: Opportunities and challenges. <i>arXiv preprint arXiv:2101.05428</i> , 2021.                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 625<br>626<br>627<br>628 | Massimiliano Mancini, Elisa Ricci, Barbara Caputo, and Samuel Rota Bulo. Adding new tasks to a single network with weight transformations using binary masks. In <i>Proceedings of the European Conference on Computer Vision (ECCV) Workshops</i> , pp. 0–0, 2018.                                  |
| 629<br>630<br>631<br>632 | Brendan McMahan, Eider Moore, Daniel Ramage, Seth Hampson, and Blaise Aguera y Arcas.<br>Communication-efficient learning of deep networks from decentralized data. In <i>Artificial Intelligence and Statistics</i> , pp. 1273–1282. PMLR, 2017.                                                    |
| 633<br>634<br>635        | Alex Nichol, Prafulla Dhariwal, Aditya Ramesh, Pranav Shyam, Pamela Mishkin, Bob McGrew, Ilya Sutskever, and Mark Chen. Glide: Towards photorealistic image generation and editing with text-guided diffusion models. <i>arXiv preprint arXiv:2112.10741</i> , 2021.                                 |
| 636<br>637<br>638        | Chao Pan, Jin Sima, Saurav Prakash, Vishal Rana, and Olgica Milenkovic. Machine unlearning of federated clusters. <i>arXiv preprint arXiv:2210.16424</i> , 2022.                                                                                                                                     |
| 639<br>640<br>641        | Konpat Preechakul, Nattanat Chatthee, Suttisak Wizadwongsa, and Supasorn Suwajanakorn. Dif-<br>fusion autoencoders: Toward a meaningful and decodable representation. In <i>Proceedings of the</i><br><i>IEEE/CVF Conference on Computer Vision and Pattern Recognition</i> , pp. 10619–10629, 2022. |
| 642<br>643<br>644<br>645 | Robin Rombach, Andreas Blattmann, Dominik Lorenz, Patrick Esser, and Björn Ommer. High-<br>resolution image synthesis with latent diffusion models. In <i>Proceedings of the IEEE/CVF Confer-</i><br><i>ence on Computer Vision and Pattern Recognition</i> , pp. 10684–10695, 2022.                 |
| 646<br>647               | Chitwan Saharia, William Chan, Huiwen Chang, Chris Lee, Jonathan Ho, Tim Salimans, David Fleet, and Mohammad Norouzi. Palette: Image-to-image diffusion models. In ACM SIGGRAPH 2022 Conference Proceedings, pp. 1–10, 2022a.                                                                        |

