# 542 Appendix

## 543 A Ethics Statement

All questions of MATH-V are from publicly available sources. Although we do not commercialize MATH-V, we should like to demonstrate that we are far from the boundary for action or infringement.

Legal compliance. MATH-V problems are created by the the Mathematical Association of America
(MAA), Kangaroo of Mathematics in Austria (KMA) and United Kingdom Maths Trust (UKMT). For
decades, the MAA has not protected its problem IP even from separate organizations which sell MAA
problems, such as AoPS. Courts have ruled that this implies the IP rights are permanently forfeited.
Both of the KMA and UKMT are leading charities that advances the education of young people in
mathematics, and MATH-V only contains free test questions published on their official website.

For MATH-V, we abide by Fair Use §107: "the fair use of a copyrighted work, including such use by scholarship, or research, is not an infringement of copyright", where fair use is determined by "the purpose and character of the use, including whether such use is of a commercial nature or is for nonprofit educational purposes" and "the effect of the use upon the potential market for or value of the copyrighted work."

**Dataset intended usage and license.** We document the MATH-V dataset within the paper and note that the MATH-V and code for results reproduction will be publicly available. The MATH-V dataset is not supposed, though the risk exists, to be used to train models for cheating. We intend for researchers to use this dataset to better evaluate LMMs' mathematical reasoning capabilities and consequently facilitate future studies in this area. We bear all responsibility in case of violation of rights. The MATH-V data and our open-source code are under an MIT license.

Statistic	Number
Total questions	3,040
- multiple-choice questions	1,532 (50.4%)
- Free-form questions	1,508 (49.6%)
- Questions in testmini	304 (10.0%)
Multiple-choice questions	1,532
- Proportion of answers A	299(19.5%)
- Proportion of answers B	311(20.3%)
- Proportion of answers C	320(20.9%)
- Proportion of answers D	326(21.2%)
- Proportion of answers E	278(18.1%)
Unique number of images	3,472
Unique number of answers	370
Levels	5
Subjects	16
Source competitions	19
- Math Kangaroo	1,499
- UK (Grey,Pink,Junior,)	535
- AMC (8,10,12), AIME	759
Maximum question length	280
Minimum question length	5
Average question length	42.3

# 563 **B** Dataset Statistics



Table 4: Key statistics of MATH-V. The unit of question length is words.

Figure 6: Levels, subjects and sources distribution of MATH-V.

# 564 C More Results on Text-only LLMs

Model	Overall	Alg	AnaG	Ari	CombG	Comb	Cnt	DescG	GrphT	Log	Angle	Area	Len	SolG	Stat	Торо	TransG
LLMs (Text + Image Caption)																	
ChatGPT-3.5 (CoT)	9.74	10.7	20.0	18.6	10.1	7.7	17.9	16.4	10.0	13.5	6.4	5.8	6.5	9.4	12.1	4.4	10.7
GPT-4 (CoT)	13.10	16.5	20.2	34.3	10.4	17.9	19.4	7.7	11.1	10.1	9.8	9.6	9.1	13.5	13.8	8.7	12.5
MathCoder-7B	6.6	4.9	15.5	12.1	9.1	6.0	7.5	11.5	5.6	7.6	2.3	4.0	4.9	5.3	8.6	13.0	11.3
WizardMath-7B	4.5	3.5	7.1	5.0	8.4	0.6	10.5	10.5	4.4	5.0	1.7	3.6	2.7	4.5	3.5	13.0	5.4
MAmmoTH-7B-Mistral	12.4	11.6	16.7	15.7	11.4	10.1	11.9	14.4	14.4	8.4	8.7	12.8	11.4	11.5	19.0	21.7	16.6

Table 5: Performance of text-only LLMs with image captions.

# 565 D Data Contamination

<sup>566</sup> We have also considered the issue of data contamination:

Firstly, we primarily collect questions from the official websites of various competitions. Each file typically contains 15 to 30 questions and is kept separate from the answers or solutions. Given the concerns surrounding data contamination in large language models (LLMs), we prioritize selecting questions that do not have readily available answers, such as those found on separate documents or pages.

Secondly, the three main series of closed-source models, GPT-4, Gemini, and Claude, all evaluate their models using several contests in their technical reports, including the AMC, which is a primary source of our problems. Therefore, we assume that these models adhere to the common practice of not using leaked data for training. However, as these are closed-source models, this assumption is our best estimation.

Thirdly, among open-source models, the most widely used base model is LLaVA, which utilizes a subset of the CC-3M dataset for pretraining and LAION/CC/SBU BLIP captions for instruction

tuning. We compared our dataset with the training dataset and found no overlap between the two.

## 580 E Testmini

In this section, we show the effectiveness of the testmini subset in mirroring the performance trends 581 observed in the full test set across a diverse range of mathematical subjects. The detailed results 582 are presented in Table 6. We find that the model performances, when evaluated on both the entire 583 set and testmini, exhibit close parallelism in trend. For instance, the performance delta between the 584 full test set and testmini for the Qwen-VL-Plus model is a mere 0.19%, indicating a high degree of 585 similarity in model behavior across the two datasets. Similarly, the GPT4V model also exhibits a 586 negligible performance difference of -0.39%, further corroborating the testmini subset's capability 587 to accurately reflect the full test set's characteristics. Furthermore, even for LLaVA-v1.5-13B and 588 Share-GPT4V-7B, two models with the largest performance variations, where differences of 1.98% 589 and 1.97% are observed respectively, the deviation remains within 2%, underscoring the testmini 590 subset's reliability for performance evaluation. These findings suggest that models' performance on 591 the testmini subset should be indicative of their performance on the full test set, thereby providing a 592 reliable means for preliminary evaluation and comparison of models across various mathematical 593 subjects. 594

#### 595 F Evaluation Details

<sup>596</sup> We conduct all experiments on A100 80G GPUs.

#### 597 F.1 Prompts for Response Generation

In this section, we present details of the prompts used for the evaluation of response generation models. The prompts are designed to ensure that the models generate responses that are consistent

Model	Overall	Alg	AnaG	Ari	CombG	Comb	Cnt	DescG	GrphT	Log	Angle	Area	Len	SolG	Stat	Торо	TransG
Random Chance	5.86	2.0	11.9	4.3	9.4	3.0	1.5	9.6	1.1	5.9	0.6	7.0	7.6	5.7	3.5	8.7	8.3
Testmini A	7.57	5.3	31.6	10.5	15.8	0.0	0.0	5.3	5.3	5.3	5.3	5.3	10.5	10.5	0.0	5.3	5.3
LLMs (Text Only)																	
GPT-4 (CoT)	8.16	12.8	10.7	15.7	4.9	10.7	10.5	1.9	5.6	8.4	8.1	6.2	8.7	8.6	3.5	4.4	4.8
Testmini	6.58	5.3	10.5	15.8	0.0	21.1	10.5	5.3	0.0	5.3	10.5	5.3	0.0	5.3	5.3	5.3	0.0
Δ	-1.58	-7.5	-0.2	+0.1	-4.9	+10.4	0.0	+3.4	-5.6	-3.1	+2.4	-0.9	-8.7	-3.3	+1.8	+0.9	-4.8
LLMs (Text + Image Caption)																	
ChatGP1-3.5 (Co1) Testmini	9.74	10.7	20.0	5.3	0.0	10.5	21.1	15.4	10.0	13.5	6.4 10.5	5.8	6.5 5.3	9.4 21.1	5.3	4.4	5.3
Δ	+0.46	-0.2	+6.3	-13.3	-10.1	+2.8	+3.2	-0.6	+0.5	-13.5	+4.1	-5.8	-1.2	+11.7	-6.8	+6.1	-5.4
GPT-4 (CoT)	13.10	16.5	20.2	34.3	10.4	17.9	19.4	7.7	11.1	10.1	9.8	9.6	9.1	13.5	13.8	8.7	12.5
Testmini	12.50	15.8	10.5	31.6	5.3	15.8	31.6	10.5	15.8	15.8	0.0	5.3	5.3	0.0	21.1	10.5	5.3
Δ	-0.6	-0.7	-9.7	-2.7	-5.1	-2.1	+12.2	+2.8	+4.7	+5.7	-9.8	-4.3	-3.8	-13.5	+7.3	+1.8	-7.2
LL aVA w1 5 7P	0.52	1 70	7.1	10.7	71	4 0	10.5	(Text + II	10.0	0.2	15.6	10.2	0.8	5.2	06	4.4	1.9
Testmini	10.20	0.0	10.5	15.8	5.3	5.3	15.8	10.5	10.0	15.8	21.1	15.8	15.8	5.3	10.5	0.0	5.3
$\Delta$	+1.68	-7.0	+3.4	+5.1	-1.8	+0.5	+5.3	+2.8	+0.5	+6.6	+5.5	+5.6	+6.0	0.0	+1.9	-4.4	+0.5
SPHINX (V2)	9.70	6.7	7.1	12.9	7.5	7.7	6.0	9.6	16.7	10.1	11.0	11.8	12.5	8.2	8.6	8.7	6.0
Testmini	9.21	5.3	10.5	10.5	0.0	21.1	10.5	10.5	15.8	10.5	15.8	5.3	10.5	0.0	5.3	5.3	10.5
Show CDT4V 7D	10.52	-1.4	2.6	12.0	10.1	4.0	74.5	11.5	14.4	10.0	16.0	11.0	12.0	-0.2	15.5	17.4	11.2
ShareGP14V-/B Testmini	10.53	5.5	3.6 0.0	12.9	21.1	4.8	7.5 5.3	26.3	14.4	10.9	15.8	11.8	21.1	9.8 15.8	15.5	17.4	5.3
Δ	+1.97	-0.2	-3.6	-2.4	+11.0	+0.5	-2.2	+14.8	+1.4	+4.9	-0.4	-1.3	+8.8	+6.0	+0.3	-6.9	-6.0
LLaVA-v1.5-13B	11.12	7.0	14.3	14.3	9.1	6.6	6.0	13.5	5.6	13.5	10.4	12.6	14.7	11.5	13.8	13.0	10.7
Testmini	13.10	10.4	5.3	15.8	5.3	10.5	10.5	26.3	5.3	15.8	5.3	15.8	31.6	10.5	15.8	15.8	10.5
Δ	+1.98	+3.4	-9.0	+1.5	-3.8	+3.9	+4.5	+12.8	-0.3	+2.3	-5.1	+3.2	+16.9	-1.0	+2.0	+2.8	-0.2
ShareGPT4V-13B	11.88	7.5	15.5	16.4	10.7	8.9	9.0	11.5	8.9	7.6	11.6	13.0	17.4	10.3	8.6	8.7	12.5
Δ	+1.61	+8.3	+5.6	-5.9	-5.4	+6.9	+1.5	+4.3	+1.6	+8.2	-6.3	-2.5	+19.4	+10.8	-3.3	+1.8	-7.2
SPHINX-MoE	14.18	7.8	17.9	14.3	15.6	9.5	11.9	12.5	15.6	12.6	16.2	15.6	17.8	13.5	12.1	8.7	16.1
Testmini	13.49	10.5	15.8	15.8	15.8	10.5	10.5	10.5	15.8	10.5	15.8	15.8	15.8	15.8	10.5	10.5	15.8
Δ	-0.69	+2.7	-2.1	+1.5	+0.2	+1.0	-1.4	-2.0	+0.2	-2.1	-0.4	+0.2	-2.0	+2.3	-1.6	+1.8	-0.3
InternLM-XComposer2-VL	14.54	9.3	15.5	12.1	15.3	11.3	10.5	14.4	22.2	19.3	19.7	15.6	15.0	11.9	15.5	26.1	15.5
A lestmini	+1.25	+1.2	+0.3	-1.6	+0.5	-0.8	10.5	+1.4	-1.1	21.1 +1.8	21.1 +1.4	15.8	15.8 +0.8	-1.4	+0.3	26.3 +0.2	+0.3
InternVI_Chat_V1_2_Plus	16.97	1113	25.0	15.7	16.9	10.1	11.0	16.4	15.6	10.3	22.5	16.4	22.5	14.3	17.2	4.4	20.8
Testmini	18.42	21.1	26.3	10.5	21.1	5.3	10.5	10.4	15.8	10.5	31.6	31.6	26.3	10.5	36.8	5.3	21.1
Δ	+1.45	+9.8	+1.3	-5.2	+4.2	-4.9	-1.4	-5.8	+0.2	-8.8	+9.0	+15.2	+3.8	-3.8	+19.6	+0.9	+0.2
					Clo	sed-sourc	e LMM	s (Text + I	mage)								
Qwen-VL-Plus	10.72	11.3	17.9	14.3	12.7	4.8	10.5	15.4	8.9	14.3	11.6	6.4	10.0	14.3	6.9	8.7	11.31
	-0.19	+15.0	-7.4	-3.8	+3.1	+5.7	+10.6	5.5 -10.1	+1.6	-3.8	-1.1	-1.1	+0.5	-3.8	5.5 -1.6	-3.4	-11.31
Owen-VI -Max	15 59	107	19.1	20.0	16.9	12.5	17.9	16.4	12.2	21.0	13.3	14.2	19.8	11.5	20.7	13.0	17.3
Testmini	16.1	10.5	21.1	21.1	15.8	15.8	15.8	15.8	10.5	21.1	10.5	15.8	21.1	10.5	21.1	15.8	15.8
Δ	+0.51	-0.2	+2.0	+1.1	-1.1	+3.3	-2.1	-0.6	-1.7	+0.1	-2.8	+1.6	+1.3	-1.0	+0.4	+2.8	-1.5
Gemini Pro	17.66	15.1	10.7	20.7	20.1	11.9	7.5	20.2	21.1	16.8	19.1	19.0	20.0	14.3	13.8	17.4	20.8
A	-0.55	15.8	10.5	21.1 ±0.4	21.1 ±1.0	10.5	5.3	21.1	21.1	15.8	21.1 ±2.0	21.1 ±2.1	21.1	15.8	15.8	15.8	21.1
Gamini 1 5 Pro	10.24	20.3	25.7	24.2	10.8	15.5	20.0	26.0	26.7	22.7	14.5	14.4	16.5	18.0	10.3	26.1	17.3
Testmini	21.05	31.6	36.8	26.3	31.6	10.5	10.5	31.6	26.3	21.1	5.3	10.5	15.8	5.3	10.5	26.3	36.8
Δ	+1.81	+11.3	+1.1	-8.0	+11.8	-5.0	-10.4	+5.6	-0.4	-1.6	-9.2	-3.9	-0.7	-13.6	+0.2	+0.2	+19.5
GPT-4V	22.76	27.3	32.1	35.7	21.1	16.7	13.4	22.1	14.4	16.8	22.0	22.2	20.9	23.8	24.1	21.7	25.6
Testmini	22.37	26.3	31.6	36.8	21.1	15.8	10.5	21.1	15.8	15.8	21.1	21.1	21.1	26.3	26.3	21.1	26.3
	-0.39	-1.0	-0.5	+1.1	0.0	-0.9	-2.9	-1.0	+1.4	-1.0	-0.9	-1.1	+0.2	+2.5	+2.2	-0.0	+0.7
GPI-40 Testmini	30.39	42.0	39.3 42.1	49.3 57 9	28.9 42.1	25.6	22.4	24.0 31.6	23.3 36.8	29.4 26.3	17.3	29.8 31.6	30.1 21.1	29.1 10.5	44.8 36.8	34.8 36.8	17.9 15.8
$\Delta$	-0.46	+0.1	+2.8	+8.6	+13.2	-4.5	-1.3	+7.6	+13.5	-3.1	-12.0	+1.8	-9.0	-18.6	-8.0	+2.0	-2.1
GPT-4turbo	30.26	37.7	33.3	46.4	25.0	28.6	25.4	15.4	26.7	31.9	30.6	29.0	31.9	29.1	37.9	17.4	23.2
Testmini	29.93	36.8	36.8	36.8	31.6	36.8	31.6	15.8	36.8	36.8	31.6	31.6	31.6	21.1	26.3	10.5	26.3
$\Delta$	-0.33	-0.9	+3.5	-9.6	+6.6	+8.2	+6.2	+0.4	+10.1	+4.9	+1.0	+2.6	-0.3	-8.0	-11.6	-6.9	+3.1

