# <u>Crafting Global Optimizers to Reasoning Tasks via</u> Algebraic Objects in Neural Nets

# **Anonymous Author(s)**

# Abstract

We prove rich algebraic structures of the solution space for 2-layer neural net-1 works with quadratic activation and  $L_2$  loss, trained on reasoning tasks in Abelian 2 group (e.g., modular addition). Such a rich structure enables us to analytically 3 construct the global optimal solutions to the task from partial solutions that only 4 satisfy part of the loss, despite its high nonlinearity. Specifically, we show that 5 the union-ed solution space of different number of hidden nodes of the 2-layer 6 network is endowed with a semi-ring algebraic structure, and the loss function to 7 be optimized consists of monomial potentials which are ring homomorphism, al-8 9 lowing composition of partial solutions by ring addition and multiplication. While the constructed global optimizers only require small number of hidden nodes, we 10 show that overparameterization asymptotically decouples the training dynamics 11 and thus is beneficial. We further show that training dynamics move towards sim-12 pler solutions under regularization, by proving that global optimizers algebraically 13 connected by ring multiplication are also topologically connected. Experiments 14 verify our theoretical findings. 15

# 16 **1 Introduction**

Large Language Models (LLMs) have shown impressive results in various disciplines [18, 1, 22, 4, 5, 17 11], while they also make surprising mistakes in basic reasoning tasks [17, 2]. Therefore, it remains 18 an open problem whether it can truly do reasoning tasks. On one hand, existing works demonstrate 19 that the models can learn efficient algorithm (e.g., dynamic programming [27] for language structure 20 modeling, gradient descent [24] for linear regressions, etc) and good representations [12]. Some 21 reports emergent behaviors [25] when scaling up with data and model size. On the other hand, many 22 works also show that LLMs cannot self-correct [9], and cannot generalize very well beyond the 23 training set for simple tasks [6, 28, 19], let alone complicated planning [13, 26]. 24

To understand how the model performs reasoning and further improve its reasoning power, people have been studying simple arithmetic reasoning problems in depth. Modular addition [16, 29], i.e., predicting  $a + b \mod d$  given a and b, is a popular one due to its simple and intuitive structure yet surprising behaviors in learning dynamics (e.g., grokking [20]) and learned representations (e.g., Fourier bases [30]). Most works focus on various metrics to measure the behaviors and extracting interpretable circuits from trained models [16, 23, 10]. Analytic solutions can be constructed and/or reverse-engineered [8, 29, 16] but it is not clear how to generalize the results.

In this work, we systematically analyze 2-layer neural networks with quadratic activation and  $L_2$  loss on predicting group multiplication in Abelian group G, which is an extension of modular addition. We find that global optimizers can be constructed *algebraically* from small partial solutions that are

optimal only for parts of the loss. We achieve this by showing that (1) for the 2-layer network, there

exists a *semi-ring* structure over the set of solutions *across different order* (i.e., number of hidden nodes or network width), with specifically defined addition and multiplication (Def. 3), and (2) the

Submitted to NeurIPS 2024 Workshop on Compositional Learning: Perspectives, Methods, and Paths Forward. Do not distribute.



Figure 1: Overview of proposed theoretical framework CaGO. (1) The family of 1-hidden layer neural networks, Z, form a *semi-ring* algebraic structure ring addition and multiplication (Theorem 2).  $Z = \bigcup_{q\geq 0} Z_q$ where  $Z_q$  is a collection of all weights (solutions) with order-q (i.e., q hidden nodes). (2) For Abelian reasoning task, the MSE loss  $\ell(z)$  is a function of *monomial potentials* (MPs)  $r_{k_1k_2k}(z)$  and  $r_{pmk'k}(z)$  (Theorem 1), which are ring homomorphism (Theorem 3). (3) Thanks to the property of ring homomorphism, global optimizers to MSE loss  $\ell(z)$  with quadratic activation can be constructed *algebraically* from partial solutions that only satisfy a subset of constraints (Sec. A.1) using ring addition and multiplication, instead of running gradient descent. Examples include Fourier solution  $z_{F6}$  (Corollary 2) and perfect memorization solution  $z_M$ (Corollary 4). In Sec. B, we analyze the role played of MPs in gradient dynamics, showing that the dynamics favors low-order global optimizers (Theorem 5) under weight decay regularization, and the dynamics of MPs become decoupled with infinite width (Theorem 6).

 $_{28}$   $L_2$  loss is a function of *monomial potentials* (MPs), which are ring homomorphisms (Theorem 1) that allow compositions of partial solutions into global ones using ring addition and multiplication.

As a result, our theoretical framework, named CaGO (i.e., <u>*Crafting Global Optimizers*</u>), successfully constructs two distinct types of Fourier-based solutions of per-frequency order 4 (=  $2 \times 2$ ) and order 6 (=  $2 \times 3$ ) that is global optimal, which are verified in the experiments, and global optimal solutions of order  $d^2$  that correspond to perfect memorization. To our best knowledge, we are the first to discover such algebraic structures inside network training, and apply it to analyze solutions to reasoning tasks such as modular additions in details.

In addition, we also analyze the training dynamics of MPs. We show that the dynamics favors
 low-order solutions and perfect memorization is unfavorable in the dynamics, and the MP dynamics
 becomes decoupled when the network width goes to infinite, demystifying why overparameteriza tion improves the performance.

Most Related work. Existing theoretical work [15] also shows group-theoretical results on algebraic tasks related to finite groups, also for networks with one-hidden layers and quadratic activations. However, they use the max-margin framework with a special regularization ( $L_{2,3}$  norm) rather than MSE loss, do not characterize and leverage algebraic structures to construct solutions, and do not analyze the training dynamics.

# <sup>55</sup> 2 Decoupling $L_2$ Loss in reasoning tasks of Abelian group

For **Problem Setup**. We consider the following 2-layer networks with one layer of hidden nodes, trained with (projected)  $\ell_2$  loss on prediction of group multiplication in Abelian group G with |G| = d:

$$\ell = \sum_{i} \|P_1^{\perp}(\boldsymbol{o}[i] - l[i])\|^2, \qquad \boldsymbol{o}[i] = V\sigma(W^{\top}\boldsymbol{f}[i]) = \sum_{j} \boldsymbol{v}_j \sigma(\mathbf{w}_j^{\top}\boldsymbol{f}[i])$$
(1)

where  $\sigma(x) = x^2$  is the quadratic activation function,  $P_1^{\perp} = I - \frac{1}{d} \mathbf{1} \mathbf{1}^{\top}$  is the zero-mean projection matrix,  $W = [\mathbf{w}_1, \dots, \mathbf{w}_q] \in \mathbb{R}^{d \times q}$ ,  $V = [v_1, \dots, v_q]^{\top} \in \mathbb{R}^{d \times q}$  are learnable parameters.  $\mathbf{f}[i] \in \mathbb{R}^d$  are input embeddings. i is the sample index. Input and Output. The input contains the two group elements  $g_1[i]$  and  $g_2[i]$ , encoded as  $f[i] = U_{G_1} e_{g_1[i]} + U_{G_2} e_{g_2[i]}$ , where  $U_{G_1}$  and  $U_{G_2}$  are column orthogonal embedding matrices. The output is the result  $a_1[i] = a_2[i] a_2[i] = a_2[i] a_2[i]$ .

is the result  $g_1[i]g_2[i] \in G$ , encoded as the label  $l[i] = g_1[i]g_2[i]$  to be predicted.