- 648 Chitwan Saharia, William Chan, Saurabh Saxena, Lala Li, Jay Whang, Emily L Denton, Kamyar 649 Ghasemipour, Raphael Gontijo Lopes, Burcu Karagol Ayan, Tim Salimans, et al. Photorealistic 650 text-to-image diffusion models with deep language understanding. Advances in Neural Information 651 Processing Systems, 35:36479–36494, 2022b. 652 Christoph Schuhmann, Romain Beaumont, Richard Vencu, Cade Gordon, Ross Wightman, Mehdi 653 Cherti, Theo Coombes, Aarush Katta, Clayton Mullis, Mitchell Wortsman, et al. Laion-5b: An 654 open large-scale dataset for training next generation image-text models. Advances in Neural 655 Information Processing Systems, 35:25278–25294, 2022. 656 Jascha Sohl-Dickstein, Eric Weiss, Niru Maheswaranathan, and Surya Ganguli. Deep unsupervised 657 learning using nonequilibrium thermodynamics. In International Conference on Machine Learning, 658 pp. 2256–2265. PMLR, 2015. 659 660 Jiaming Song, Chenlin Meng, and Stefano Ermon. Denoising diffusion implicit models. arXiv preprint arXiv:2010.02502, 2020. 661 662 Shangchao Su, Mingzhao Yang, Bin Li, and Xiangyang Xue. Cross-domain federated adaptive 663 prompt tuning for clip. arXiv preprint arXiv:2211.07864, 2022a. 664 Shangchao Su, Bin Li, and Xiangyang Xue. One-shot federated learning without server-side training. 665 Neural Networks, 164:203-215, 2023. 666 667 Xuan Su, Jiaming Song, Chenlin Meng, and Stefano Ermon. Dual diffusion implicit bridges for imageto-image translation. In The Eleventh International Conference on Learning Representations, 668 2022b. 669 670 MTCAJ Thomas and A Thomas Joy. *Elements of information theory*. Wiley-Interscience, 2006. 671 Jianyu Wang, Qinghua Liu, Hao Liang, Gauri Joshi, and H Vincent Poor. Tackling the objective 672 inconsistency problem in heterogeneous federated optimization. Advances in Neural Information 673 Processing Systems 33, 2020. 674 675 Tengfei Wang, Ting Zhang, Bo Zhang, Hao Ouyang, Dong Chen, Qifeng Chen, and Fang Wen. 676 Pretraining is all you need for image-to-image translation. arXiv preprint arXiv:2205.12952, 2022. 677 Chen Wu, Sencun Zhu, and Prasenjit Mitra. Federated unlearning with knowledge distillation. arXiv 678 preprint arXiv:2201.09441, 2022. 679 Jinheng Xie, Yuexiang Li, Yawen Huang, Haozhe Liu, Wentian Zhang, Yefeng Zheng, and 680 Mike Zheng Shou. Boxdiff: Text-to-image synthesis with training-free box-constrained diffusion. 681 arXiv preprint arXiv:2307.10816, 2023. 682 683 Mingzhao Yang, Shangchao Su, Bin Li, and Xiangyang Xue. Feddeo: Description-enhanced one-shot federated learning with diffusion models. In ACM Multimedia 2024. 684 685 Mingzhao Yang, Shangchao Su, Bin Li, and Xiangyang Xue. Exploring one-shot semi-supervised 686 federated learning with pre-trained diffusion models. In Proceedings of the AAAI Conference on 687 Artificial Intelligence, volume 38, pp. 16325–16333, 2024. 688 Wei Yuan, Hongzhi Yin, Fangzhao Wu, Shijie Zhang, Tieke He, and Hao Wang. Federated unlearning 689 for on-device recommendation. In Proceedings of the sixteenth ACM international conference on 690 web search and data mining, pp. 393-401, 2023. 691 Gong Zhang, Kai Wang, Xingqian Xu, Zhangyang Wang, and Humphrey Shi. Forget-me-not: 692 Learning to forget in text-to-image diffusion models. In Proceedings of the IEEE/CVF Conference 693 on Computer Vision and Pattern Recognition, pp. 1755–1764, 2024. 694 Jie Zhang, Xiaohua Qi, and Bo Zhao. Federated generative learning with foundation models. arXiv 696 preprint arXiv:2306.16064, 2023a. 697 Lefeng Zhang, Tianqing Zhu, Haibin Zhang, Ping Xiong, and Wanlei Zhou. Fedrecovery: Differ-698 entially private machine unlearning for federated learning frameworks. IEEE Transactions on 699 Information Forensics and Security, 2023b. 700
- 701 Lvmin Zhang and Maneesh Agrawala. Adding conditional control to text-to-image diffusion models. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2302.05543*, 2023.

#### APPENDIX А

#### A.1 PROOFS

**Theorem 1** For the federated unlearning problem with the objective function as in Eq. (8), the problem setting exhibits unity with federated learning, meaning its loss function can be expressed as: M

$$\min_{\theta_g} \sum_{i=0}^{N} \mathcal{L}_i(\theta_g), where \mathcal{L}_i(\theta_g) = \sum_{s_T \sim \mathcal{N}(0,I), t \in \{0,..,T\}} \log p_{\theta_p}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_T) (p_{\theta_i}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i) - p_{\theta_g}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i)) + H(p_{\theta_p}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i)) - H(p_{\theta_i}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i))$$
(13)

Proof. For each client, the objective function of local unlearning is :

$$\min_{\theta_i} D_{KL}(p_{\theta_i}(s_t|\mathcal{C}_i)||p_{\theta_p}(s_t|\mathcal{C}_T)), \forall t \in \{0, ..., T\}$$
(14)