Table 6: Comparison of model performances between the entire set and testmini.

with the input question and the image. The prompts used for the evaluation of response generationmodels are shown in Table 7.

#### 602 F.2 Prompt for Caption Generation

The prompt for caption generation is as follows: *Here is a diagram of a math problem, please describe the diagram in complete detail so that your description can be used to replace the diagram for math problem-solving.* 

#### 606 F.3 Models

<sup>607</sup> We present the source of the models used in the evaluation in Table 8. The models are sourced from

<sup>608</sup> OpenAI, Google, Alibaba, and Hugging Face. The models from OpenAI, Google and Alibaba are <sup>609</sup> accessed from their respective platforms through API calls.

Model	Prompt
GPT4-CoT (Text Only)	Please solve the problem step by step and put your answer in one " $\square$ ". If it is a multiple choice question, only one letter is allowed in the " $\square$ ".
ChatGPT 3.5-CoT (Text + Image Caption )	Please first solve the problem step by step, then put your final answer or a single letter (if it is a multiple choice question) in one " $\Box$ ".
GPT4-CoT (Text + Image Caption)	Please first solve the problem step by step, then put your final answer or a single letter (if it is a multiple multiple choice question) in one " $\Box$ ".
LLaVa-v1.5-7B	Answer the question using a single word or phrase.
SPHINX (V2)	Answer the question using a single word or phrase.
ShareGPT4V-7B	Answer the question using a single word or phrase.
LLaVa-v1.5-13B	Answer the question using a single word or phrase.
ShareGPT4V-13B	Answer the question using a single word or phrase.
SPHINX-MoE	Answer the question using a single word or phrase.
InternVL-Chat-V1-2-Plus	Please solve the problem and put your answer in one "". If it is a multiple choice question, only one letter letter is allowed in the "".
InternLM-XComposer2-VL	Please solve the problem and put your answer in one " $\square$ ". If it is a multiple choice question, only one letter letter is allowed in the " $\square$ ".
InternLM-XComposer2-VL -CoT	Please solve the problem step by step and put your answer in one " $\Box$ ". If it is a multiple choice question, only one letter is allowed in the " $\Box$ ".
Qwen-VL-Plus	Answer the question using a single word or phrase.
Qwen-VL-Max	Answer the question using a single word or phrase.
Qwen-VL-Max-CoT	Please solve the problem step by step and put your answer in one " $\square$ ". If it is a multiple choice question, only one letter is allowed in the " $\square$ ".
Gemini-1.5 Pro	Answer the question using a single letter or number or word.
Gemini Pro	Answer the question using a single letter or number or word.
Gemini Pro-CoT	Please first solve the problem step by step, then put your final answer or a single letter (if it is a multiple choice question) in one " $\Box$ ".
GPT4-V/o/turbo	Please solve the problem and put your answer in one " $\Box$ ". If it is a multiple choice question, only one letter is allowed in the " $\Box$ ".
GPT4V-CoT	Please solve the problem step by step and put your answer in one " $\square$ ". If it is a multiple choice question, only one letter is allowed in the " $\square$ ".

Table 7: The prompts used in the evaluation for response generation.

Model	Source	URL
ChatGPT 3.5	gpt-3.5-turbo-0125	https://platform.openai.com/
GPT4	gpt-4-0125-preview	https://platform.openai.com/
GPT4V	gpt-4-1106-vision-preview	https://platform.openai.com/
GPT-40	gpt-4o-2024-05-13	https://platform.openai.com/
GPT-4-turbo	gpt-4-turbo-2024-04-09	https://platform.openai.com/
Gemini Pro	gemini-pro-vision	https://ai.google.dev/
Gemini-v1.5 Pro	gemini-1.5-pro	https://ai.google.dev/
InternLM-XComposer2-VL	local checkpoint	https://huggingface. co/internlm/ internlm-xcomposer2-v1-7b
InternVL-Chat-v1.2-Plus	local checkpoint	https://huggingface. co/OpenGVLab/ InternVL-Chat-V1-2-Plus
Qwen-VL-Max	qwen-vl-max	https://help.aliyun.com/zh/ dashscope/developer-reference/ vl-plus-quick-start
Qwen-VL-Plus	qwen-vl-plus	https://help.aliyun.com/zh/ dashscope/developer-reference/ vl-plus-quick-start
SPHINX-MoE	local checkpoint	https://huggingface.co/ Alpha-VLLM/LLaMA2-Accessory/ tree/main/finetune/mm/SPHINX/ SPHINX-MoE
SPHINX (V2)	local checkpoint	https://huggingface.co/ Alpha-VLLM/LLaMA2-Accessory/ tree/main/finetune/mm/SPHINX/ SPHINX-v2-1k
LLaVa-v1.5-7B	local checkpoint	https://huggingface.co/ liuhaotian/llava-v1.5-7b
LLaVa-v1.5-13B	local checkpoint	https://huggingface.co/ liuhaotian/llava-v1.5-13b
ShareGPT4V-7B	local checkpoint	https://huggingface.co/ Lin-Chen/ShareGPT4V-7B
ShareGPT4V-13B	local checkpoint	https://huggingface.co/ Lin-Chen/ShareGPT4V-13B

Table 8: The source of the models used in the evaluation.

# 610 G Comparison Details

#### 611 G.1 Comparing with MathVista

IconQA[51]	
Object Counting   106/400   What number is shown?	ounting
Perimeter Calculation 51/400 What is the perimeter of the square?	r Calculation
Length Measurement with a given refer- 150/400 Move the ruler to measure the length of	leasurement with a given refer-
ence the line to the nearest centimeter. The	
line is about _ centimeters long.	
Time Inquiry based on a clock 67/400 What time is shown?	uiry based on a clock
CLEVR-Math[52]	CL
Subtract How many objects are left? 400/400 Subtract all metallic cylinders. Subtract all gray things. How many objects at	How many objects are left?
left?	
FigureQA[53]	F
Is X the?   176/400   Is Khaki the minimum/maximum/ low	?
median/high median/smoothest/ rough	
est?	
Does X have the?86/400Does Brown have the maximum/ min	ave the?
mum area under the curve? (the high	
est/lowest value?)	
Is X Y? I17/400 Is Hot Pink less/greater than Black?	?
Does X intersect Y?   21/400   Does Slate intersect Light Salmon?	ntersect Y?
Super-CLEVEL[54]	Supe
Are there X than Y? 146/400 Are there fewer/more tiny gray cars that	X than Y?
small red sedans?	
Is the number of X than Y? 232/400 Is the number of regular buss less/greate	nber of X than Y?
than the number of brown rubber min	
Vans?	
Others 22/400 How many cyan double buss have in	
same size as the matte aeropiane?	
<b>KVQA</b> [55]	
What is the age gap between the? 310/382 What is the age gap between these tw	he age gap between the?
people in image?	
How many people in the image were 12/382 How many people in the image were	ny people in the image were
born?	
PlotQA[56]	
In how many years, is the X greater than 57/105 In how many years, is the population i	any years, is the X greater than
Y? the largest city greater than 26 %?	
what is the difference between? 31/105 What is the difference between two con	ne difference between?
Others Securive major ticks on the Y-axis?	
capacity in Rolivia per year?	