Let  $\phi_k = [\phi_k(g)]_{g \in G} \in \mathbb{C}^d$  be the scaled Fourier bases (or more formally, *character function* of the finite Abelian group *G*, see Appendix D). Then weight vector  $\mathbf{w}_j$  and  $v_j$  can be written as:

$$\mathbf{w}_j = U_{G_1} \sum_{k \neq 0} z_{akj} \phi_k + U_{G_2} \sum_{k \neq 0} z_{bkj} \phi_k, \qquad \mathbf{v}_j = \sum_{k \neq 0} z_{ckj} \bar{\phi}_k \tag{2}$$

where  $z := \{z_{pkj}\}$  are the complex coefficients  $(p \in \{a, b, c\}, 0 \le k < d \text{ and } j \text{ runs through}$ hidden nodes). Leveraging the property of quadratic activation functions, we can write down the loss function analytically (see Appendix D):

<sup>69</sup> **Theorem 1** (Analytic form of  $L_2$  loss with quadratic activation). The objective of 2-layer MLP <sup>70</sup> network with quadratic activation can be written as  $\ell = \sum_{k \neq 0} \ell_k + (d-1)/d$ , where

$$\ell_k = -4r_{kkk} + 4d\sum_{k_1k_2} |r_{k_1k_2k}|^2 + d\left|\sum_{p \in \{a,b\}} \sum_{k'} r_{p0k'k}\right|^2 + d\sum_{m \neq 0} \sum_{p \in \{a,b\}} \left|\sum_{k'} r_{pmk'k}\right|^2 (3)$$

71 Here  $r_{k_1k_2k} := \sum_j z_{ak_1j} z_{bk_2j} z_{ckj}$  and  $r_{pmk'k} := \sum_j z_{pk'j} z_{p,m-k',j} z_{ckj}$ .

Note that for cyclic group *G*, the frequency *k* is a mod-*d* integer. For general Abelian group which can be decomposed into direct sum of cyclic groups according to Fundamental Theorem of Finite Abelian Groups, *k* is a multidimensional frequency index. For convenience, we define  $\phi_{-k} := \overline{\phi}_k$ as the conjugate representation of  $\phi_k$ . The reason why  $\phi_0 \equiv 1$  is excluded is that the constant bias term has been filtered out by the top-down gradient from the loss function. Since weights are all real, the Hermitian constraints holds, i.e.,  $\overline{z_{ckj}} = \overline{\phi}_k^* v_j = \phi_{-k}^* v_j = z_{c,-k,j}$  (and similar for  $z_{akj}$ and  $z_{bkj}$ ). Therefore,  $z_{p,-k,j} = \overline{z}_{pkj}$ ,  $r_{-k,-k,-k} = \overline{r}_{kkk}$  and  $\ell$  is real and can be minimized. **Lemma 1** (A Sufficient Conditions of Global optimizers of Eqn. 3). If a solution *z* to Eqn. 3 satisfies

<sup>79</sup> **Lemma 1** (A Sufficient Conditions of Global optimizers of Eqn. 3). If a solution z to Eqn. 3 satisfies <sup>80</sup> the following, then it is a global optimizer with zero loss  $\ell(z) = 0$ .

$$r_{kkk}(\mathbf{z}) = \mathbb{I}(k \neq 0)/2d, \quad r_{k_1k_2k}(\mathbf{z}) = 0, \quad r_{pmk'k}(\mathbf{z}) = 0$$
 (4)

Lemma 1 provides a *sufficient* condition since there may exist other solutions that achieve global optimum (e.g.,  $\sum_{k'} r_{pmk'k} = 0$ ). It turns out Eqn. 4 already leads to very rich algebraic structures and we will not discuss more broader cases in this work.

# **3** Beyond Fixed Parameter Space: The Semi-ring structure

We define the *solution space*  $Z_q = \{z\}$  to include all the weight matrices with q hidden nodes ( $Z_0$ means an empty network). Let  $Z = \bigcup_{q \ge 0} Z_q$  be the solution space of all different number of hidden nodes. For clarity, we use bold symbol z to represent the collection of all its components  $\{z_{pkj}\}$ , and  $z_1 := \{z_{pkj}^{(1)}\}$  and  $z_2 := \{z_{pkj}^{(2)}\}$  represent two solutions.

<sup>89</sup> Directly finding the global optimizers to Eqn. 4 can be a bit complicated and highly non-intuitive. <sup>90</sup> Interestingly, the  $\mathcal{Z}$  naturally has an algebraic (semi-ring) structure, and global optimizers can be <sup>91</sup> composited from non-optimal ones that only satisfies a subset of terms of the loss! Both the Fourier <sup>92</sup> bases solution and the perfect memorization solution can be represented this way.

Definition 1 (Order of z). The order  $\operatorname{ord}(z)$  of  $z \in Z$  is its number of hidden nodes.

94 **Definition 2** (Identification of Z). In Z, two solutions of the same order that differ only by a per-95 mutation along hidden dimension j are considered identical.

Note that for any two solutions  $z_1, z_2 \in \mathbb{Z}$ , we can define their operations:

**Definition 3** (Addition and Multiplication in Z). Define  $z = z_1 + z_2$  in which  $z_{pk.} := z_1 + z_2$  in which  $z_{pk.} := z_{pk.}^{(1)} \otimes z_{pk.}^{(2)}$  and  $z = z_1 * z_2$ , in which  $z_{pk.} := z_{pk.}^{(1)} \otimes z_{pk.}^{(2)}$ . The addition and multiplication respect Hermitian and the identity element **1** is the 1-order solutions with  $\{z_{pk0} = 1\}$ .

Note that the multiplication definition is one special case of Khatri–Rao product [14]. Although the Kronocker product and concatenation are not commutative, thanks to the identification (Def. 2),  $z_1 + z_2 = z_2 + z_1$  and  $z_1 * z_2 = z_2 * z_1$  and thus both operations are commutative. Then:



Figure 2: Solutions obtained by the Adam optimizers on  $\ell_2$  loss for modular addition task with |G| = d = 7and q = 20 hidden nodes. **Top:** For each frequency  $\pm k$ , there are exactly 6 hidden nodes representing such a frequency, consistent with Corollary 2. **Bottom:** Optimizing Eqn. 3 without the last term  $\sum_{m \neq 0} \sum_{p \in \{a,b\}} \left| \sum_{k'} r_{pmk'k} \right|^2$  (equivalently removing the constraint  $R_{\circledast}$ ). Now each frequency has exactly 3 hidden nodes, which is also consistent with our analysis (Lemma 2).