Considering all the clients, the global objective function is:

$$\min_{\theta_0,...,\theta_N} \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=0}^N D_{KL}(p_{\theta_i}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i) || p_{\theta_p}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_T)), \forall t \in \{0,...,T\}$$
(15)

Meanwhile, as defined in Eq. (8) the objective function of global model  $\epsilon_{\theta_g}$  is:

$$\min_{\theta_g} \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=0}^{N} D_{KL}(p_{\theta_g}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i) || p_{\theta_p}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_T)), \forall t \in \{0, ..., T\}$$
(16)

Formally, we can prove that the objective function in Eq. (16) has a lower bound, and this lower bound corresponds to the objective function in Eq. (15). Therefore, minimizing the objective function of the global model  $\epsilon_{\theta_a}$  in Eq. (8) is equivalent to minimizing the difference between this objective function and its lower bound:

$$\min_{\theta_0,...,\theta_N} \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=0}^N D_{KL}(p_{\theta_g}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i) || p_{\theta_p}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_T)) - D_{KL}(p_{\theta_i}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_i) || p_{\theta_p}(s_t | \mathcal{C}_T)), \forall t \in \{0,...,T\}$$
(17)

By expanding this expression, Theorem 1 is thus proved.

**Lemma 1** For each client i and its unlearning set  $\mathcal{D}_i$ , the objective function in Eq. (10) has an upper bound, and the upper bound is achieved when  $p_{\theta_a}(x_i)$  and  $x_i$  are independent for all  $x_i \in \mathcal{D}_i$ , for example: 

$$D_{KL}(p_{\theta_p}(x_j)||p_{\theta_g}(x_j)) \le D_{KL}(p_{\theta_p}(x_j)||\mathcal{N}(0,I)), \forall x_j \in \mathcal{D}_i$$
(18)

The proof of Lemma 1 can be found in Thomas & Joy (2006) and will not be repeated here. Based on Lemma 1 and the proof of Theorem 1, Theorem 2 can be similarly proved.

#### A.2 DATASET DETAILS

In the experimental section, we conducted quantitative and visual experiments on the two constructed datasets, Celebs and Artists. Table 3 presents the specific composition of the unlearn set and retain set for the Celebs dataset, while Table 4 shows the corresponding sets for the Artists dataset. Additionally, we have compiled the links to each image into a file, which is provided in the supplementary material. 

## A.3 IMPLEMENTATION DETAILS

In our experiments, the pre-trained DM we mainly used is *Stable-diffusion-v1.5* from the *HuggingFace* model repository, which includes a corresponding CLIP text encoder used in our method to extract the word embeddings of concepts. The Stable-diffusion-v1.5 are pre-trained on the LAION-5B dataset Schuhmann et al. (2022), covering a wide range of image distributions encountered in daily life. All experiments are conducted with four NVIDIA GeForce RTX 3090 GPUs. Regarding specific hyperparameters, the weight  $\beta$  in the loss function is set to 1. The relevant hyperparameters for the diffusion generation process are set to their default values. The number of inference steps is 50, and the guidance scale of the generation is 3.