Table 9: Some source datasets of MathVista featuring similar questions. The table shows the template, proportion within the whole dataset and typical examples of them.

612 MathVista contains numerous similar questions with restricted question variability across a variety of

source datasets. After eliminating questions with identical stem text, only 4,740 questions remain.

- For instance, among the 6,141 questions in MathVista, the question "What is the age gap between
- these two people in the image?" appears 270 times. Some images of this question are shown in

Figure 7. Furthermore, there are many template questions within its collection that merely alter a few words. For instance, questions containing *"What is the age gap between"* appear 310 times. Another example is questions like *"Subtract all ... objects. How many objects are left?"*. Figure 8 illustrates this type of question involving very similar geometry recognition, which occurs 400 times. In Table 9, we present detailed statistics on similar questions.

We also provide some qualitative comparisons illustrating the different question lengths between 621 MathVista and our dataset. Figure 9 presents the 3 main types of questions featuring an abstract 622 scene in MathVista, constituting over 90% of the total questions, as discussed in Section. 1. We also 623 showcase representative questions in MathVista that involve a function plot in Figure 10, which pose 624 similar, straightforward, and concise inquiries regarding the depicted function graph. For comparison, 625 we present examples of our MATH-V on analytic geometry in Figure 11, which feature longer questions 626 627 and incorporate more complex function concepts, such as mutual symmetry and iterative functions. Moreover, Figure 12 and Figure 13 exhibit topology and graph theory-related questions in our dataset, 628

two categories absent in MathVista, which require intricate visual recognition and mathematical reasoning.



Figure 9: Three main types of questions among the 375 questions with an abstract scene in MathVista: Object Counting, Length Measurement, and Time Inquiry. Among the 200 sampled questions, the percentage of each category is in the figure. Text marked in red indicates that it belongs to a fixed template and is used in other similar questions.

630

#### 631 G.2 Comparing with MMMU

In this section, we showcase some examples of different subjects of MMMU demanding sophisticated 632 college-level domain knowledge. Figure 14, Figure 15, and Figure 16 present the subject of Graph 633 Theory, Group Theory, and Operation Research, respectively. Moreover, typical examples of Topology 634 and Graph Theory in our MATH-V are displayed in Figure 13 and Figure 13. Although both sets of 635 subjects are intricate mathematical disciplines, they exhibit notable differences in the nature of their 636 posed questions. Questions in the MMMU dataset often involve advanced college-level mathematical 637 concepts such as Kruskal's algorithm, alternating group structures, and DFS Spanning Tree. In 638 contrast, the questions in our dataset predominantly comprise puzzles that are readily solvable by 639 middle and high school students. 640

## 641 H More Dataset Details

#### 642 H.1 Question Distribution

All questions in MATH-V are written in English. As illustrated in Appendix B, the average number of words in a question is 42.3, with a maximum of 280 words and a minimum of 5 words. Figure 17 further elucidates the distribution of word counts, highlighting the diverse patterns of questions.



Figure 7: Some images with the question "What is the age gap between these two people in the image?" from MathVista. Questions containing "What is the age gap between" appear 310 times.



Figure 8: Problem involving very similar geometry recognition from MathVista. Questions like "Subtract all ... objects. How many objects are left?" appear 400 times.



Figure 10: Typical examples of 400 questions with a function plot of MathVista. Each image has approximately seven questions about function symmetry, monotonicity, roots, periodicity, values, etc.

We can see that the median word count and the average word count are close, indicating that the distribution is not skewed. The distribution of word counts is near a normal distribution, with more than 98.75% of questions having a word count of less than 100.

### 649 H.2 Division of Levels

In this section, we detail the division of MATH-V's difficulty levels. Our difficulty classification is divided into two steps. The first step involves roughly dividing the difficulty levels based on the grades of the contestants as specified in the competition. The second step entails manually checking and correcting any unreasonable divisions.

**Step 1.** The existing competition's grade requirements span grades 1 to 12. Because the questions for grades 1 and 2 are considered too simple, we classify them separately as level 1. The questions for grades 3, 4, 5, and 6 are similar in difficulty, so we classify them as level 2. Grades 7 and 8 are categorized as level 3, grades 9 and 10 as level 4, and grades 11 and above as level 5.

Step 2. We manually review the questions in each level and adjust the classification according to the actual difficulty of the questions. This step is necessary because, within the same exam, the difficulty range of the questions can be quite broad. For instance, the most difficult question in grade 4 might be more challenging than the easiest question in grade 5. In such cases, we make manual adjustments.



Figure 11: Three examples from MATH-V on analytic geometry, which are about mutual symmetry of functions, quadratic function discriminant, and roots of iterative functions. We omit some choices for brevity.



Figure 17: The distribution of the number of words per question in MATH-V.

Figure 18.a shows a comparison of the level distribution between our MATH-V and the MATH dataset. We observe that both datasets have the fewest number of questions in level 1 and a similar number of questions in the other levels. Figure 18 h illustrates the models' accuracy across different levels. It is

questions in the other levels. Figure 18.b illustrates the models' accuracy across different levels. It is



Figure 12: Three examples from MATH-V on topology. We omit some choices for brevity.



Figure 13: Three examples from MATH-V on graph theory. We omit some choices for brevity.



Figure 14: Three examples from the Graph Theory subfield in the Math subset of MMMU.



Figure 15: Three examples from the Group Theory subfield in the Math subset of MMMU.



Figure 16: Three examples from the Operation Research subfield in the Math subset of MMMU.

evident that the accuracy of the models decreases as the difficulty level increases, which aligns with the expectation that the difficulty of the questions escalates with the level.



Figure 18: (a) Comparison of the level distribution between our MATH-V and the MATH dataset [33]. (b) Accuracy on MATH-V on six typical LMMs across 5 difficulty levels.

#### 669 H.3 Images by Subjects

In this section, we demonstrate some images from the problems in our dataset. Figure 20, Figure 21, Figure 22, Figure 23, Figure 24, Figure 25, Figure 26, Figure 27, Figure 28, Figure 29, Figure 30, Figure 31, Figure 32, Figure 33, Figure 34 and Figure 35 show images from the problems under the category of Algebra, Analytic Geometry, Arithmetic, Combinatorial Geometry, Combinatorics, Counting, Descriptive Geometry, Graph Theory, Logic, Metric Geometry - Angle, Metric Geometry -Area, Metric Geometry - Length, Solid Geometry, Statistics, Topology and Transformation Geometry, respectively.

We can see that the images are diverse among different categories, and the images in the same category have similar visual patterns. For example, the images in the category of Statistics are mainly various types of charts and tables, while the images in the category of Arithmetic and Counting, which are categories mainly for primary school students, are more colorful and have more cartoon characters or real-world objects, and, conversely, the images in the category of Analytic Geometry are more complex and abstract.

#### 683 H.4 Introduction of Subjects

Algebra. Algebra is a branch of mathematics that deals with symbols and the rules for manipulating these symbols. It is a unifying thread of almost all of mathematics and includes everything from solving simple equations to studying abstractions such as groups, rings, and fields. Algebra allows us to express relationships and solve problems where we don't initially know the values of certain quantities. It serves as the foundation for more advanced topics in mathematics and sciences, enabling the formulation and solving of equations and inequalities.

Analytic Geometry. Analytic Geometry, also known as coordinate geometry, merges algebra and geometry to discuss shapes and figures using a coordinate system. This branch of mathematics allows the representation of geometric shapes in a numerical way by translating them into equations and vice versa. It enables the study of geometric properties and relationships by means of algebraic equations, thus providing a powerful tool for solving geometric problems. Arithmetic. Arithmetic is the most basic branch of mathematics, dealing with the study of numbers and the traditional operations on them: addition, subtraction, multiplication, and division. It forms the foundation upon which more advanced mathematical concepts are built. Arithmetic is used in everyday life for counting, measuring, and performing calculations. It is the first type of math that students are introduced to and remains fundamental for understanding more complex areas of mathematics.

**Combinatorial Geometry.** Combinatorial Geometry is a field of mathematics that studies geometric objects and their arrangement, with a particular focus on discrete and combinatorial aspects. It involves the investigation of geometric structures and their properties under various combinatorial processes, such as counting, arrangement, and partitioning. This branch often intersects with areas like graph theory and combinatorics, exploring problems related to the configuration of points, lines, and other geometric figures.

Combinatorics. Combinatorics is a branch of mathematics concerned with counting, arrangement,
 and combination of objects. It deals with questions of how many different ways such objects can
 be chosen, arranged, and combined under certain conditions. Combinatorics has applications in
 numerous areas, including computer science, optimization, and probability theory. It is fundamental
 in developing analytical skills and understanding complex mathematical concepts.

**Counting.** Counting is the most basic and fundamental concept in mathematics, involving the enumeration of objects in a set. It serves as the foundation for more advanced mathematical concepts, such as arithmetic and combinatorics. Counting is not only about determining the total number of items in a collection but also includes understanding and applying principles like one-to-one correspondence, the counting principle, permutations, and combinations.

Descriptive Geometry. Descriptive Geometry is the branch of geometry that allows the representation
of three-dimensional objects in two dimensions, through the use of projections or perspective drawings.
It is a method of visually communicating complex geometric shapes and is fundamental in fields
such as engineering, architecture, and design. Descriptive geometry provides tools and techniques for
solving spatial problems and for understanding the spatial relationships between objects.

**Graph Theory.** Graph Theory is a branch of mathematics that studies graphs, which are mathematical structures used to model pairwise relations between objects. A graph is made up of vertices (or nodes) and edges (or arcs) that connect them. Graph theory is used to study networks and their properties, such as paths, cycles, and connectivity, and has applications in computer science, biology, transportation, social sciences, and more.

Logic. Logic is the foundation of mathematical reasoning, focusing on the study of argument validity, structure, and form. It involves the analysis of propositions and their relationships to determine the truth values of statements. Logic is used to construct and analyze mathematical proofs, ensuring that conclusions follow logically from premises. It encompasses various systems, such as propositional logic, predicate logic, and modal logic, each with its own rules and applications.

Metric Geometry - Angle. Metric Geometry concerning angles focuses on the properties and measurements of angles within various geometric figures. It involves understanding the types of angles (acute, right, obtuse, and straight), their relationships, and how they can be measured and used to determine other geometric properties. This aspect of metric geometry is crucial in solving problems related to shapes, patterns, and designs in both two and three dimensions.