- 103 **Theorem 2** (Algebraic Structure of Z).  $\langle Z, +, * \rangle$  is a commutative semi-ring.
- In the following sections, the semi-ring structure of  $\mathcal{Z}$  paves the way to construct explicitly the global optimal solutions for our  $\ell_2$  objectives.
- Now let us study the structure of the loss function Eqn. 3 and how they are related to the semi-ring structure of  $\mathcal{Z}$ . For this, we first define the concept of *monomial potentials*:
- 108 **Definition 4** (Monomial potential (MP)). Define the monomial potential (MP) r(z) :=
- 109  $\sum_{j} \prod_{(p,k) \in idx(r)} z_{pkj}$  where idx(r) specifies the indices involved in the monomial terms.
- Following this definition, terms in the loss function (Theorem 1) are examples of MPs.
- 111 **Observation 1** (Specific MPs).  $r_{k_1k_2k}(z)$  and  $r_{pmk'k}(z)$  defined in Theorem 1 are MPs.
- So what is the relationship between MPs, which are parts of the loss function, and the semi-ring structure of  $\mathcal{Z}$ ? The following theorem tells that, MPs are ring homomorphism.
- **Theorem 3.** For any monomial potential  $r : \mathbb{Z} \mapsto \mathbb{C}$ , r(1) = 1,  $r(z_1 + z_2) = r(z_1) + r(z_2)$  and
- 115  $r(\boldsymbol{z}_1 * \boldsymbol{z}_2) = r(\boldsymbol{z}_1)r(\boldsymbol{z}_2)$  and thus r is a ring homomorphism.
- **Observation 2.** The order function  $\text{ord} : \mathcal{Z} \mapsto \mathbb{N}$  is also a ring homomorphism.
- <sup>117</sup> Due to the property of ring homomorphism, we immediatenly know that there exists infinitely many
- 118 global minimizers, via ring multiplication (Def. 3):
- **Definition 5** (Unit). z is called a unit if  $r_{kkk}(z) = 1$  for all  $k \neq 0$ .
- 120 **Corollary 1.** If z is a global optimizer and y is a unit, then z \* y is also a global optimizer.

More importantly, a global optimizer can be constructed from partial solutions that satisfy only some of the constraints. For example, if there exists  $z_1$  that satisfies constraint  $r_1(z_1) = 0$  and  $z_2$  that satisfies constraint  $r_2(z_2) = 0$ , then their product  $z_1 * z_2$  satisfy both constraints. In particular, we want such seed solutions to be small in order, so that the order of the final solutions is not too large.

# **125 4** Summary of the Appendix

In Appendix A, we show concrete solutions that are constructed following the semi-ring structure, including a per-frequency order-6 solution  $z_{F6}$  (Corollary 2), a order-4 solution  $z_{F4}$  (Corollary 3) and the perfect memorization solution  $z_M$  (Corollary 4). If we remove the last term in  $\ell_2$  loss, then there will be order-3 solution (Lemma 2), as shown in Fig. 2.

We also provide gradient dynamics analysis in Appendix B that shows that the inductive bias in gradient descent prefers simpler global optimizers (Theorem 5) and overparameterization decouples gradient dynamics for each MP, and thus makes the training easier (Theorem 6). We also provide experiments to verify the claim.

# 134 **References**

- 135 [1] Anthropic. The claude 3 model family: Opus, sonnet, haiku.
- [2] Lukas Berglund, Meg Tong, Max Kaufmann, Mikita Balesni, Asa Cooper Stickland, Tomasz
   Korbak, and Owain Evans. The reversal curse: Llms trained on" a is b" fail to learn" b is a".
   *arXiv preprint arXiv:2309.12288*, 2023.
- [3] Keith Conrad. Characters of finite abelian groups. *Lecture Notes*, 17, 2010.

[4] DeepSeek-AI, Aixin Liu, Bei Feng, Bin Wang, Bingxuan Wang, Bo Liu, Chenggang Zhao, 140 Chengqi Dengr, Chong Ruan, Damai Dai, Daya Guo, Dejian Yang, Deli Chen, Dongjie Ji, 141 Erhang Li, Fangyun Lin, Fuli Luo, Guangbo Hao, Guanting Chen, Guowei Li, H. Zhang, 142 Hanwei Xu, Hao Yang, Haowei Zhang, Honghui Ding, Huajian Xin, Huazuo Gao, Hui Li, Hui 143 Qu, J. L. Cai, Jian Liang, Jianzhong Guo, Jiaqi Ni, Jiashi Li, Jin Chen, Jingyang Yuan, Junjie 144 Qiu, Junxiao Song, Kai Dong, Kaige Gao, Kang Guan, Lean Wang, Lecong Zhang, Lei Xu, 145 Leyi Xia, Liang Zhao, Liyue Zhang, Meng Li, Miaojun Wang, Mingchuan Zhang, Minghua 146 Zhang, Minghui Tang, Mingming Li, Ning Tian, Panpan Huang, Peiyi Wang, Peng Zhang, 147 Qihao Zhu, Qinyu Chen, Qiushi Du, R. J. Chen, R. L. Jin, Ruiqi Ge, Ruizhe Pan, Runxin 148 Xu, Ruyi Chen, S. S. Li, Shanghao Lu, Shangyan Zhou, Shanhuang Chen, Shaoqing Wu, 149 Shengfeng Ye, Shirong Ma, Shiyu Wang, Shuang Zhou, Shuiping Yu, Shunfeng Zhou, Size 150 Zheng, T. Wang, Tian Pei, Tian Yuan, Tianyu Sun, W. L. Xiao, Wangding Zeng, Wei An, Wen 151 Liu, Wenfeng Liang, Wenjun Gao, Wentao Zhang, X. Q. Li, Xiangyue Jin, Xianzu Wang, Xiao 152 Bi, Xiaodong Liu, Xiaohan Wang, Xiaojin Shen, Xiaokang Chen, Xiaosha Chen, Xiaotao Nie, 153 Xiaowen Sun, Xiaoxiang Wang, Xin Liu, Xin Xie, Xingkai Yu, Xinnan Song, Xinyi Zhou, 154 Xinyu Yang, Xuan Lu, Xuecheng Su, Y. Wu, Y. K. Li, Y. X. Wei, Y. X. Zhu, Yanhong Xu, 155 Yanping Huang, Yao Li, Yao Zhao, Yaofeng Sun, Yaohui Li, Yaohui Wang, Yi Zheng, Yichao 156 Zhang, Yiliang Xiong, Yilong Zhao, Ying He, Ying Tang, Yishi Piao, Yixin Dong, Yixuan Tan, 157 Yiyuan Liu, Yongji Wang, Yongqiang Guo, Yuchen Zhu, Yuduan Wang, Yuheng Zou, Yukun 158 Zha, Yunxian Ma, Yuting Yan, Yuxiang You, Yuxuan Liu, Z. Z. Ren, Zehui Ren, Zhangli Sha, 159 Zhe Fu, Zhen Huang, Zhen Zhang, Zhenda Xie, Zhewen Hao, Zhihong Shao, Zhiniu Wen, 160 Zhipeng Xu, Zhongyu Zhang, Zhuoshu Li, Zihan Wang, Zihui Gu, Zilin Li, and Ziwei Xie. 161 Deepseek-v2: A strong, economical, and efficient mixture-of-experts language model, 2024. 162