|             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Celebrity                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|-------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|             | Kate Upton'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 'Chris Hemsworth'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Bette Midler'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 'David Bowie'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 'John Oliver'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|             | 'Justin Timberlake'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 'Aretha Franklin'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Elvis Presley'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 'Andy Samberg'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Elon Musk'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |  |
|             | 'Judy Garland'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 'Avril Lavigne'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 'Nicole Kidman'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 'George Bush'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 'Matt Damon'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
|             | 'Amy Poehler'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | 'George Clooney'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 'Paul Mccartney'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 'Clint Eastwood'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 'Ed Sheeran'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
|             | 'Idris Elba'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 'Bruce Lee'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 'Dwayne Johnson'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 'Amy Winehouse'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 'Dakota Johnson                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
| Unlearn Set | Amy Schumer'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 'Megan Fox'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 'Ryan Gosling'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 'Anne Hathaway'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 'Margot Robbi                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|             | 'Theresa May'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | 'Anna Kendrick'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 'Ben Stiller'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Donald Trump'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Anna Faris'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
|             | 'Jennifer Lopez'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | 'Michael Cera'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | 'Bob Marley'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 'Matthew Mcconaughey                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|             | 'Michael Ealy'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 'Drake'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | 'Amy Adams'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 'Jensen Ackles'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 'Barry Manilow                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|             | 'Aziz Ansari'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 'Countess Vaughn'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | 'Mel Gibson'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | 'Johnny Depp'<br>'Meryl Streep'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 'Tom Hiddleston                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|             | Robert De Niro'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 'Ben Affleck'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Mariah Carey'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Hillary Clintor                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |  |
|             | 'Pierce Brosnan'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | 'Joe Biden'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 'John Lennon'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Emma Stone'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 'Kristen Stewar                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|             | 'Leonardo Dicaprio'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 'Andrew Garfield'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Angelina Jolie'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 'Bruce Willis'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Bill Clinton'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|             | 'Ronald Reagan'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | 'Tom Hanks'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 'Cameron Diaz'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 'Morgan Freeman'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 'Jackie Chan'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
| Retain Set  | 'Rihanna'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | 'Gal Gadot'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 'Courteney Cox'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 'Milla Jovovich'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 'Jennifer Anisto                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |  |
|             | 'Hugh Jackman'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 'Anjelica Huston'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Keanu Reeves'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 'Gwyneth Paltrow'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 'Justin Bieber'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|             | 'Patrick Stewart'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | 'Melania Trump'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 'Aaron Paul'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 'Amber Heard'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 'Amanda Seyfrie                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|             | 'Tom Cruise'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 'Arnold Schwarzenegger                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 'Benicio Del Toro'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | 'Octavia Spence                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|             | 'Bob Dylan'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 'Kim Jong Un'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | 'Jared Leto'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 'Adriana Lima'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Chris Evans'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|             | 'Kate Winslet'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | '.ipynb_checkpoints'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 'Adam Driver'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 'Jennifer Lawrence'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | 'Lana Del Rey                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|             | Table 3: The comp                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Hendrick Avercamp                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Artist<br>John Constable                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Stuart Davis                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Jean-Michel Basquia                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |  |