Metric Geometry - Area. Metric Geometry in the context of area deals with the measurement of
the surface enclosed within geometric figures. It involves calculating the extent of two-dimensional
shapes, such as squares, rectangles, triangles, and circles, using various formulas. Understanding area
is essential in numerous practical applications, including architecture, land surveying, and crafting,
where the determination of space is necessary.

Metric Geometry - Length. Metric Geometry concerning length involves the measurement of
 distance between points in geometric figures. It is the foundation for determining the perimeter of
 shapes, the distance around a figure, and the concept of metric spaces in more advanced mathematics.

Length measurements are fundamental in various real-world applications, such as construction,
 fabrication, and navigation.

Solid Geometry. Solid Geometry is the branch of mathematics that deals with the study of threedimensional figures, including spheres, cubes, cylinders, and pyramids, among others. It involves understanding the properties, measurements, and relationships of these figures, such as volume, surface area, and the angles between intersecting planes. Solid geometry is essential in fields such as engineering, architecture, and physics, where three-dimensional models are crucial.

Statistics. Statistics is the branch of mathematics that deals with collecting, analyzing, interpreting,
 and presenting data. It involves the use of theories of probability to make inferences about populations
 from samples. Statistics is applied in a wide range of disciplines, including economics, social sciences,
 biology, and engineering, to make decisions or predictions based on data analysis.

**Topology.** Topology is a branch of mathematics concerned with the properties of space that are preserved under continuous transformations, such as stretching and bending, but not tearing or gluing. It is often referred to as "rubber-sheet geometry" because of its focus on the intrinsic properties of spaces. Topology has applications in various areas, including quantum physics, computer science, and biology, and deals with concepts like continuity, compactness, and connectedness.

**Transformation Geometry.** Transformation Geometry involves the study of geometric figures and the changes they undergo through transformations such as translation, rotation, reflection, and dilation. It focuses on understanding how these transformations affect the properties and relations of shapes and figures. Transformation geometry is fundamental in understanding the symmetry, congruence, and similarity of geometric objects, and it has applications in areas such as computer graphics, robotics, and pattern recognition.

# 767 I Error Examples of GPT-4V

In this section, we present detailed examples of errors made by GPT-4V. We categorize these errors
 into six types: reasoning error, vision recognition error, knowledge error, question misunderstood
 error, refusal to answer, and calculation error.

#### 771 I.1 Reasoning Error (42.2%)

Reasoning errors occur when GPT-4V fails to apply logical steps correctly. In Figure 36, the model
incorrectly substitutes an unknown variable with a known value, leading to an incorrect conclusion.
Figure 37 shows the model making an illogical hypothesis about the relationships of train wagon
numbers.

#### 776 I.2 Vision Recognition Error (31.9%)

Vision recognition errors highlight the model's struggles with interpreting visual data. Figure 38 depicts an instance where GPT-4V fails to read information from a simple bar chart. In Figure 39, the error occurs because the model mistakenly believes that 3, 6, and y are on the same side of the triangle. Figure 40 shows the model experiencing severe hallucinations, as there is no balance in the image at all.

#### 782 I.3 Knowledge Error (15.1%)

Knowledge errors are instances where GPT-4V lacks the necessary information to answer a question
 and provides information that is outdated or incorrect. Figure 41 and Figure 42 both showcase
 situations where the model did not know how to solve the problems.

#### 786 I.4 Question Misunderstood Error (6.9%)

These errors occur when GPT-4V misinterprets the user's query. Figure 43 demonstrates a failure to grasp the query's intent, resulting in an incorrect answer. Similarly, in Figure 44, the model mistakenly believes that the key below corresponds to the lock above, even though the question does not provide this information.

#### 791 I.5 Reject to Answer (2.6%)

Sometimes, GPT-4V refuses to provide an answer, which is categorized as a Reject to answer error.
 Figure 45 and Figure 46 illustrate instances where the model either cannot generate a response or
 chooses not to, citing various reasons.

#### 795 I.6 Calculation Error (1.3%)

Calculation errors are straightforward mistakes in numerical or symbolic calculations. The model
only makes errors when performing symbolic calculations in our analysis. Both Figure 47 and
Figure 48 show a simple symbolic computational mistake, undermining the model's reliability in
symbolic calculations.

# **J** Examples of GPT-4 with Image Captions

In this section, we provide some qualitative examples of GPT-4 with image captions, in comparison to other models like GPT-4V, Gemini Pro, and Qwen-VL-Max.

#### **803** J.1 Correct Examples

Some typical correct examples (Figure 49, Figure 50, Figure 51, Figure 52, Figure 53, Figure 54, Figure 55) of GPT-4 with image captions on subjects like algebra, arithmetic, analytic geometry, counting, and combinatorics. Image captions are either accurate or have some small hallucinations.

## 807 J.2 Wrong Examples

Some typical wrong examples (Figure 56, Figure 57, Figure 58, Figure 59, Figure 60, Figure 61) of
 GPT-4 with image captions on other subjects. Image captions are usually inaccurate to describe the
 image.

## **K Details of Human Annotators**

We hire human annotators for three tasks: 1. Verify the alignment of text questions and images; 2. Categorize the problems into 16 different subjects; 3. Evaluate human performance on MATH-V.

## 814 K.1 Alignment of Text Questions and Images

We hire ten annotators in stage one, and all of them are senior college students, all majoring in science-related disciplines. We pay them \$0.35 per question, and they were asked to judge whether the text of the question matched the corresponding image and whether the image was complete. When the image is incomplete or incorrectly positioned, they are asked to re-capture the image from the original file.

#### 820 K.2 Subjects Classification

For task two, we have 10 annotators and three authors, to categorize the problems into 16 different subjects independently in three groups with our specially designed annotation tool, as illustrated in Figure 19. We ask them to read our definitions of the 16 subjects in advance as shown in Appendix H.4, and will randomly check their classification of certain topics. If there are mistakes in classification, we will promptly correct them and inform them. We pay \$0.45 per question. Notably, we also utilize existing LMMs (such as Gemini and GPT-4V) for subject classification. Detailed instructions to annotators and prompts to models can be found in Table 10. Finally, we will combine the classification results of the three groups with the classification results returned by LMMs to give the final classification.

#### > Instructions for annotators on how to label questions into 16 categories

We are constructing a dataset about mathematical problems in visual contexts, and we have collected quantities of questions that require categorization into different mathematical subjects. These categorizations are logic, algebra, counting, arithmetic, combinatorics, graph theory, topology, statistics, combinatorial geometry, solid geometry, metric geometry - angle, metric geometry - area, metric geometry - length, analytic geometry, descriptive geometry, and transformation geometry. Here are the detailed definitions of them: ... (definitions in Appendix H.4)

If you are unsure about how to categorize the problem into these subjects, choose 'pending' instead.

#### ▷ The prompt for models to get subject advice

What branch of mathematics does the problem belong to? Choose from the following: logic, algebra, counting, arithmetic, combinatorics, graph theory, topology, statistics, combinatorial geometry, solid geometry, metric geometry - angle, metric geometry - area, metric geometry - length, analytic geometry, descriptive geometry, transformation geometry, pending.

You are not supposed to solve the problem. Wrap your final answer, a word or a short phrase, in "\_"

Table 10: Instructions for annotators on how to label questions into 16 categories and the prompt for models to get subject advice.

#### 830 K.3 Human Performance

To obtain average human performance on our benchmark, we recruit 100 annotators possessing a 831 high school degree or higher. These annotators had not previously participated in the competitions 832 where our data originated and were seeing the questions in our test set for the first time. We divided 833 the 3040 questions of MATH-V into 100 subsets, each containing 30 or 31 questions. Subsequently, 834 we randomly allocated two subsets from this pool to each student. Participants were tasked with 835 completing both subsets within a 70-minute time frame, spread across two separate days. Note that 836 this time limit closely aligns with that of the Kangaroo competition, where participants are assigned a 837 similar duration for a test containing 30 problems. Each participant receives a one-time payment of 838 \$40 as compensation for their contribution. 839

•••	Questions Type Labeler-MATH-V.jsonl
90 80 70	
Grade_1-2_2007_Austria_Q1	
[>	] 0/3040(0%)
Which number should be writ <image1></image1>	ten in place of the question mark?
Previous	Jump to Next
	arithmetic 📀
logic algebra	counting arithmetic combinatorics graph theory
topology statistics combinatorial ge	eometry solid geometry metric geometry - angle metric geometry - area

Figure 19: GUI for categorizing the problems into 16 different subjects.



Figure 20: Some images from Algebra.



Figure 21: Some images from Analytic Geometry.



Figure 22: Some images from Arithmetic.



Figure 23: Some images from Combinatorial Geometry.



Figure 24: Some images from Combinatorics.



Figure 25: Some images from Counting.



Figure 26: Some images from Descriptive Geometry.



Figure 27: Some images from Graph Theory.



Figure 28: Some images from Logic.



Figure 29: Some images from Metric Geometry - Angle.



Figure 30: Some images from Metric Geometry - Area.



Figure 31: Some images from Metric Geometry - Length.



Figure 32: Some images from Solid Geometry.



Figure 33: Some images from Statistics.



Figure 34: Some images from Topology.



Figure 35: Some images from Transformation Geometry.

#### **Reasoning Error**

**Question:** In triangle ABC, AB = AC, AE = ADand angle  $BAD = 30^{\circ}$ . What is the size of angle CDE? (A)  $10^{\circ}$ (B)  $15^{\circ}$ (C)  $20^{\circ}$ (D)  $25^{\circ}$ (E)  $30^{\circ}$ **Ground Truth:** (B)  $15^{\circ}$ 



# **GPT4V Answer:**

First, let's review the given information:

- Triangle ABC is isosceles with AB = AC. - AE = AD. -  $\angle BAD = 30^{\circ}$ . Given that AB = AC, we know that  $\angle ABC = \angle ACB$  because the base angles of an isosceles triangle are equal.

Since  $\angle BAD = 30^{\circ}$  and AE = AD, we have another isosceles triangle,  $\triangle ADE$ , and  $\angle ADE = \angle AED$ . Let's call this unknown angle  $\theta$ .

Because AE = AD, triangle ADE is isosceles, which makes  $\angle ADE = \angle AED = \theta$ . Also, the sum of angles in a triangle is 180°, so in  $\triangle ADE$ , we have:

$$\angle DAE + \angle ADE + \angle AED = 180^{\circ}$$
$$30^{\circ} + \theta + \theta = 180^{\circ}$$
$$2\theta = 180^{\circ} - 30^{\circ}$$
$$2\theta = 150^{\circ}$$

$$\theta = 75^{\circ}$$

So, both  $\angle ADE$  and  $\angle AED$  are 75°.

Now we move to  $\triangle CDE$ . We are looking for  $\angle CDE$ . The angle  $\angle CDE$  is part of  $\angle CDA$ , which is an exterior angle to  $\triangle ADE$  and equals the sum of the opposite interior angles, which we have found to be  $\angle ADE + \angle AED$ . Therefore:

 $\angle CDA = \angle ADE + \angle AED$  $\angle CDA = 75^{\circ} + 75^{\circ}$  $\angle CDA = 150^{\circ}$ 

Since  $\angle CDA$  is a straight line and is part of  $\angle CDE$ , the following relationship holds:

$$\angle CDA = \angle CDE + \angle ADE$$
$$150^{\circ} = \angle CDE + 75^{\circ}$$
$$\angle CDE = 150^{\circ} - 75^{\circ}$$
$$\angle CDE = 75^{\circ}$$

This is not amongst the given options, indicating that there's an error. [Truncated Due to Length]





Figure 37: An example of reasoning error.