[5] Abhimanyu Dubey, Abhinav Jauhri, Abhinav Pandey, Abhishek Kadian, Ahmad Al-Dahle, 163 Aiesha Letman, Akhil Mathur, Alan Schelten, Amy Yang, Angela Fan, Anirudh Goyal, An-164 thony Hartshorn, Aobo Yang, Archi Mitra, Archie Sravankumar, Artem Korenev, Arthur 165 Hinsvark, Arun Rao, Aston Zhang, Aurelien Rodriguez, Austen Gregerson, Ava Spataru, 166 Baptiste Roziere, Bethany Biron, Binh Tang, Bobbie Chern, Charlotte Caucheteux, Chaya 167 Nayak, Chloe Bi, Chris Marra, Chris McConnell, Christian Keller, Christophe Touret, Chun-168 yang Wu, Corinne Wong, Cristian Canton Ferrer, Cyrus Nikolaidis, Damien Allonsius, Daniel 169 Song, Danielle Pintz, Danny Livshits, David Esiobu, Dhruv Choudhary, Dhruv Mahajan, 170 Diego Garcia-Olano, Diego Perino, Dieuwke Hupkes, Egor Lakomkin, Ehab AlBadawy, Elina 171 Lobanova, Emily Dinan, Eric Michael Smith, Filip Radenovic, Frank Zhang, Gabriel Syn-172 173 naeve, Gabrielle Lee, Georgia Lewis Anderson, Graeme Nail, Gregoire Mialon, Guan Pang, Guillem Cucurell, Hailey Nguyen, Hannah Korevaar, Hu Xu, Hugo Touvron, Iliyan Zarov, 174 Imanol Arrieta Ibarra, Isabel Kloumann, Ishan Misra, Ivan Evtimov, Jade Copet, Jaewon Lee, 175 Jan Geffert, Jana Vranes, Jason Park, Jay Mahadeokar, Jeet Shah, Jelmer van der Linde, Jen-176 nifer Billock, Jenny Hong, Jenya Lee, Jeremy Fu, Jianfeng Chi, Jianyu Huang, Jiawen Liu, Jie 177 Wang, Jiecao Yu, Joanna Bitton, Joe Spisak, Jongsoo Park, Joseph Rocca, Joshua Johnstun, 178 Joshua Saxe, Junteng Jia, Kalyan Vasuden Alwala, Kartikeya Upasani, Kate Plawiak, Ke Li, 179 Kenneth Heafield, Kevin Stone, Khalid El-Arini, Krithika Iyer, Kshitiz Malik, Kuenley Chiu, 180 Kunal Bhalla, Lauren Rantala-Yeary, Laurens van der Maaten, Lawrence Chen, Liang Tan, 181 Liz Jenkins, Louis Martin, Lovish Madaan, Lubo Malo, Lukas Blecher, Lukas Landzaat, Luke 182 de Oliveira, Madeline Muzzi, Mahesh Pasupuleti, Mannat Singh, Manohar Paluri, Marcin Kar-183 das, Mathew Oldham, Mathieu Rita, Maya Payloya, Melanie Kambadur, Mike Lewis, Min Si, 184 Mitesh Kumar Singh, Mona Hassan, Naman Goyal, Narjes Torabi, Nikolay Bashlykov, Niko-185 lay Bogoychev, Niladri Chatterji, Olivier Duchenne, Onur Celebi, Patrick Alrassy, Pengchuan 186 Zhang, Pengwei Li, Petar Vasic, Peter Weng, Prajjwal Bhargava, Pratik Dubal, Praveen Kr-187 ishnan, Punit Singh Koura, Puxin Xu, Qing He, Qingxiao Dong, Ragavan Srinivasan, Raj 188