|             | Paolo Uccello                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Artemisia Gentileschi                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | John Crome                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Edward Hopper                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | David Alfaro Siqueiro                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |  |
|             | Piero della Francesca                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Frans Hals                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Théodore Géricault                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Maria Sibylla Merian                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Norman Rockwell                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|             | Carlo Crivelli                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Gian Lorenzo Bernini                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | John Martin                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | William Henry Hunt                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Will Barnet                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |  |
|             | Sandro Botticelli                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Jacob Jordaens                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Richard Parkes Bonington                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | John James Audubon                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Philip Guston                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|             | Leonardo da Vinci                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Pieter Claesz                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Thomas Cole                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Marianne North<br>Harriet Backer                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Gerard Sekoto                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|             | Filippino Lippi<br>Sebastiano del Piombo                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Francisco de Zurbaran<br>Jusepe de Ribera                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | James Tissot<br>Eugène Girardet                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Archibald Thorburn                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | George Pemba<br>Romare Bearden                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|             | Alessandro Allori                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Giovanni Battista Gaulli                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | James Ensor                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | George Caleb Bingham                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Jean Arp                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |  |
|             | Jacopo Bassano                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Rosalba Carriera                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Rudolf Ernst                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Paul Gauguin                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Jackson Pollock                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|             | Sofonisba Anguissola                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | William Hogarth                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Kees van Dongen                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Natalia Goncharova                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Franz Kline                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |  |
|             | Lavinia Fontana                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Thomas Gainsborough                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Henri Matisse                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Raoul Dufy                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Norman Bluhm                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
|             | Giuseppe Arcimboldo                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Pompeo Batoni                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Frederic Edwin Church                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | David Burliuk                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Stanisław Szukalski                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |  |
|             | Orazio Gentileschi<br>Robert Campin                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Bernardo Bellotto<br>Joshua Reynolds                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Aaron Siskind<br>Martin Johnson Heade                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Marc Chagall<br>Maurice Prendergast                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Rene Magritte<br>Yves Tanguy                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
| Unlearn Set | Jean Fouquet                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Hubert Robert                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | George Catlin                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Boris Kustodiev                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Eileen Agar                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |  |
|             | Gerard David                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Thomas Lawrence                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Charles-Francois Daubigny                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Lyonel Feininger                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Georges Braque                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|             | Hieronymus Bosch                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Francisco Goya                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Henri Fantin-Latour                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Frida Kahlo                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Paul Delvaux                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