## Vision Recognition Error

**Question:** The students in Mrs. Sawyer's class were asked to do a taste test of five kinds of candy. Each student chose one kind of candy. A bar graph of their preferences is shown. What percent of her class chose candy E?

#### **Ground Truth:** 2



# **GPT4V** Answer:

To find the percentage of the class that chose candy E, we first need to determine the number of students who chose candy E by looking at the bar graph. Then, we calculate the total number of students who participated in the taste test by adding the number of students who chose each kind of candy. Finally, we can find the percentage of students who chose candy E by dividing the number of students who chose candy E by the total number of students and then multiplying by 100.

From the bar graph, the number of students who chose candy E can be counted directly: Candy E chosen by = 2 students

Now let's count the total number of students who participated:

Candy A chosen by = 7 students Candy B chosen by = 8 students Candy C chosen by = 5 students Candy D chosen by = 3 students Candy E chosen by = 2 students (as identified earlier)

Total number of students = 7 + 8 + 5 + 3 + 2 = 25 students Now we determine the percentage of students who chose candy E:

> Percentage choosing candy  $E = \left(\frac{\text{Number choosing candy E}}{\text{Total number of students}}\right) \times 100$ Percentage choosing candy  $E = \left(\frac{2}{25}\right) \times 100$ Percentage choosing candy  $E = \frac{2}{25} \times 100$

> > Percentage choosing candy  $E = 0.08 \times 100$

Percentage choosing candy E = 8%

Therefore, the percentage of the class that chose candy E is:

8%

Figure 38: An example of vision recognition error.

### Vision Recognition Error

**Question:** The sums of the all the three numbers on each side of the triangle are equal. Two numbers happened to be stained with ink. How much is the sum of these two numbers?

# Ground Truth: 2

#### **GPT4V Answer:**



To solve this problem, we need to realize that the sum of the numbers on each side of the triangle is the same. We will call this sum S.

Let's denote the two unknown numbers, which are obscured by ink, as x and y. We can write the sum on each side of the triangle using these variables. For the side with the numbers 7, x, and 1, the sum is 7 + x + 1. For the side with the numbers 3, 6, and y, the sum is 3 + 6 + y.

Because the sums are equal, we have:

$$7 + x + 1 = 3 + 6 + y$$
  
 $8 + x = 9 + y$ 

We want to find the sum of x and y. Let's add y to both sides of the equation to move terms involving y to the left side and terms involving x to the right side:

$$y + 9 + y = 8 + x + y$$
$$2y + 9 = 8 + x + y$$

Now subtract y from both sides:

$$y + 9 = 8 + x$$

We know that the other side of the triangle is 1 + 6 + 3 = 10, so the sum of the numbers on each side must be 10, which means:

$$y + 9 = 10$$
$$y = 10 - 9$$
$$y = 1$$

Now we substitute y = 1 into the sum for the other sides to find x:

$$x + 8 = 10$$

$$= 10 - 8$$
  
 $x = 2$ 

So, the two numbers are x = 2 and y = 1, and their sum is:

$$x + y = 2 + 1 = 3$$

Thus, the sum of the two numbers that are stained with ink is 3, and so we have:

3

Figure 39: An example of vision recognition error.



Figure 40: An example of vision recognition error. Model is experiencing severe hallucinations in this example

Knowledge Error

**Question:** We see in the diagram at the right a piece of the graphic of the function

$$f(x) = ax^3 + bx^2 + cx + d.$$

What is the value of *b*?

Ground Truth: -2

# **GPT4V Answer:**

To determine the value of b in the cubic function  $f(x) = ax^3 + bx^2 + cx + d$ , we need to look at the properties of the function's graph provided in the diagram.

From the graph, we can identify the coordinates of the two local extrema (maximum and minimum). At these points, the first derivative f'(x) of the function must be zero since the slope of the tangent line at these points is zero.

The first derivative of the cubic function f(x) is given by:

$$f'(x) = 3ax^2 + 2bx + c.$$

We have two extrema points visible on the graph, at x = -1 and x = 1. Let's set up the derivative to be equal to zero at these points:

For x = -1:

$$0 = 3a(-1)^{2} + 2b(-1) + c$$
  

$$0 = 3a - 2b + c$$
  

$$2b = 3a + c \quad (1)$$
  

$$0 = 2c(1)^{2} + 2b(1) + c$$

For x = 1:

$$0 = 3a(1)^{2} + 2b(1) + c$$
  
$$0 = 3a + 2b + c \quad (2)$$

Let's solve this system of equations (1) and (2) for *b*. Subtract (1) from (2):

3a + 2b + c - (3a - 2b + c) = 03a + 2b + c - 3a + 2b - c = 04b = 0b = 0

Therefore, the value of b is zero.

$$b = 0$$

Figure 41: An example of knowledge error.

# Knowledge Error

**Question:** In the accompanying figure, segments AB and CD are parallel, the measure of angle D is twice the measure of angle B, and the measures of segments AB and CD are a and b respectively. Then the measure of AB is equal to

(A)  $\frac{1}{2}a + 2b$ (B)  $\frac{3}{2}b + \frac{3}{4}a$ (C) 2a - b(D)  $4b - \frac{1}{2}a$ (E) a + b

**Ground Truth:** -2



# **GPT4V Answer:**

The image you've provided appears to be a quadrilateral with sides AB and CD denoted as being parallel and segments AB labeled as a, and CD as b. However, without additional information such as angle measures or the relationship between the sides and angles, it is impossible to determine a definitive relationship between a and b based on the given options (A) through (E).

Typically, in problems like this, you might apply properties of parallel lines and transversals or properties of similar triangles if any triangle relationships can be determined. But the given information is insufficient to apply these properties directly.

Given the description of the problem, it seems to be expecting the application of a geometric principle or theorem which is not evident from the image alone. It's possible that there is either additional information that has not been provided or there may be an error in the problem's depiction.

With the information currently at hand, it is not feasible to reach a solution, and I cannot provide an answer in the requested format  $\square$ . If you can provide further details or clarify the conditions of the problem, I would be happy to reattempt to solve it.

Figure 42: An example of knowledge error.



Figure 43: An example of question understood error.



Figure 44: An example of question understood error. The model mistakenly believes that keys and locks are in one-to-one correspondence, but there is no such condition in the question.



Figure 45: An example of reject to answer error.



Figure 46: An example of reject to answer error.

#### **Calculation Error**

**Question:** The diagram shows three concentric circles and two perpendicular, common diameters of the three circles. The three grey sections are of equal area, the small circle has radius 1. What is the product of the radii of the three circles?

(A)  $\sqrt{6}$ (B) 3

(C)  $\frac{3\sqrt{3}}{2}$ (D)  $2\sqrt{2}$ 

(E) 6 **Ground Truth:** (A)  $\sqrt{6}$ 

#### **GPT4V Answer:**

The problem states that the three grey sections are of equal area, and we know the radius of the smallest circle to be 1. Let's denote the radius of the middle circle as r and the radius of the largest circle as R.

The area of a sector of a circle is given by  $\frac{1}{2}\theta r^2$ , where  $\theta$  is the central angle in radians, and r is the radius of the circle. Since the three grey sections are equal in area and shaped as quarter circles, each grey section has a central angle of  $\frac{\pi}{2}$  radians.

Therefore, the area of each grey section can be represented as follows:

For the smallest circle:

$$A_{\text{small}} = \frac{1}{2} \times \frac{\pi}{2} \times 1^2 = \frac{\pi}{4}$$

For the middle circle, the area of the sector minus the area of the smaller circle's quarter:

$$A_{\text{middle}} = \frac{1}{2} \times \frac{\pi}{2} \times r^2 - A_{\text{small}} = \frac{\pi r^2}{4} - \frac{\pi}{4}$$

For the largest circle, the area of the sector minus the area of the middle circle's quarter:

$$A_{\text{large}} = \frac{1}{2} \times \frac{\pi}{2} \times R^2 - A_{\text{middle}} - A_{\text{small}} = \frac{\pi R^2}{4} - \frac{\pi r^2}{4}$$

Since the areas are equal:  $A_{\text{small}} = A_{\text{middle}} = A_{\text{large}}$ We can set the expressions for  $A_{\text{small}}$  and  $A_{\text{middle}}$  equal to each other:

$$\frac{\pi}{4} = \frac{\pi r^2}{4} - \frac{\pi}{4}$$
$$\Rightarrow \frac{\pi r^2}{4} = \frac{2\pi}{4}$$
$$\Rightarrow r^2 = 2$$
$$\Rightarrow r = \sqrt{2}$$

Now, do the same for  $A_{\text{middle}}$  and  $A_{\text{large}}$ :

$$\frac{\pi r^2}{4} - \frac{\pi}{4} = \frac{\pi R^2}{4} - \frac{\pi r^2}{4}$$
$$\Rightarrow \frac{\pi R^2}{4} - \frac{2\pi r^2}{4} = 0$$
$$\Rightarrow \frac{\pi R^2}{4} = \frac{2\pi}{4}$$
$$\Rightarrow R^2 = 2$$

$$\Rightarrow R = \sqrt{2} \times r = 2$$

D

The product of the radii of the three circles is:  $1 \times r \times R = 1 \times \sqrt{2} \times 2 = 2\sqrt{2}$ Therefore, the answer is:

Figure 47: Full example of calculation error. The wrong steps are highlighted in red.

#### **Calculation Error**

**Question:** The diagram shows two adjoining squares with side lengths a and b (with a < b). How big is the area of the grey triangle? (A)  $\sqrt{ab}$ (B)  $\frac{1}{2}a^2$ (C)  $\frac{1}{2}b^2$ (D)  $\frac{1}{4}(a^2 + b^2)$ (E)  $\frac{1}{2}(a^2 + b^2)$ 



#### **GPT4V** Answer:

**Ground Truth:** (B)  $\frac{1}{2}a^2$ 

The grey triangle in the diagram can be seen as the difference between the large square with side b and the smaller square with side a, minus the two right triangles that are outside of the grey area but inside the larger square.

The area of the larger square is  $b^2$ , and the area of the smaller square is  $a^2$ . The two right triangles each have legs of length a and b - a, thus the area of one such right triangle is  $\frac{1}{2} \times a \times (b - a)$ . There are two of these triangles, so the total area of the two triangles is  $\frac{1}{2} \times a \times (b - a) \times 2 = a \times (b - a)$ . Now, the area of the grey triangle is therefore the area of the large square minus the area of the small square and the two right triangles:

$$b^{2} - a^{2} - a(b - a) = b^{2} - a^{2} - ab + a^{2} = b^{2} - ab$$

We simplify this by factoring out a *b*:

$$b(b-a)$$

Now, we notice that b - a is the height of the grey triangle, and, by looking at the diagram, we can see that the base of the grey triangle overlaps exactly with the side length of the larger square, which is b.