Ganapathy, Ramon Calderer, Ricardo Silveira Cabral, Robert Stojnic, Roberta Raileanu, Ro-189 hit Girdhar, Rohit Patel, Romain Sauvestre, Ronnie Polidoro, Roshan Sumbaly, Ross Taylor, 190 Ruan Silva, Rui Hou, Rui Wang, Saghar Hosseini, Sahana Chennabasappa, Sanjay Singh, 191 Sean Bell, Seohyun Sonia Kim, Sergey Edunov, Shaoliang Nie, Sharan Narang, Sharath Ra-192 parthy, Sheng Shen, Shengye Wan, Shruti Bhosale, Shun Zhang, Simon Vandenhende, Soumya 193 Batra, Spencer Whitman, Sten Sootla, Stephane Collot, Suchin Gururangan, Sydney Borodin-194 sky, Tamar Herman, Tara Fowler, Tarek Sheasha, Thomas Georgiou, Thomas Scialom, Tobias 195 Speckbacher, Todor Mihaylov, Tong Xiao, Ujjwal Karn, Vedanuj Goswami, Vibhor Gupta, 196 Vignesh Ramanathan, Viktor Kerkez, Vincent Gonguet, Virginie Do, Vish Vogeti, Vladan 197 Petrovic, Weiwei Chu, Wenhan Xiong, Wenyin Fu, Whitney Meers, Xavier Martinet, Xi-198 aodong Wang, Xiaoqing Ellen Tan, Xinfeng Xie, Xuchao Jia, Xuewei Wang, Yaelle Gold-199 schlag, Yashesh Gaur, Yasmine Babaei, Yi Wen, Yiwen Song, Yuchen Zhang, Yue Li, Yun-200 ing Mao, Zacharie Delpierre Coudert, Zheng Yan, Zhengxing Chen, Zoe Papakipos, Aaditya 201 Singh, Aaron Grattafiori, Abha Jain, Adam Kelsey, Adam Shajnfeld, Adithya Gangidi, Adolfo 202 Victoria, Ahuva Goldstand, Ajay Menon, Ajay Sharma, Alex Boesenberg, Alex Vaughan, 203 Alexei Baevski, Allie Feinstein, Amanda Kallet, Amit Sangani, Anam Yunus, Andrei Lupu, 204 Andres Alvarado, Andrew Caples, Andrew Gu, Andrew Ho, Andrew Poulton, Andrew Ryan, 205 Ankit Ramchandani, Annie Franco, Aparajita Saraf, Arkabandhu Chowdhury, Ashley Gabriel, 206 Ashwin Bharambe, Assaf Eisenman, Azadeh Yazdan, Beau James, Ben Maurer, Benjamin 207 Leonhardi, Bernie Huang, Beth Loyd, Beto De Paola, Bhargavi Paranjape, Bing Liu, Bo Wu, 208 Boyu Ni, Braden Hancock, Bram Wasti, Brandon Spence, Brani Stojkovic, Brian Gamido, 209 Britt Montalvo, Carl Parker, Carly Burton, Catalina Mejia, Changhan Wang, Changkyu Kim, 210 Chao Zhou, Chester Hu, Ching-Hsiang Chu, Chris Cai, Chris Tindal, Christoph Feichtenhofer, 211 Damon Civin, Dana Beaty, Daniel Kreymer, Daniel Li, Danny Wyatt, David Adkins, David 212 Xu, Davide Testuggine, Delia David, Devi Parikh, Diana Liskovich, Didem Foss, Dingkang 213 Wang, Duc Le, Dustin Holland, Edward Dowling, Eissa Jamil, Elaine Montgomery, Eleonora 214 Presani, Emily Hahn, Emily Wood, Erik Brinkman, Esteban Arcaute, Evan Dunbar, Evan 215 Smothers, Fei Sun, Felix Kreuk, Feng Tian, Firat Ozgenel, Francesco Caggioni, Francisco 216 Guzmán, Frank Kanayet, Frank Seide, Gabriela Medina Florez, Gabriella Schwarz, Gada 217 Badeer, Georgia Swee, Gil Halpern, Govind Thattai, Grant Herman, Grigory Sizov, Guangyi, 218 Zhang, Guna Lakshminarayanan, Hamid Shojanazeri, Han Zou, Hannah Wang, Hanwen Zha, 219 Haroun Habeeb, Harrison Rudolph, Helen Suk, Henry Aspegren, Hunter Goldman, Ibrahim 220 Damlaj, Igor Molybog, Igor Tufanov, Irina-Elena Veliche, Itai Gat, Jake Weissman, James 221 Geboski, James Kohli, Japhet Asher, Jean-Baptiste Gaya, Jeff Marcus, Jeff Tang, Jennifer 222 Chan, Jenny Zhen, Jeremy Reizenstein, Jeremy Teboul, Jessica Zhong, Jian Jin, Jingyi Yang, 223 Joe Cummings, Jon Carvill, Jon Shepard, Jonathan McPhie, Jonathan Torres, Josh Ginsburg, 224 Junjie Wang, Kai Wu, Kam Hou U, Karan Saxena, Karthik Prasad, Kartikay Khandelwal, 225 226 Katayoun Zand, Kathy Matosich, Kaushik Veeraraghavan, Kelly Michelena, Keqian Li, Kun Huang, Kunal Chawla, Kushal Lakhotia, Kyle Huang, Lailin Chen, Lakshya Garg, Lavender 227 A, Leandro Silva, Lee Bell, Lei Zhang, Liangpeng Guo, Licheng Yu, Liron Moshkovich, Luca 228 Wehrstedt, Madian Khabsa, Manav Avalani, Manish Bhatt, Maria Tsimpoukelli, Martynas 229 Mankus, Matan Hasson, Matthew Lennie, Matthias Reso, Maxim Groshev, Maxim Naumov, 230 Maya Lathi, Meghan Keneally, Michael L. Seltzer, Michal Valko, Michelle Restrepo, Mihir Pa-231 tel, Mik Vyatskov, Mikayel Samvelyan, Mike Clark, Mike Macey, Mike Wang, Miquel Jubert 232 Hermoso, Mo Metanat, Mohammad Rastegari, Munish Bansal, Nandhini Santhanam, Natascha 233 Parks, Natasha White, Navyata Bawa, Nayan Singhal, Nick Egebo, Nicolas Usunier, Niko-234 lay Pavlovich Laptev, Ning Dong, Ning Zhang, Norman Cheng, Oleg Chernoguz, Olivia Hart, 235 Omkar Salpekar, Ozlem Kalinli, Parkin Kent, Parth Parekh, Paul Saab, Pavan Balaji, Pedro 236 Rittner, Philip Bontrager, Pierre Roux, Piotr Dollar, Polina Zvyagina, Prashant Ratanchan-237 dani, Pritish Yuvraj, Qian Liang, Rachad Alao, Rachel Rodriguez, Rafi Ayub, Raghotham 238 Murthy, Raghu Nayani, Rahul Mitra, Raymond Li, Rebekkah Hogan, Robin Battey, Rocky 239 Wang, Rohan Maheswari, Russ Howes, Ruty Rinott, Sai Jayesh Bondu, Samyak Datta, Sara 240 Chugh, Sara Hunt, Sargun Dhillon, Sasha Sidorov, Satadru Pan, Saurabh Verma, Seiji Ya-241 mamoto, Sharadh Ramaswamy, Shaun Lindsay, Shaun Lindsay, Sheng Feng, Shenghao Lin, 242 Shengxin Cindy Zha, Shiva Shankar, Shuqiang Zhang, Shuqiang Zhang, Sinong Wang, Sneha 243 Agarwal, Soji Sajuvigbe, Soumith Chintala, Stephanie Max, Stephen Chen, Steve Kehoe, Steve 244 Satterfield, Sudarshan Govindaprasad, Sumit Gupta, Sungmin Cho, Sunny Virk, Suraj Sub-245 ramanian, Sy Choudhury, Sydney Goldman, Tal Remez, Tamar Glaser, Tamara Best, Thilo 246 Kohler, Thomas Robinson, Tianhe Li, Tianjun Zhang, Tim Matthews, Timothy Chou, Tzook 247

