

## **The Trust Divide: Chatbots' Superior Performance and Skeptical Students**

<sup>2</sup>Martin Laun, <sup>3</sup>Katharina Hirt, <sup>3</sup>Eva L. Wyss, and <sup>1</sup>Fabian Wolff

<sup>1</sup>Department of Psychology, Bielefeld University, Bielefeld, Germany

<sup>2</sup>Department of Psychology, Koblenz University, Koblenz, Germany

<sup>3</sup>Department of German Studies, Koblenz University, Koblenz, Germany

### **Author Note**

Martin Laun <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6735-731X>

Katharina Hirt <https://orcid.org/0009-0000-7078-1840>

Eva L. Wyss <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9270-2522>

Fabian Wolff <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6816-4317>

We have no conflicts of interest to disclose. Our research was funded by Grant 16DHBKI039 from the German Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF). Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Martin Laun, Department of Psychology, Koblenz University, Universitätstraße 1, 56068 Koblenz, Germany. Email: [laun@uni-koblenz.de](mailto:laun@uni-koblenz.de).

### **Abstract**

Chatbots have emerged as fundamental components of innovative teaching approaches to address the significant challenge of catering to students' diverse learning backgrounds with limited resources (Kabudi et al., 2021; Lazarides & Chevalère, 2021; Zhang & Aslan, 2021). However, their usefulness depends on their ability to provide high-quality, reliable outcomes and create trustworthiness (Kaplan et al., 2021; Miller, 2015; Nadarzynski et al., 2019; Przegalinska et al., 2019). Against this background, the present study investigated the trustworthiness of chatbots in supporting educational tasks and the extent to which this trustworthiness is justified. The study involved 189 students from vocational nursing schools who created medical care plans with and without the support of ChatGPT (GPT-4). Additionally, ChatGPT was asked to solve the tasks without students being involved. Experts then evaluated all three sets of plans. This allowed us to compare the quality of the answers solved by the chatbot to the solutions by the students. To examine the trustworthiness of the chatbot, another independent care plan was evaluated by the students following experimentally manipulated feedback that it was created either by a human or a chatbot. Statistical analyses revealed that students' beliefs about the source of the care plan -explicitly informed as either chatbot-generated or human-created- significantly affected their perceptions of trustworthiness. Students who believed a chatbot solved the task perceived it as less trustworthy than those who thought a human created the plan. However, analyses of the expert ratings revealed that the solutions created by the chatbot were actually of higher quality than those created by humans. Therefore, the mistrust in the chatbots was not justified. This finding suggests an underestimation of chatbot performance in educational settings by students.

*Keywords:* chatbots, trustworthiness, quality, educational psychology, human computer interaction

### References

Kabudi, T., Pappas, I., & Olsen, D. H. (2021). AI-enabled adaptive learning systems: A systematic mapping of the literature. *Computers and Education: Artificial Intelligence*, 2, 100017.

Kaplan, A. D., Kessler, T. T., Brill, J. C., & Hancock, P. A. (2023). Trust in artificial intelligence: Meta-analytic findings. *Human factors*, 65(2), 337-359.

Lazarides, R., & Chevalère, J. (2021). Artificial intelligence and education: Addressing the variability in learners' emotion and motivation with adaptive teaching assistants. *Bildung und Erziehung*, 74(3), 264-279.

Miller, E. E. P. (2015). *Trust in people and trust in technology: Expanding interpersonal trust to technology-mediated interactions*. University of South Florida.

Nadarzynski, T., Miles, O., Cowie, A., & Ridge, D. (2019). Acceptability of artificial intelligence (AI)-led chatbot services in healthcare: A mixed-methods study. *Digital health*, 5, 2055207619871808.

Przegalinska, A., Ciechanowski, L., Stroz, A., Gloor, P., & Mazurek, G. (2019). In bot we trust: A new methodology of chatbot performance measures. *Business Horizons*, 62(6), 785-797.

Zhang, K., & Aslan, A. B. (2021). AI technologies for education: Recent research & future directions. *Computers and Education: Artificial Intelligence*, 2, 100025.