Therefore, the area of the grey triangle is  $\frac{1}{2} \times base \times height$ , which in this case is  $\frac{1}{2} \times b \times (b-a)$ : Area of grey triangle =  $\frac{1}{2} \times b \times (b-a)$ 

But since we can't simplify this expression using the given variables directly, we must find a match among the options provided. By adding and subtracting  $\frac{1}{2}a^2$  within the expression of the larger square area  $b^2$ , we can rewrite the expression:

$$b^{2} - a(b - a) = b^{2} - ab + a^{2} - \frac{1}{2}a^{2} + \frac{1}{2}a^{2}$$
$$= \frac{1}{2}a^{2} + \frac{1}{2}b^{2} - \frac{1}{2}a^{2} - ab + \frac{1}{2}a^{2}$$
$$= \frac{1}{2}(a^{2} + b^{2}) - \frac{1}{2}a^{2}$$

Therefore, the area of the grey triangle is equal to half the sum of the areas of the two squares minus half the area of the smaller square: Area of grey triangle =  $\frac{1}{2}(a^2 + b^2) - \frac{1}{2}a^2$ 

$$=\frac{1}{2}b^2$$

This matches option (C), so the area of the grey triangle is  $\frac{1}{2}b^2$ . Thus, the answer is:

C

Figure 48: An example of calculation error. The wrong steps are highlighted in red.

#### **Example of Algebra**

**Question:** The numbers in the five circles around each house add up to 20. Some numbers are missing. Which number does the question mark stand for?

## **Ground Truth:** 9

#### **GPT4V Image Caption:**



The diagram features two houses connected by a series of circles, each containing a number or a question mark. Each house has a large circle on its roof and two smaller circles on the ground, one on each side.

The house on the left has the number 6 in the circle on its roof. The two smaller circles on the ground next to this house contain the numbers 2 and 5, respectively. The house on the right has the number 3 in the circle on its roof. The circle on the ground to the right of this house contains the number 1, and the circle on the ground to the left of this house contains a question mark.

The circles are connected by lines, suggesting a relationship or a pattern that needs to be discovered. ... Additionally, there is a line connecting the two houses, specifically from the circle with the number 5 to the circle with the question mark.

The goal of the problem is likely to determine the number that should replace the question mark, based on the pattern or relationship between the numbers in the connected circles. **GPT4 Answer:** 

To solve this problem, we need to find the pattern or relationship between the numbers in the connected circles, given that the sum of the numbers around each house adds up to 20. For the house on the left: The numbers we know are 6 (on the roof), 2, and 5 (on the ground). Let's add these numbers: 6 + 2 + 5 = 13. Since the sum of the numbers around the house must be 20, we need to find the missing number that, when added to 13, equals 20. Let's denote the missing number on the left side as x. So, 13 + x = 20. Solving for x, we get x = 20 - 13 = 7.

For the house on the right: The numbers we know are 3 (on the roof) and 1 (on the ground). We also know now that the missing number on the left side, which is connected to the house on the right, is 7. Let's add these numbers: 3 + 1 + 7 = 11. Since the sum of the numbers around the house must be 20, we need to find the missing number that, when added to 11, equals 20. Let's denote the missing number on the right side as y. So, 11 + y = 20. Solving for y, we get y = 20 - 11 = 9. Therefore, the number that should replace the question mark is 9.

#### **Gemini Pro Answer:**

Let's assume the missing numbers as x and y. The sum of the numbers in the circles around the first house = 6 + 2 + 5 + x = 13 + x. The sum of the numbers in the circles around the second house = 3 + y + 1 = 4 + y. Since the sum of the numbers in the circles around each house is 20, we have: 13 + x + 4 + y = 20; 17 + x + y = 20; x + y = 3. As the number in each circle is different, the possible values of x and y are (0, 3), (1, 2), and (2, 1). The question mark can be either 0 or 2.

#### **Qwen-VL-Max Answer:**

The sum of the numbers in the circles around the left house is 6 + 3 + 2 + 5 = 16, so the number on the top right corner is 20 - 16 = 4. The sum of the numbers in the circles around the right house is 3 + 4 + 1 + ? = 20, so the question mark stands for 8.

Figure 49: An example of algebra question of GPT-4 with image caption. Although there are small hallucinations marked in red, The model correctly solves the problem based on the image description. Gemini Pro and Qwen-VL-Max fail to solve it because of weak visual recognition and reasoning ability.



# Question:

Which of these clouds contain only numbers that are smaller than 7?

$$\begin{array}{c} 6 & 1 & 8 \\ 6 & 7 & \\ (A) \\ \hline Ground Truth: (D) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 2 & 3 \\ (C) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 6 & 2 \\ 6 & 7 \\ (D) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 3 & 2 \\ (D) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 3 & 2 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 8 & 9 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 8 & 9 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 8 & 9 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 8 & 9 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 3 & 2 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 8 & 9 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 3 & 2 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 8 & 9 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 3 & 2 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 8 & 9 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 3 & 2 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 8 & 9 \\ (E) \\ \hline \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 3 & 2 \\ (E) \\ \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 3 & 2 \\ (E) \\ \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 3 & 2 \\ (E) \\ \end{array} \begin{array}{c} 1 & 3 & 2 \\ (E) \\ \end{array} \end{array}$$

#### **GPT4V Image Caption:**

The diagram consists of five separate cloud-like shapes, each containing a set of numbers arranged in a specific pattern. Each cloud is labeled with a letter from (A) to (E). I will describe the arrangement of numbers within each cloud:

(A) This cloud contains four numbers arranged in a diamond shape. The top number is 1, the number to the left is 6, the number to the right is 8, and the bottom number is 7.

(B) This cloud also contains four numbers in a diamond pattern. The top number is 2, the left number is 5, the right number is 3, and the bottom number is 9.

(C) The third cloud has a similar diamond arrangement with the top number being 2, the left number 6, the right number 4, and the bottom number 7.

(D) This cloud's diamond pattern has the number 3 at the top, 1 on the left, 2 on the right, and 5 at the bottom.

(E) The final cloud has a slightly different arrangement with five numbers. There are two numbers at the top: 8 on the left and 9 on the right. Below these, in the center, is the number 10. The bottom left number is 8, and the bottom right number is 7.

Each cloud seems to represent a puzzle or problem where the numbers are related to each other in some way, possibly through mathematical operations. The exact nature of the relationship or the rules governing the arrangement of numbers is not specified in the diagram.

# **GPT4** Answer:

To solve this problem, we need to examine each cloud and determine if all the numbers it contains are smaller than 7.

(A) This cloud contains the numbers 1, 6, 8, and 7. Since it contains 8 and 7, which are not smaller than 7, it does not meet the criteria.

(E) This cloud contains the numbers 8, 9, 10, 8, and 7. Since it contains numbers greater than 7, it does not meet the criteria.

Therefore, the cloud that contains only numbers that are smaller than 7 is D

## Gemini Pro Answer: (A) and (D) (A) 1, 6, 7, 8 (D) 1, 2, 3, 4, 5

#### **Qwen-VL-Max Answer:**

To determine which clouds contain only numbers that are smaller than 7, we need to look at each cloud and check if all the numbers inside it are less than 7. The clouds that contain only numbers that are smaller than 7 are  $\binom{C}{C}$  (D)

... The clouds that contain only numbers that are smaller than 7 are |(C), (D)|

Figure 50: An example of arithmetic question of GPT-4 with image caption. Although there are small hallucinations marked in red, The model correctly solves the problem based on the image description. GPT-4V also does it correct while Gemini Pro and Qwen-VL-Max fail because of weak visual recognition ability.



Figure 51: An example of analytic geometry question of GPT-4 with image caption. Although there are small hallucinations marked in red, The model correctly solves the problem based on the image description while GPT-4V fails because of inaccurate image recognition.

#### **Example of Counting**

**Question:** How many triangles can you find in the picture?

#### Ground Truth: 5

#### **GPT4V Image Caption:**



The image depicts a stylized, geometric drawing of a humanoid figure that appears to be a representation of a girl or woman, composed of various simple shapes. The figure is not a real person but rather a collection of shapes that could be used in a math problem. Here is a detailed description of the figure:

Head: The head is a white circle with a simple, smiling face. The face has two blue dots for eyes and a red, upside-down triangle for a nose. The mouth is a black, curved line like a smile.

Hair: The figure has orange hair represented by two shapes on either side of the head, resembling pigtails. Each pigtail is a half-circle, and there is a pink bow on top of the head, consisting of a small circle in the center and two triangles on either side to represent the bow's loops.

**Body:** The body is a green trapezoid, wider at the top and tapering slightly towards the bottom, suggesting a dress or a tunic. There are two yellow circles in the middle of the trapezoid, aligned vertically, representing buttons.

Arms: The arms are two white rectangles extending from the upper sides of the trapezoid, each ending in a white triangle to represent hands.

Skirt: Below the trapezoid body, there is a green, inverted trapezoid that is narrower at the top and wider at the bottom, representing a skirt or the lower part of the dress.

**Legs:** The legs are two white rectangles extending downward from the bottom of the skirt. Shoes: It has orange shoes, each represented by a small rectangle at the end of the legs. The entire figure is outlined in black, giving it a cartoonish, clip-art style appearance. The use of geometric shapes to construct the figure suggests that it could be used in a math problem involving geometry, such as calculating areas, perimeters, or identifying shapes. **GPT4** Answer:

To solve the problem, let's identify and count all the triangles in the described figure. The description mentions specific shapes that make up the figure, and we'll focus on those identified as triangles or that can form triangles.

1. Nose: The nose is described as a red, upside-down triangle. Count: 1 triangle

2. Hair Bows: Each bow on top of the head consists of a small circle in the center and two triangles on either side to represent the bow's loops. Count: 2 triangles (since there's one bow mentioned, it has two triangles as part of its design)

3. Hands: Each hand at the end of the arms is represented by a white triangle. Count: 2 triangles (one for each hand)

4. **Implied Triangles:** The description does not explicitly mention other triangles, but we can check for any implied or composite triangles. Given the shapes described (circles for the head and buttons, rectangles for arms and legs, trapezoids for the body and skirt, half-circles for hair, and rectangles for shoes), there are no additional triangles formed by these shapes.

Therefore, the total count of triangles in the figure, based on the description provided, is:

1 (nose) + 2 (hair bows) + 2 (hands) = 5

So, the answer is 5 triangles.

Figure 52: An example of counting question of GPT-4 with image caption. Although there are small hallucinations marked in red, The model correctly solves the problem based on the image description.

#### **Example of Counting**

**Question:** How many more bricks does the right hand pyramid have than the left hand pyramid? **Ground Truth:** 5



# **GPT4V Image Caption:**

The diagram shows two separate pyramid-like structures composed of blocks. Each pyramid is arranged in a way that resembles steps, with each upper row containing fewer blocks than the row below it. The blocks are depicted in a 3D perspective, giving the appearance of depth.

The pyramid on the left has a total of 4 rows. From top to bottom, the number of blocks in each row increases by one. The top row has 1 block, the second row has 2 blocks, the third row has 3 blocks, and the bottom row has 4 blocks.

The pyramid on the right is larger, with a total of 5 rows. Similar to the left pyramid, the number of blocks in each row increases by one as you move from top to bottom. The top row has 1 block, the second row has 2 blocks, the third row has 3 blocks, the fourth row has 4 blocks, and the bottom row has 5 blocks.

Both pyramids are centered and have a symmetrical arrangement, ... GPT4 Answer:

To solve this problem, we need to calculate the total number of blocks in each pyramid and then find the difference between the two totals.