|             | Lucas Cranach the Elder                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Franz Xaver Winterhalter                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Jules Breton                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Johannes Itten                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Arshile Gorky                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|             | Matthias Grünewald                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Jacques-Louis David                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Eastman Johnson                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Diego Rivera                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Lorser Feitelson                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |  |
|             | Hans Holbein the Younger                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Camille Corot                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Ivan Shishkin                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Tarsila do Amaral                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Remedios Varo                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|             | Hans Baldung<br>Pieter Bruegel the Elder                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Nikolai Ge<br>Albrecht Anker                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Edgar Degas<br>Claude Monet                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Constantin Brancusi<br>Fernand Leger                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Hans Bellmer<br>Joseph Cornell                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|             | Pieter Brueghel the Younger                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Jules Bastien-Lepage                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Vincent van Gogh                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Fernando Botero                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Marcel Duchamp                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|             | M.C. Escher                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Luke Fildes                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Giovanni Boldini                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Candido Portinari                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Octavio Ocampo                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|             | Louis Comfort Tiffany                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Beauford Delaney                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Alfred Sisley                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Andre Derain                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Graham Sutherland                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|             | Magnus Enckell                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | George Stubbs                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Mary Cassatt                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Adolph Gottlieb                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Michael Sowa                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
|             | Annibale Carracci                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Henry Fuseli                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Odilon Redon                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Mary Fedden                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Louise Bourgeois                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |  |
|             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | J.M.W. Turner                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Rockwell Kent                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Victor Brauner                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Jacek Yerka                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Caspar David Friedrich                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | George Bellows                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Andy Warhol                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Caspar David Friedrich                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | George Bellows                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendricks                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick:<br>Jeff Koons                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick:<br>Jeff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |  |
|             | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick:<br>Jeff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
| Patain Sot  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig                                                                                                                                                                                                              | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick:<br>Jaff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |  |
| Retain Set  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck<br>Emily Carr                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig<br>Charles Angrand                                                                                                                                                                                           | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet<br>George Luks                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn<br>Ernst Wilhelm Nay                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick:<br>Jeff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell<br>El Anatsui                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
| Retain Set  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck<br>Emily Carr<br>Koloman Moser<br>André Lhote                                                                                                                                                                                        | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig<br>Charles Angrand<br>Giacomo Balla<br>Marsden Hartley                                                                                                                                                       | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet<br>George Luks<br>Mary Jane Ansell<br>Thomas Kinkade                                                                                                                                                                  | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn<br>Ernst Wilhelm Nay<br>Hans Hartung<br>Keith Haring                                                                                                                                                                        | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick:<br>Jaff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell<br>El Anatsui<br>Takashi Murakami<br>Romero Britto                                                                                                                                                                           |  |