- Shaked, Varun Vontimitta, Victoria Ajayi, Victoria Montanez, Vijai Mohan, Vinay Satish Kumar, Vishal Mangla, Vitor Albiero, Vlad Ionescu, Vlad Poenaru, Vlad Tiberiu Mihailescu,
  Vladimir Ivanov, Wei Li, Wenchen Wang, Wenwen Jiang, Wes Bouaziz, Will Constable, Xiaocheng Tang, Xiaofang Wang, Xiaojian Wu, Xiaolan Wang, Xide Xia, Xilun Wu, Xinbo
  Gao, Yanjun Chen, Ye Hu, Ye Jia, Ye Qi, Yenda Li, Yilin Zhang, Ying Zhang, Yossi Adi,
  Youngjin Nam, Yu, Wang, Yuchen Hao, Yundi Qian, Yuzi He, Zach Rait, Zachary DeVito, Zef
  Rosnbrick, Zhaoduo Wen, Zhenyu Yang, and Zhiwei Zhao. The Ilama 3 herd of models, 2024.
- [6] Nouha Dziri, Ximing Lu, Melanie Sclar, Xiang Lorraine Li, Liwei Jiang, Bill Yuchen Lin,
   Peter West, Chandra Bhagavatula, Ronan Le Bras, Jena D Hwang, et al. Faith and fate: Limits
   of transformers on compositionality (2023). *arXiv preprint arXiv:2305.18654*, 2023.
- [7] William Fulton and Joe Harris. *Representation theory: a first course*, volume 129. Springer
   Science & Business Media, 2013.
- [8] Andrey Gromov. Grokking modular arithmetic. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2301.02679*, 2023.
- [9] Jie Huang, Xinyun Chen, Swaroop Mishra, Huaixiu Steven Zheng, Adams Wei Yu, Xinying
   Song, and Denny Zhou. Large language models cannot self-correct reasoning yet. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2310.01798*, 2023.
- [10] Yufei Huang, Shengding Hu, Xu Han, Zhiyuan Liu, and Maosong Sun. Unified view of
   grokking, double descent and emergent abilities: A perspective from circuits competition.
   *arXiv preprint arXiv:2402.15175*, 2024.
- [11] Albert Q. Jiang, Alexandre Sablayrolles, Arthur Mensch, Chris Bamford, Devendra Singh
   Chaplot, Diego de las Casas, Florian Bressand, Gianna Lengyel, Guillaume Lample, Lucile
   Saulnier, Lélio Renard Lavaud, Marie-Anne Lachaux, Pierre Stock, Teven Le Scao, Thibaut
   Lavril, Thomas Wang, Timothée Lacroix, and William El Sayed. Mistral 7b, 2023.
- [12] Charles Jin and Martin Rinard. Emergent representations of program semantics in languagemodels trained on programs, 2024.
- [13] Subbarao Kambhampati, Karthik Valmeekam, Lin Guan, Mudit Verma, Kaya Stechly, Sid dhant Bhambri, Lucas Saldyt, and Anil Murthy. Llms can't plan, but can help planning in
   llm-modulo frameworks, 2024.
- [14] CG Khatri and C Radhakrishna Rao. Solutions to some functional equations and their applica tions to characterization of probability distributions. *Sankhyā: the Indian journal of statistics, series A*, pages 167–180, 1968.
- [15] Depen Morwani, Benjamin L Edelman, Costin-Andrei Oncescu, Rosie Zhao, and Sham
   Kakade. Feature emergence via margin maximization: case studies in algebraic tasks. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2311.07568*, 2023.
- [16] Neel Nanda, Lawrence Chan, Tom Lieberum, Jess Smith, and Jacob Steinhardt. Progress mea sures for grokking via mechanistic interpretability. In *The Eleventh International Conference on Learning Representations*, 2023.
- [17] Marianna Nezhurina, Lucia Cipolina-Kun, Mehdi Cherti, and Jenia Jitsev. Alice in wonder land: Simple tasks showing complete reasoning breakdown in state-of-the-art large language
   models, 2024.
- [18] OpenAI, Josh Achiam, Steven Adler, Sandhini Agarwal, Lama Ahmad, Ilge Akkaya, Floren-288 cia Leoni Aleman, Diogo Almeida, Janko Altenschmidt, Sam Altman, Shyamal Anadkat, Red 289 Avila, Igor Babuschkin, Suchir Balaji, Valerie Balcom, Paul Baltescu, Haiming Bao, Moham-290 mad Bavarian, Jeff Belgum, Irwan Bello, Jake Berdine, Gabriel Bernadett-Shapiro, Christo-291 pher Berner, Lenny Bogdonoff, Oleg Boiko, Madelaine Boyd, Anna-Luisa Brakman, Greg 292 Brockman, Tim Brooks, Miles Brundage, Kevin Button, Trevor Cai, Rosie Campbell, Andrew 293 Cann, Brittany Carey, Chelsea Carlson, Rory Carmichael, Brooke Chan, Che Chang, Fotis 294 Chantzis, Derek Chen, Sully Chen, Ruby Chen, Jason Chen, Mark Chen, Ben Chess, Chester 295 Cho, Casey Chu, Hyung Won Chung, Dave Cummings, Jeremiah Currier, Yunxing Dai, Cory 296 Decareaux, Thomas Degry, Noah Deutsch, Damien Deville, Arka Dhar, David Dohan, Steve 297

Dowling, Sheila Dunning, Adrien Ecoffet, Atty Eleti, Tyna Eloundou, David Farhi, Liam Fe-298 dus, Niko Felix, Simón Posada Fishman, Juston Forte, Isabella Fulford, Leo Gao, Elie Georges, 299 Christian Gibson, Vik Goel, Tarun Gogineni, Gabriel Goh, Rapha Gontijo-Lopes, Jonathan 300 Gordon, Morgan Grafstein, Scott Gray, Ryan Greene, Joshua Gross, Shixiang Shane Gu, Yufei 301 Guo, Chris Hallacy, Jesse Han, Jeff Harris, Yuchen He, Mike Heaton, Johannes Heidecke, 302 Chris Hesse, Alan Hickey, Wade Hickey, Peter Hoeschele, Brandon Houghton, Kenny Hsu, 303 Shengli Hu, Xin Hu, Joost Huizinga, Shantanu Jain, Shawn Jain, Joanne Jang, Angela Jiang, 304 Roger Jiang, Haozhun Jin, Denny Jin, Shino Jomoto, Billie Jonn, Heewoo Jun, Tomer Kaftan, 305 Łukasz Kaiser, Ali Kamali, Ingmar Kanitscheider, Nitish Shirish Keskar, Tabarak Khan, Logan 306 Kilpatrick, Jong Wook Kim, Christina Kim, Yongjik Kim, Jan Hendrik Kirchner, Jamie Kiros, 307 Matt Knight, Daniel Kokotajlo, Łukasz Kondraciuk, Andrew Kondrich, Aris Konstantinidis, 308 Kyle Kosic, Gretchen Krueger, Vishal Kuo, Michael Lampe, Ikai Lan, Teddy Lee, Jan Leike, 309 Jade Leung, Daniel Levy, Chak Ming Li, Rachel Lim, Molly Lin, Stephanie Lin, Mateusz 310 Litwin, Theresa Lopez, Ryan Lowe, Patricia Lue, Anna Makanju, Kim Malfacini, Sam Man-311 ning, Todor Markov, Yaniv Markovski, Bianca Martin, Katie Mayer, Andrew Mayne, Bob Mc-312 Grew, Scott Mayer McKinney, Christine McLeavey, Paul McMillan, Jake McNeil, David Med-313 ina, Aalok Mehta, Jacob Menick, Luke Metz, Andrey Mishchenko, Pamela Mishkin, Vinnie 314 Monaco, Evan Morikawa, Daniel Mossing, Tong Mu, Mira Murati, Oleg Murk, David Mély, 315 Ashvin Nair, Reiichiro Nakano, Rajeev Nayak, Arvind Neelakantan, Richard Ngo, Hyeonwoo 316 Noh, Long Ouyang, Cullen O'Keefe, Jakub Pachocki, Alex Paino, Joe Palermo, Ashley Pan-317 tuliano, Giambattista Parascandolo, Joel Parish, Emy Parparita, Alex Passos, Mikhail Pavlov, 318 Andrew Peng, Adam Perelman, Filipe de Avila Belbute Peres, Michael Petrov, Henrique Ponde 319 de Oliveira Pinto, Michael, Pokorny, Michelle Pokrass, Vitchyr H. Pong, Tolly Powell, Alethea 320 Power, Boris Power, Elizabeth Proehl, Raul Puri, Alec Radford, Jack Rae, Aditya Ramesh, 321 Cameron Raymond, Francis Real, Kendra Rimbach, Carl Ross, Bob Rotsted, Henri Roussez, 322 Nick Ryder, Mario Saltarelli, Ted Sanders, Shibani Santurkar, Girish Sastry, Heather Schmidt, 323 David Schnurr, John Schulman, Daniel Selsam, Kyla Sheppard, Toki Sherbakov, Jessica Shieh, 324 Sarah Shoker, Pranav Shyam, Szymon Sidor, Eric Sigler, Maddie Simens, Jordan Sitkin, Kata-325 rina Slama, Ian Sohl, Benjamin Sokolowsky, Yang Song, Natalie Staudacher, Felipe Petroski 326 Such, Natalie Summers, Ilya Sutskever, Jie Tang, Nikolas Tezak, Madeleine B. Thompson, Phil 327 Tillet, Amin Tootoonchian, Elizabeth Tseng, Preston Tuggle, Nick Turley, Jerry Tworek, Juan 328 Felipe Cerón Uribe, Andrea Vallone, Arun Vijayvergiya, Chelsea Voss, Carroll Wainwright, 329 Justin Jay Wang, Alvin Wang, Ben Wang, Jonathan Ward, Jason Wei, CJ Weinmann, Akila 330 Welihinda, Peter Welinder, Jiayi Weng, Lilian Weng, Matt Wiethoff, Dave Willner, Clemens 331 Winter, Samuel Wolrich, Hannah Wong, Lauren Workman, Sherwin Wu, Jeff Wu, Michael Wu, 332 Kai Xiao, Tao Xu, Sarah Yoo, Kevin Yu, Qiming Yuan, Wojciech Zaremba, Rowan Zellers, 333 Chong Zhang, Marvin Zhang, Shengjia Zhao, Tianhao Zheng, Juntang Zhuang, William Zhuk, 334 335 and Barret Zoph. Gpt-4 technical report, 2024.