For the left pyramid (4 rows): The number of blocks in each row forms an arithmetic sequence: 1, 2, 3, 4. The total number of blocks is the sum of this sequence: 1+2+3+4. For the right pyramid (5 rows): Similarly, the number of blocks in each row forms an arithmetic sequence: 1, 2, 3, 4, 5. The total number of blocks is the sum of this sequence: 1 + 2 + 3 + 4 + 5.

Now, let's calculate the sums:

For the left pyramid: 1 + 2 + 3 + 4 = 10; For the right pyramid: 1 + 2 + 3 + 4 + 5 = 15. Finally, to find out how many more blocks the right pyramid has than the left pyramid, we subtract the total number of blocks in the left pyramid from the total number of blocks in

the right pyramid: 15 - 10 = 5. So, the right pyramid has 5 more blocks than the left pyramid.

# **GPT-4V Answer:**

For the left hand pyramid: The top row has 1 brick, the second row has 2 bricks, the third row has 3 bricks, and the bottom row has 4 bricks. So, the total number of bricks in the left hand pyramid is 1 + 2 + 3 + 4 = 10 bricks.

For the right hand pyramid: The top row has 1 brick, the second row has 3 bricks, the third row has 5 bricks, and the bottom row has 7 bricks. So, the total number of bricks in the right hand pyramid is 1 + 3 + 5 + 7 = 16 bricks. Now we find the difference:  $16 - \underline{10} = 6$ .

Therefore, the right pyramid has 6 more bricks than the left pyramid.

## **Gemini Pro Answer:**

The left hand pyramid has 6 rows of bricks. The right hand pyramid has 7 rows of bricks. There are 7 - 6 = 1 more rows of bricks in the right hand pyramid. Each row of the left hand pyramid has 6 bricks. So there are 6 \* 6 = 36 bricks in the left hand pyramid. Each row of the right hand pyramid has 7 bricks. So there are 7 \* 7 = 49 bricks in the right hand pyramid. There are 49 - 36 = 13 more bricks in the right hand pyramid. 13

Figure 53: An example of counting question of GPT-4 with image caption. The model correctly solves the problem based on the accurate and detailed image description while GPT-4V and Gemini Pro fail.

#### **Example of Combinatorics**

**Question:** The numbers 1, 2, 3, 4 and 9 are written into the squares on the following figure. The sum of the three numbers in the horizontal row, should be the same as the sum of the three numbers in the vertical column. Which number is written in the middle? **Ground Truth:** 9

# **GPT4V Image Caption:**



The diagram shows a geometric shape that resembles a cross or a plus sign (+). It is composed of five identical rectangles arranged such that one rectangle is at the center, and the other four are attached to each of its sides. The rectangles are aligned so that the longer sides of the rectangles are connected to the shorter sides of the central rectangle, forming a symmetrical cross shape.

Each rectangle appears to have the same dimensions, suggesting that they could be squares, but without specific measurements, we cannot confirm their exact shape. The lines that form the rectangles are uniform, indicating that the boundaries of each rectangle are clearly defined.

The overall shape could be interpreted as a 2D representation of an unfolded 3D box ... GPT4 Answer:

Given the description of the figure and the problem, let's denote the numbers in the squares as follows, assuming the central square is X. And we know there's a number 9 involved, which hasn't been placed yet. Since the sum of the three numbers in the horizontal row should be the same as the sum of the three numbers in the vertical column, and we need to include all numbers 1, 2, 3, 4, and 9, let's analyze the possible placements.

Given the numbers, the sum involving 9 would be significantly higher than any sum without it, meaning 9 must be in either the horizontal row or the vertical column that includes X. Since the figure is symmetrical and the problem specifies that the sums of the numbers in the horizontal row and vertical column must be equal, the only logical placement for 9 to balance the equation would be in the center, as X. Thus, the number written in the middle is 9.

#### **Gemini Pro Answer:**

Let's call the numbers in the squares A, B, C, D, and E. We know that A + B + C = D + E. We also know that A + D = B + E. Adding these two equations together, we get 2A + B + C + D = 2B + 2E. Simplifying this equation, we get A + C = B + E. Since A + B + C = D + E, we can substitute A + C for D + E in this equation to get A + C = B + (A + C). Simplifying this equation, we get B = A. Therefore, the number in the middle is A.

#### **Qwen-VL-Max Answer:**

Let's call the number in the middle square x. From the given information, we can set up the following equations:

1+2+x=9+4, 3+4+x=1+2+9

Solving for x in each equation, we find that x = 10.

Figure 54: An example of combinatorics question of GPT-4 with image caption. The model correctly solves the problem based on the accurate and detailed image description while Gemini Pro and Qwen-VL-Max fail.

#### **Example of Combinatorics**

**Question:** A hen lays white and brown eggs. Lisa takes six of them and puts them in a box as shown. The brown eggs are not allowed to touch each other. What is the maximum number of brown eggs Lisa can place in the box? **Ground Truth:** 3

## **GPT4V Image Caption:**

The diagram consists of two distinct parts:

1. On the left, there is a rectangle that contains six circles arranged in two rows of three. The circles are drawn such that each circle in the top row touches the two circles below it, and each circle in the bottom row touches the two circles above it. The circles are also touching their neighbors within the same row. The arrangement is such that the circles are packed closely together, maximizing the number of circles that can fit within the rectangle without overlapping.

2. On the right, there is an illustration of a chicken. The chicken is ...

# **GPT4** Answer:

1. **First Row**: Place a brown egg in the first position of the top row. To prevent any brown eggs from touching each other, the next egg in the top row must be white. Following this pattern, the third egg in the top row can be brown again. So, in the top row, we can place 2 brown eggs without them touching each other.

2. **Second Row**: For the bottom row, directly below a brown egg in the top row, we must place a white egg to prevent brown eggs from touching. This means that if the first and third positions in the top row are brown, the first and third positions in the bottom row must be white. Following the pattern to avoid brown eggs touching, we can place a brown egg in the second position of the bottom row. This ensures no brown eggs are touching vertically or horizontally.

So, in the bottom row, we can place 1 brown egg without it touching any other brown egg. Adding the brown eggs from both rows, we get a total of 2 + 1 = 3 brown eggs. 3.

## **GPT-4V Answer:**

The problem involves arranging a maximum number of brown eggs in a box with six compartments without allowing the brown eggs to touch each other. To maximize the number of brown eggs while adhering to this constraint, we can place a brown egg in every other compartment to ensure no two brown eggs are adjacent to one another.

Placing a brown egg in the first compartment, we then skip the second compartment and place another brown egg in the third compartment. **Repeating this pattern, we can see that we can place brown eggs in the first, third, and fifth compartments in the top row. For the bottom row, we can place brown eggs in the second, fourth, and sixth compartments.** 

Hence, the maximum number of brown eggs Lisa can place in the box without any two brown eggs touching each other is **three on the top row and three on the bottom row**, which is a total of: 3 (top row) + 3 (bottom row) = 6 brown eggs. Therefore, the answer is: 6

#### **Gemini Pro Answer:**

Lisa can place at most 2 brown eggs in the box. Since the brown eggs are not allowed to touch each other, they can only be placed in the corner spots. There are only two corner spots, so the maximum number of brown eggs Lisa can place in the box is 2.

Figure 55: An example of combinatorics question of GPT-4 with image caption. The model correctly solves the problem based on the accurate and detailed image description while GPT-4V and Gemini Pro fail.

### **Example of Topology**

**Question:** Theresa moves a pencil along the line. She starts at the arrow shown. In which order will she go past the shapes? (A)  $\Delta$ ,  $\Box$ ,  $\bullet$ 

 $(A) \ \Delta, \Box, \bullet \\ (B) \ \Delta, \bullet, \Box \\ (C) \ \bullet, \Delta, \Box \\ (D) \ \Box, \Delta, \bullet \\ (E) \ \Box, \bullet, \Delta$ 

**Ground Truth:** A

#### **GPT4V Image Caption:**

The diagram shows a complex, continuous, and entangled line that forms a path with several loops and curves. Along this path, there are four distinct markers: a solid black arrow, a solid black square, a solid black circle, and a solid black triangle. Each marker is connected to the line, indicating specific points along the path.

Starting from the left, the path begins with the solid black arrow pointing to the right, indicating the starting point. The line then makes a small loop upwards and continues to the right before making a large loop counterclockwise. After completing this large loop, the line extends to the right and then makes a sharp turn downwards, forming a smaller loop in a clockwise direction.

Following this smaller loop, the line extends upwards and then to the right, where it encounters the solid black square. The path continues to the right, makes a small loop upwards, and then heads down towards the solid black circle. After the circle, the line makes a large loop that goes up, then to the left, and finally down, passing to the right of the circle.

The path then makes a sharp turn upwards, creating a small loop, and continues to the left. It makes another loop downwards and to the right, passing below the previous loop and the solid black circle. The line then extends to the left, making a small upward loop before heading down and to the left, where it encounters the solid black triangle.

The diagram does not provide any scale, units, or additional context, so the description is purely based on the visual elements present. The purpose of the markers and the path's complexity suggest that the diagram could be related to a problem involving sequencing, following directions, or identifying patterns.

#### **GPT4** Answer:

Based on the description provided, Theresa starts at the solid black arrow and follows the path. Here's the sequence of events as she moves along the path:

1. Start at the solid black arrow: This is the starting point. 2. Small loop upwards: This is just a part of the path and doesn't involve any of the shapes. 3. Large loop counterclockwise: Again, this part of the path doesn't involve any of the shapes. 4. Sharp turn downwards forming a smaller loop in a clockwise direction: Still no shapes encountered. 5. Extends upwards and then to the right: No shapes yet. 6. Encounters the solid black square: This is the first shape she encounters. 7. Makes a small loop upwards and then heads down towards the solid black circle: The circle is the second shape encountered. 8. Makes a large loop that goes up, then to the left, and finally down, passing to the right of the circle: This loop doesn't lead to a new shape. 9. Sharp turn upwards creating a small loop and continues to the left: Still no new shapes. 10. Makes another loop downwards and to the right, passing below the previous loop and the solid black circle: This part of the path revisits the area near the circle but doesn't introduce a new shape. 11. Extends to the left, making a small upward loop before heading down and to the left, where it encounters the solid black triangle: The triangle is the third shape encountered. 12. Makes a final loop upwards and to the right, ending with a curl: This final part of the path doesn't involve any new shapes.

Therefore, the order in which Theresa goes past the shapes is: 1. Solid black square 2. Solid black circle 3. Solid black triangle So, the final answer is: Square, Circle, Triangle

#### **GPT-4V** Answer:

Following the line from the arrow, Theresa will first pass by the triangle ( $\Delta$ ), then she will pass by the square ( $\Box$ ), and finally past the circle ( $\bullet$ ). So, the correct order in which she will go is:  $\Delta$ ,  $\Box$ ,  $\bullet$  Therefore, the correct answer is: A

Figure 56: An example of topology question of GPT-4 with image caption. The model fails to solve the problem because of the inaccurate image description while GPT-4V succeeds.



Figure 57: An example of combinatorial geometry question of GPT-4 with image caption. The model fails to solve the problem because of the inaccurate image description. GPT-4V also misinterprets the image, but gives the correct answer.