| Retain Set  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck<br>Emily Carr<br>Koloman Moser<br>André Lhote<br>Thomas Hart Benton                                                                                                                                                                  | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig<br>Charles Angrand<br>Giacomo Balla<br>Marsden Hartley<br>Gino Severini                                                                                                                                      | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet<br>George Luks<br>Mary Jane Ansell<br>Thomas Kinkade<br>Richard Lindner                                                                                                                                               | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn<br>Ernst Wihelm Nay<br>Hans Hartung<br>Keith Haring<br>György Kepes                                                                                                                                                         | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick:<br>Jeff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell<br>El Anatsui<br>Takashi Murakami<br>Romero Britto<br>Robert Williams                                                                                                                                                        |  |
| Retain Set  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck<br>Emily Carr<br>Koloman Moser<br>André Lhote<br>Thomas Hart Benton<br>William Blake                                                                                                                                                 | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig<br>Charles Angrand<br>Giacomo Balla<br>Marsden Hartley<br>Gino Severini<br>Arthur Dove                                                                                                                       | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet<br>George Luks<br>Mary Jane Ansell<br>Thomas Kinkade<br>Richard Lindner<br>Walter Crane                                                                                                                               | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulheld<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn<br>Ernst Wilhelm Nay<br>Hans Hartung<br>Keith Haring<br>György Kepes<br>Nan Goldin                                                                                                                                           | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick<br>Jeff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell<br>El Anatsui<br>Takashi Murakami<br>Romero Britto<br>Robert Williams<br>Mark Ryden                                                                                                                                           |  |
| Retain Set  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck<br>Emily Carr<br>Koloman Moser<br>André Lhote<br>Thomas Hart Benton<br>William Blake<br>Arnold Böcklin                                                                                                                               | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig<br>Charles Angrand<br>Giacomo Balla<br>Marsden Hartley<br>Gino Severini<br>Arthur Dove<br>Josef Capek                                                                                                        | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet<br>George Luks<br>Mary Jane Ansell<br>Thomas Kinkade<br>Richard Lindner<br>Walter Crane<br>Richard Eurich                                                                                                             | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn<br>Ernst Wilhelm Nay<br>Hans Hartung<br>Keith Haring<br>György Kepes<br>Nan Goldin<br>Judy Chicago                                                                                                                          | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick<br>Jaffe Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell<br>El Anatsui<br>Takashi Murakami<br>Romero Britto<br>Robert Williams<br>Mark Ryden<br>Simon Stalenhag                                                                                                                       |  |
| Retain Set  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck<br>Emily Carr<br>Koloman Moser<br>André Lhote<br>Thomas Hart Benton<br>William Blake                                                                                                                                                 | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig<br>Charles Angrand<br>Giacomo Balla<br>Marsden Hartley<br>Gino Severini<br>Arthur Dove                                                                                                                       | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet<br>George Luks<br>Mary Jane Ansell<br>Thomas Kinkade<br>Richard Lindner<br>Walter Crane                                                                                                                               | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulheld<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn<br>Ernst Wilhelm Nay<br>Hans Hartung<br>Keith Haring<br>György Kepes<br>Nan Goldin                                                                                                                                           | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick<br>Jeff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell<br>El Anatsui<br>Takashi Murakami<br>Romero Britto<br>Robert Williams<br>Mark Ryden<br>Simon Stalenhag<br>Kent Monkman                                                                                                        |  |
| Retain Set  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck<br>Emily Carr<br>Koloman Moser<br>André Lhote<br>Thomas Hart Benton<br>William Blake<br>Arnold Böcklin<br>Pierre Puvis de Chavannes<br>Gustav Klimt<br>Fernand Khnopff                                                               | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig<br>Charles Angrand<br>Giacomo Balla<br>Marsden Hartley<br>Gino Severini<br>Arthur Dove<br>Josef Capek<br>Lyubov Popova<br>Willi Baumeister<br>Josef Albers                                                   | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet<br>George Luks<br>Mary Jane Ansell<br>Thomas Kinkade<br>Richard Lindner<br>Walter Crane<br>Richard Eurich<br>Jasper Johns<br>Sam Gilliam                                                                              | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn<br>Ernst Wilhelm Nay<br>Hans Hartung<br>Keith Haring<br>György Kepes<br>Nan Goldin<br>Judy Chicago<br>Howard Finster<br>Yaacov Agam<br>Georg Baselitz                                                                       | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendricks<br>Jeff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell<br>El Anatsui<br>Takashi Murakami<br>Robert Williams<br>Mark Ryden<br>Simon Stalenhag<br>Kent Monkman<br>Njideka Akunyili Cros<br>Hasui Kawase                                                                               |  |