- [19] Simon Ouellette, Rolf Pfister, and Hansueli Jud. Counting and algorithmic generalization with
   transformers. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2310.08661*, 2023.
- [20] Alethea Power, Yuri Burda, Harri Edwards, Igor Babuschkin, and Vedant Misra.
   Grokking: Generalization beyond overfitting on small algorithmic datasets. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2201.02177*, 2022.
- [21] Benjamin Steinberg. Representation theory of finite groups. *Carleton University*, 2009.

[22] Gemini Team, Petko Georgiev, Ving Ian Lei, Ryan Burnell, Libin Bai, Anmol Gulati, Gar-342 rett Tanzer, Damien Vincent, Zhufeng Pan, Shibo Wang, Soroosh Mariooryad, Yifan Ding, 343 Xinyang Geng, Fred Alcober, Roy Frostig, Mark Omernick, Lexi Walker, Cosmin Paduraru, 344 Christina Sorokin, Andrea Tacchetti, Colin Gaffney, Samira Daruki, Olcan Sercinoglu, Zach 345 Gleicher, Juliette Love, Paul Voigtlaender, Rohan Jain, Gabriela Surita, Kareem Mohamed, 346 Rory Blevins, Junwhan Ahn, Tao Zhu, Kornraphop Kawintiranon, Orhan Firat, Yiming Gu, 347 Yujing Zhang, Matthew Rahtz, Manaal Faruqui, Natalie Clay, Justin Gilmer, JD Co-Reyes, 348 Ivo Penchev, Rui Zhu, Nobuyuki Morioka, Kevin Hui, Krishna Haridasan, Victor Campos, 349 Mahdis Mahdieh, Mandy Guo, Samer Hassan, Kevin Kilgour, Arpi Vezer, Heng-Tze Cheng, 350 Raoul de Liedekerke, Siddharth Goyal, Paul Barham, DJ Strouse, Seb Noury, Jonas Adler, 351 Mukund Sundararajan, Sharad Vikram, Dmitry Lepikhin, Michela Paganini, Xavier Garcia, 352 Fan Yang, Dasha Valter, Maja Trebacz, Kiran Vodrahalli, Chulayuth Asawaroengchai, Ro-353 man Ring, Norbert Kalb, Livio Baldini Soares, Siddhartha Brahma, David Steiner, Tianhe 354