**Image 1**: This is a central diagram showing a complex balance scale system with a total of seven individual scales arranged in a tree-like structure. At the top, there is a single scale labeled "BEN" with its fulcrum at the center and two pans hanging from either end. From each pan of this top scale, two additional scales are suspended, making a total of four scales on the second level. Each of these scales is also a balance with a fulcrum in the center and two pans hanging from either end. Each of these bottom scales is labeled "JIM" and has a fulcrum with two pans.

**Image 2**: This image shows five different answer choices, labeled (A) through (E), each depicting a simplified version of the balance scale system from Image 1. Each choice shows a different configuration of the scales, with varying numbers of connections and arrangements.

(A) shows a central scale labeled "JIM" with three scales hanging from its left pan and two scales hanging from its right pan. (B) shows a central scale labeled "JIM" with two scales hanging from each pan. (C) shows a central scale labeled "JIM" with three scales hanging from its left pan and three scales hanging from its right pan. (D) shows a central scale labeled "JIM" with four scales hanging from its left pan and one scale hanging from its right pan. (E) shows a central scale labeled "JIM" with right pan. (E) shows a central scale labeled "JIM" with four scales hanging from its left pan and one scale hanging from its right pan. (E) shows a central scale labeled "JIM" with one scale hanging from its left pan and four scales hanging from its right pan.

#### **GPT4** Answer:

To solve this problem, we need to understand the relationship between Jim and Ben in the context of the balance scale system and then apply this understanding to the ferris wheel scenario.

From Image 1, we know that: The top scale is labeled "BEN". There are seven individual scales arranged in a tree-like structure. Each "JIM" scale is at the bottom level of this structure.

...Given the information and the nature of the question, the solution focuses on understanding the relative movement and positions of Jim and Ben in a ferris wheel, drawing an analogy from the balance scale system. Without a direct question linking the ferris wheel scenario to the choices (A) through (E), the final answer is conceptual: **Jim is now in the position where Ben was beforehand.** 

#### **GPT-4V Answer:**

To solve the problem we need to imagine the Ferris wheel rotating until Ben reaches Jim's initial position. In the original image, if we assume the Ferris wheel is rotating clockwise, Ben will have to move **three quarters** of a full turn to get to Jim's original position.

Given that the wheel has **eight spokes** and thus divides the circle into equal parts, moving three-quarters means Jim will move six parts out from his original position if Ben moves into Jim's original spot. So, Jim will be on the opposite side of the wheel, in the bottom position.

Looking at the provided answer choices in image2, C represents the position where Jim would be if the wheel rotates three quarters of a turn clockwise, with Ben taking Jim's original spot.

Figure 58: An example of transformation geometry question of GPT-4 with image caption. The model fails to solve the problem because of the inaccurate image description. GPT-4V also misinterprets the image, but gives the correct answer.

# **Example of Descriptive Geometry**

**Question:** Five equally big square pieces of card are placed on a table on top of each other. The picture on the side is created this way. The cards are collected up from top to bottom. In which order are they collected? (A) 5-4-3-2-1 (B) 5-2-3-4-1 (C) 5-4-2-3-1 (D) 5-3-2-1-4 (E) 5-2-3-1-4

**Ground Truth:** E

## **GPT4V Image Caption:**



The diagram shows a composite rectangular figure made up of five smaller rectangles, each labeled with a number from 1 to 5. The overall shape is a larger rectangle. 1. Rectangle 1 is in the top left corner. **It is a vertical rectangle.** 2. Rectangle 2 is below Rectangle 1. It is a larger vertical rectangle, taking up the entire left side of the larger rectangle. 3. Rectangle 3 is in the center, bordering the right side of Rectangle 1 and the top side of Rectangle 2. It is a horizontal rectangle. . Rectangle 4 is a small square that is placed to the right of Rectangle 1 and above Rectangle 3. 5. Rectangle 5 is a large square that occupies the bottom right corner of the larger rectangle. It borders the right side of Rectangle 2 and the bottom side of Rectangle 3 and Rectangle 4. The rectangles are shaded in different shades of gray, possibly to distinguish them from one another. The numbers are placed in the center of each corresponding rectangle. The arrangement of the rectangles suggests that the dimensions of some could be inferred if the dimensions of others are known, which is a common setup for problems involving area and perimeter.

#### **GPT4** Answer:

To solve this problem, we need to determine the order in which the cards (represented as rectangles in the description) are collected based on their arrangement in the composite figure. The key is to understand that the card on top in the figure will be the last one collected, and the card at the bottom will be the first one collected, as they are collected from top to bottom. 1. \*\*Rectangle 5\*\* is the large square at the bottom right corner. It does not lie underneath any other rectangle, meaning it is on top of all others in its area. Thus, it will be the last one collected. 2. \*\*Rectangle 4\*\* is the small square to the right of Rectangle 1 and above Rectangle 3. Since it lies on top of Rectangle 3 and does not have any other rectangles on top of it, it will be collected before Rectangle 5 but after the rectangles it covers (Rectangles 1 and 3).

Therefore, the order in which the cards are collected from top to bottom is: 5, 4, 3, 1, 2

#### **GPT-4V Answer:**

.....

To solve the problem, we look at which cards are on top of others. To collect the cards from top to bottom as described, we should look for the one that is not covered by any other card, then the next, and so on. Starting from the top, we can see that card 5 is at the bottom, as all other cards are on top of it in some part. Next, we see that card 2 is on top of card 5 but underneath cards 1 and 3. Then, card 3 is on top of both cards 2 and 5 but below cards 1 and 4. Card 4 is only underneath card 1. Finally, card 1 is at the top with no cards above it.

Therefore, the correct sequence of collecting the cards from top to bottom is represented by option (E), when we reverse that sequence (since they are collected from top to bottom): 4-1-3-2-5. So the answer is:  $\boxed{E}$ 

Figure 59: An example of descriptive geometry question of GPT-4 with image caption. The models fail to correctly interpret the spacial relationships between the cards.

#### **Example of Logic**

**Question:** Maria wants to write whole numbers in the squares of the figure, so that the sum of the numbers in three consecutive squares is always 10. She has already written a number. What number should she write on the gray square?

# **Ground Truth:** 2

# **GPT4V Image Caption:**

The diagram shows a horizontal rectangular bar divided into five equal-sized squares. The bar has a border around it, giving it the appearance of a single entity with internal divisions. The first square on the left is filled with the number 2 in a bold font. The second square is empty, the third square is shaded in a solid color, and the fourth and fifth squares are empty. The shaded square suggests it may have a particular significance in the context of the math problem, such as representing a specific value or condition that needs to be determined. The sequence and the values in the squares are likely part of the problem that needs to be solved. **GPT4 Answer:** 

2

# To solve this problem, let's denote the numbers in the squares from left to right as a, b, c, d, and e. According to the description, a = 2, and c is the number in the gray square that we need to find. We are given that the sum of the numbers in any three consecutive squares is always 10. Given this, we can set up equations based on the sums of three consecutive squares: 1. a + b + c = 10 2. b + c + d = 10 3. c + d + e = 10 We know that a = 2, so we can substitute this into the first equation to find b + c: 1. 2 + b + c = 10 2. b + c = 8 However, we need to find c, and we don't have direct values for b, d, or e. But we can notice that since the sum of any three consecutive numbers is 10, and a = 2, the only way to satisfy these conditions is to ensure that the sequence allows for this constant sum across any three consecutive squares. Given 2 + b + c = 10, we have b + c = 8.

Given the constraints and the aim to solve for c, the approach taken highlights the need for either a specific pattern to follow or additional given numbers in the sequence to directly calculate c's value, pointing towards a limitation in the direct calculation method

#### **GPT-4V Answer:**

Let's assign variables to represent the numbers in each of the squares:

$$\begin{array}{|c|c|c|c|}\hline 2 & a & b & c & d \\ \hline \end{array}$$

Given that the sum of the numbers in three consecutive squares is always 10, we can create the following equations:

$$\begin{cases} 2+a+b = 10 \\ a+b+c = 10 \\ b+c+d = 10 \end{cases}$$

We can solve these equations successively. From the first equation: a + b = 10 - 2a + b = 8 Now, we don't have enough information to solve for a or b individually, but we don't need to because we can use the second equation to find c (which is related to the grey square): a + b + c = 10 Substitute a + b = 8 into the second equation: 8 + c = 10c = 10 - 8 c = 2 So, the number that should be written on the grey square is 2.

Figure 60: An example of logic question of GPT-4 with image caption. GPT-4 fails to correctly find all the necessary equations and does not reach an answer. GPT-4V correctly solves the problems.

#### **Example of Metric Geometry**

**Question:** A circle K is inscribed in a quarter circle with radius 6 as shown in the figure. What is the radius of circle *K*? (A)  $\frac{6-\sqrt{2}}{2}$  (B)  $\frac{3\sqrt{2}}{2}$  (C) 2.5 (D) 3 (E)  $6(\sqrt{2}-1)$ Ground Truth: E



#### **GPT4V Image Caption:**

The diagram shows a large circle with a smaller circle inside it. The smaller circle is tangent to the larger circle at a single point on the larger circle's interior. The smaller circle is labeled with the letter K. The space between the two circles forms a crescent shape. The larger circle appears to be a boundary that encloses the smaller circle, and there is no indication of any dimensions, angles, or other geometric properties.

#### **GPT4 Answer:**

To solve this problem, let's denote the radius of the smaller circle (circle K) as r. Since circle K is inscribed within a quarter circle of radius 6, we can visualize or draw a diagram where the quarter circle's radius forms a right-angled triangle with the sides being the radius of the quarter circle, the radius of circle K, and the distance from the point where circle K touches the quarter circle's arc to the corner of the quarter circle (the center of the quarter circle). The distance from the center of circle K to the corner of the quarter circle is r, and the distance from the corner of the quarter circle to the point where circle K touches the quarter circle's arc is also r. Therefore, the hypotenuse of the right-angled triangle formed (which is also the radius of the quarter circle) is 6 units. Using the Pythagorean theorem, we can set up the equation: r + r = 2r (this is the base and the height of the right-angled triangle, both equal to the diameter of circle K since it touches both the arc and the two straight sides of the quarter circle). The hypotenuse (the radius of the quarter circle) is 6 units, so:  $(2r)^2 + (2r)^2 = 6^2$ 

Therefore, the radius of circle K is  $\left| \frac{3\sqrt{2}}{2} \right|$  units.

#### **GPT-4V Answer:**

.....

To solve this problem, we need to use geometric relationships within the quarter circle and the inscribed circle K. Consider a quarter circle of radius 6. If we inscribe a circle K inside it, such that K is tangent to the two sides and the arc of the quarter circle, there will be two points of tangency on the sides of the quarter circle which are at a distance equal to the radius of K from the corners of the quarter circle. Let's denote the radius of circle K as r. Since circle K is tangent to the two sides, we know that the distance from the center of K to each side is equal to r, the radius of K. This means there will be a square of side r formed between the center of circle K and the two sides of the quarter circle. The remaining section between the edge of this square and the quarter circle will be a right-angled isosceles triangle with sides of length 6 - r (since the quarter circle has a radius of 6). The hypotenuse of this right-angled isosceles triangle will be the radius of the quarter circle, which is 6. Using the Pythagorean theorem, we get:  $(6-r)^2 + (6-r)^2 = 6^2$ 

so our answer is: E

Figure 61: An example of metric geometry question of GPT-4 with image caption. GPT-4 fails to find the correct relationship between the variables. GPT-4V correctly solves the problems.