| Retain Set  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck<br>Emily Carr<br>Koloman Moser<br>André Lhote<br>Thomas Hart Benton<br>William Blake<br>Arnold Böcklin<br>Pierre Puvis de Chavannes<br>Gustav Klimt<br>Fernand Khnopff<br>Carlos Schwabe                                             | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Evind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig<br>Charles Angrand<br>Giacomo Balla<br>Marsden Hartley<br>Gino Severini<br>Arthur Dove<br>Josef Capek<br>Lyubov Popova<br>Willi Baumeister<br>Josef Albers<br>Albert Gleizes                                  | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet<br>George Luks<br>Mary Jane Ansell<br>Thomas Kinkade<br>Richard Lindner<br>Walter Crane<br>Richard Lindner<br>Mare Johns<br>Sam Gilliam<br>Willem de Kooning<br>Albert Bierstadt                                      | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn<br>Ernst Wilhelm Nay<br>Hans Hartung<br>Keith Haring<br>György Kepes<br>Nan Goldin<br>Judy Chicago<br>Howard Finster<br>Yaacov Agam<br>Georg Baselitz<br>Adrian Ghenie                                                      | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick:<br>Jeff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell<br>El Anatsui<br>Takashi Murakami<br>Romero Britto<br>Robert Williams<br>Mark Ryden<br>Simon Stalenhag<br>Kent Monkman<br>Njideka Akunyili Cros<br>Hasui Kawase<br>Hiroshi Yoshida                                           |  |
| Retain Set  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck<br>Emily Carr<br>Koloman Moser<br>André Lhote<br>Thomas Hart Benton<br>William Blake<br>Arnold Böcklin<br>Pierre Puvis de Chavannes<br>Gustav Klimt<br>Fernand Khnopff<br>Carlos Schwabe<br>Maxfield Parrish                         | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig<br>Charles Angrand<br>Giacomo Balla<br>Marsden Hartley<br>Gino Severini<br>Arthur Dove<br>Josef Capek<br>Lyubov Popova<br>Willi Baumeister<br>Josef Albers<br>Albert Gleizes<br>Anni Albers                  | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet<br>George Luks<br>Mary Jane Ansell<br>Thomas Kinkade<br>Richard Lindner<br>Walter Crane<br>Richard Lindner<br>Willem de Kooning<br>Albert Bierstadt<br>Sam Francis                                                    | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulheld<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn<br>Ernst Wilhelm Nay<br>Hans Hartung<br>Keith Haring<br>György Kepes<br>Nan Goldin<br>Judy Chicago<br>Howard Finster<br>Yaacov Agam<br>Georg Baselitz<br>Adrian Ghenie<br>Eric Fischl | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick:<br>Jeff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell<br>El Anatsui<br>Takashi Murakami<br>Romero Britto<br>Robert Williams<br>Mark Ryden<br>Simon Stalenhag<br>Kent Monkman<br>Njideka Akunyili Cros<br>Hasui Kawase<br>Hiroshi Yoshida<br>Kitagawa Utamaro                       |  |
| Retain Set  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck<br>Emily Carr<br>Koloman Moser<br>André Lhote<br>Thomas Hart Benton<br>William Blake<br>Arnold Böcklin<br>Pierre Puvis de Chavannes<br>Gustav Klimt<br>Fernand Khnopff<br>Carlos Schwabe<br>Maxfield Parrish<br>Roger de La Fresnaye | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig<br>Charles Angrand<br>Giacomo Balla<br>Marsden Hartley<br>Gino Severini<br>Arthur Dove<br>Josef Capek<br>Lyubov Popova<br>Willi Baumeister<br>Josef Albers<br>Albert Gleizes<br>Anni Albers<br>Ben Nicholson | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet<br>George Luks<br>Mary Jane Ansell<br>Thomas Kinkade<br>Richard Lindner<br>Walter Crane<br>Richard Eurich<br>Jasper Johns<br>Sam Gilliam<br>Willem de Kooning<br>Albert Bierstadt<br>Sam Francis<br>Richard Diebenkom | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulfield<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn<br>Ernst Wilhelm Nay<br>Hans Hartung<br>Keith Haring<br>György Kepes<br>Nan Goldin<br>Judy Chicago<br>Howard Finster<br>Yaacov Agam<br>Georg Baselitz<br>Adrian Ghenie<br>Eric Fischl<br>Martin Kippenberger                | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendrick:<br>Jeff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell<br>El Anatsui<br>Takashi Murakami<br>Romero Britto<br>Robert Williams<br>Mark Ryden<br>Simon Stalenhag<br>Kent Monkman<br>Njideka Akunyili Cros<br>Hasui Kawase<br>Hiroshi Yoshida<br>Kitagawa Utamaro<br>Katsushika Hokusai |  |
| Retain Set  | Adam Elsheimer<br>Jan Brueghel the Elder<br>Georges Seurat<br>Paul Ranson<br>Ferdinand Hodler<br>Maximilien Luce<br>Albert Marquet<br>Cuno Amiet<br>Alexandre Benois<br>Jacek Malczewski<br>Piet Mondrian<br>Augustus John<br>Theo van Rysselberghe<br>Wassily Kandinsky<br>Henri-Edmond Cross<br>Umberto Boccioni<br>Maurice de Vlaminck<br>Emily Carr<br>Koloman Moser<br>André Lhote<br>Thomas Hart Benton<br>William Blake<br>Arnold Böcklin<br>Pierre Puvis de Chavannes<br>Gustav Klimt<br>Fernand Khnopff<br>Carlos Schwabe<br>Maxfield Parrish                         | Caspar David Friedrich<br>Lawren Harris<br>Giorgio de Chirico<br>George Inness<br>Ralph Blakelock<br>Granville Redmond<br>Gustave Caillebotte<br>Albert Dubois-Pillet<br>Paul Signac<br>Carl Larsson<br>Tsuguharu Foujita<br>Eric Ravilious<br>Charles Blackman<br>Eyvind Earle<br>Alex Colville<br>Peter Doig<br>Charles Angrand<br>Giacomo Balla<br>Marsden Hartley<br>Gino Severini<br>Arthur Dove<br>Josef Capek<br>Lyubov Popova<br>Willi Baumeister<br>Josef Albers<br>Albert Gleizes<br>Anni Albers                  | George Bellows<br>Sonia Delaunay<br>Odd Nerdrum<br>Ernst Ludwig Kirchner<br>Henry Darger<br>Gustave Buchet<br>Otto Dix<br>Aaron Douglas<br>Eugène Grasset<br>Aubrey Beardsley<br>Ivan Bilibin<br>Beatrix Potter<br>John Bauer<br>Anne Brigman<br>Boris Grigoriev<br>Jean Dubuffet<br>George Luks<br>Mary Jane Ansell<br>Thomas Kinkade<br>Richard Lindner<br>Walter Crane<br>Richard Lindner<br>Willem de Kooning<br>Albert Bierstadt<br>Sam Francis                                                    | Andy Warhol<br>John Chamberlain<br>Lee Bontecou<br>Dan Flavin<br>Donald Judd<br>John Hoyland<br>Juan Gris<br>Karl Knaths<br>Patrick Caulheld<br>Ellsworth Kelly<br>Patrick Heron<br>Raoul De Keyser<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Indiana<br>Howardena Pindell<br>Robert Delaunay<br>Asger Jorn<br>Ernst Wilhelm Nay<br>Hans Hartung<br>Keith Haring<br>György Kepes<br>Nan Goldin<br>Judy Chicago<br>Howard Finster<br>Yaacov Agam<br>Georg Baselitz<br>Adrian Ghenie<br>Eric Fischl | Jacek Yerka<br>Henri de Toulouse-Laut<br>Wayne Thiebaud<br>Julio Le Parc<br>Lucio Fontana<br>Peter Max<br>Richard Hamilton<br>Peter Blake<br>Takato Yamamoto<br>Barkley L. Hendricks<br>Jeff Koons<br>Yves Klein<br>Mimmo Rotella<br>James Lee Byars<br>Felix Gonzalez-Torre<br>Olafur Eliasson<br>James Turrell<br>El Anatsui<br>Takashi Murakami<br>Romero Britto<br>Robert Williams<br>Mark Ryden<br>Simon Stalenhag<br>Kent Monkman<br>Njideka Akunyili Cros<br>Hasui Kawase<br>Hiroshi Yoshida<br>Kitagawa Utamaro                       |  |

808 809

Table 4: The composition of the unlearn set and retain set for the Artists dataset.