Yu, Fabian Mentzer, Antoine He, Lucas Gonzalez, Bibo Xu, Raphael Lopez Kaufman, Lau-355 rent El Shafey, Junhyuk Oh, Tom Hennigan, George van den Driessche, Seth Odoom, Mario 356 Lucic, Becca Roelofs, Sid Lall, Amit Marathe, Betty Chan, Santiago Ontanon, Luheng He, De-357 nis Teplyashin, Jonathan Lai, Phil Crone, Bogdan Damoc, Lewis Ho, Sebastian Riedel, Karel 358 Lenc, Chih-Kuan Yeh, Aakanksha Chowdhery, Yang Xu, Mehran Kazemi, Ehsan Amid, Anas-359 tasia Petrushkina, Kevin Swersky, Ali Khodaei, Gowoon Chen, Chris Larkin, Mario Pinto, 360 Geng Yan, Adria Puigdomenech Badia, Piyush Patil, Steven Hansen, Dave Orr, Sebastien 361 M. R. Arnold, Jordan Grimstad, Andrew Dai, Sholto Douglas, Rishika Sinha, Vikas Yadav, 362 Xi Chen, Elena Gribovskaya, Jacob Austin, Jeffrey Zhao, Kaushal Patel, Paul Komarek, Sophia 363 Austin, Sebastian Borgeaud, Linda Friso, Abhimanyu Goyal, Ben Caine, Kris Cao, Da-Woon 364 Chung, Matthew Lamm, Gabe Barth-Maron, Thais Kagohara, Kate Olszewska, Mia Chen, 365 Kaushik Shivakumar, Rishabh Agarwal, Harshal Godhia, Ravi Rajwar, Javier Snaider, Xerxes 366 Dotiwalla, Yuan Liu, Aditya Barua, Victor Ungureanu, Yuan Zhang, Bat-Orgil Batsaikhan, 367 Mateo Wirth, James Qin, Ivo Danihelka, Tulsee Doshi, Martin Chadwick, Jilin Chen, Sanil 368 Jain, Quoc Le, Arjun Kar, Madhu Gurumurthy, Cheng Li, Ruoxin Sang, Fangyu Liu, Lampros 369 Lamprou, Rich Munoz, Nathan Lintz, Harsh Mehta, Heidi Howard, Malcolm Reynolds, Lora 370 Aroyo, Quan Wang, Lorenzo Blanco, Albin Cassirer, Jordan Griffith, Dipanjan Das, Stephan 371 Lee, Jakub Sygnowski, Zach Fisher, James Besley, Richard Powell, Zafarali Ahmed, Dominik 372 Paulus, David Reitter, Zalan Borsos, Rishabh Joshi, Aedan Pope, Steven Hand, Vittorio Selo, 373 Vihan Jain, Nikhil Sethi, Megha Goel, Takaki Makino, Rhys May, Zhen Yang, Johan Schalk-374 wyk, Christina Butterfield, Anja Hauth, Alex Goldin, Will Hawkins, Evan Senter, Sergey Brin, 375 Oliver Woodman, Marvin Ritter, Eric Noland, Minh Giang, Vijay Bolina, Lisa Lee, Tim Blyth, 376 Ian Mackinnon, Machel Reid, Obaid Sarvana, David Silver, Alexander Chen, Lily Wang, 377 Loren Maggiore, Oscar Chang, Nithya Attaluri, Gregory Thornton, Chung-Cheng Chiu, Oskar 378 Bunyan, Nir Levine, Timothy Chung, Evgenii Eltyshev, Xiance Si, Timothy Lillicrap, Deme-379 tra Brady, Vaibhav Aggarwal, Boxi Wu, Yuanzhong Xu, Ross McIlroy, Kartikeya Badola, 380 Paramjit Sandhu, Erica Moreira, Wojciech Stokowiec, Ross Hemsley, Dong Li, Alex Tudor, 381 Pranav Shyam, Elahe Rahimtoroghi, Salem Haykal, Pablo Sprechmann, Xiang Zhou, Diana 382 Mincu, Yujia Li, Ravi Addanki, Kalpesh Krishna, Xiao Wu, Alexandre Frechette, Matan Eyal, 383 Allan Dafoe, Dave Lacey, Jay Whang, Thi Avrahami, Ye Zhang, Emanuel Taropa, Hanzhao 384 Lin, Daniel Toyama, Eliza Rutherford, Motoki Sano, HyunJeong Choe, Alex Tomala, Cha-385 lence Safranek-Shrader, Nora Kassner, Mantas Pajarskas, Matt Harvey, Sean Sechrist, Meire 386 Fortunato, Christina Lyu, Gamaleldin Elsayed, Chenkai Kuang, James Lottes, Eric Chu, Chao 387 Jia, Chih-Wei Chen, Peter Humphreys, Kate Baumli, Connie Tao, Rajkumar Samuel, Ci-388 cero Nogueira dos Santos, Anders Andreassen, Nemanja Rakićević, Dominik Grewe, Aviral 389 Kumar, Stephanie Winkler, Jonathan Caton, Andrew Brock, Sid Dalmia, Hannah Sheahan, 390 Iain Barr, Yingjie Miao, Paul Natsev, Jacob Devlin, Feryal Behbahani, Flavien Prost, Yanhua 391 392 Sun, Artiom Myaskovsky, Thanumalayan Sankaranarayana Pillai, Dan Hurt, Angeliki Lazaridou, Xi Xiong, Ce Zheng, Fabio Pardo, Xiaowei Li, Dan Horgan, Joe Stanton, Moran Ambar, 393 Fei Xia, Alejandro Lince, Mingqiu Wang, Basil Mustafa, Albert Webson, Hyo Lee, Rohan 394 Anil, Martin Wicke, Timothy Dozat, Abhishek Sinha, Enrique Piqueras, Elahe Dabir, Shyam 395 Upadhyay, Anudhyan Boral, Lisa Anne Hendricks, Corey Fry, Josip Djolonga, Yi Su, Jake 396 Walker, Jane Labanowski, Ronny Huang, Vedant Misra, Jeremy Chen, RJ Skerry-Ryan, Avi 397 Singh, Shruti Rijhwani, Dian Yu, Alex Castro-Ros, Beer Changpinyo, Romina Datta, Sumit 398 Bagri, Arnar Mar Hrafnkelsson, Marcello Maggioni, Daniel Zheng, Yury Sulsky, Shaobo Hou, 399 Tom Le Paine, Antoine Yang, Jason Riesa, Dominika Rogozinska, Dror Marcus, Dalia El 400 Badawy, Oiao Zhang, Luyu Wang, Helen Miller, Jeremy Greer, Lars Lowe Sjos, Azade Nova, 401 Heiga Zen, Rahma Chaabouni, Mihaela Rosca, Jiepu Jiang, Charlie Chen, Ruibo Liu, Tara 402 Sainath, Maxim Krikun, Alex Polozov, Jean-Baptiste Lespiau, Josh Newlan, Zeyncep Cankara, 403 Soo Kwak, Yunhan Xu, Phil Chen, Andy Coenen, Clemens Meyer, Katerina Tsihlas, Ada Ma, 404 Juraj Gottweis, Jinwei Xing, Chenjie Gu, Jin Miao, Christian Frank, Zeynep Cankara, San-405 jay Ganapathy, Ishita Dasgupta, Steph Hughes-Fitt, Heng Chen, David Reid, Keran Rong, 406 Hongmin Fan, Joost van Amersfoort, Vincent Zhuang, Aaron Cohen, Shixiang Shane Gu, An-407 had Mohananey, Anastasija Ilic, Taylor Tobin, John Wieting, Anna Bortsova, Phoebe Thacker, 408 Emma Wang, Emily Caveness, Justin Chiu, Eren Sezener, Alex Kaskasoli, Steven Baker, Katie 409 Millican, Mohamed Elhawaty, Kostas Aisopos, Carl Lebsack, Nathan Byrd, Hanjun Dai, Wen-410 hao Jia, Matthew Wiethoff, Elnaz Davoodi, Albert Weston, Lakshman Yagati, Arun Ahuja, 411 Isabel Gao, Golan Pundak, Susan Zhang, Michael Azzam, Khe Chai Sim, Sergi Caelles, 412 James Keeling, Abhanshu Sharma, Andy Swing, YaGuang Li, Chenxi Liu, Carrie Grimes 413

Bostock, Yamini Bansal, Zachary Nado, Ankesh Anand, Josh Lipschultz, Abhijit Karmarkar, 414 Lev Proleev, Abe Ittycheriah, Soheil Hassas Yeganeh, George Polovets, Aleksandra Faust, 415 Jiao Sun, Alban Rrustemi, Pen Li, Rakesh Shivanna, Jeremiah Liu, Chris Welty, Federico Le-416 bron, Anirudh Baddepudi, Sebastian Krause, Emilio Parisotto, Radu Soricut, Zheng Xu, Dawn 417 Bloxwich, Melvin Johnson, Behnam Neyshabur, Justin Mao-Jones, Renshen Wang, Vinay Ra-418 masesh, Zaheer Abbas, Arthur Guez, Constant Segal, Duc Dung Nguyen, James Svensson, 419 Le Hou, Sarah York, Kieran Milan, Sophie Bridgers, Wiktor Gworek, Marco Tagliasacchi, 420 James Lee-Thorp, Michael Chang, Alexey Guseynov, Ale Jakse Hartman, Michael Kwong, 421 Ruizhe Zhao, Sheleem Kashem, Elizabeth Cole, Antoine Miech, Richard Tanburn, Mary 422 Phuong, Filip Pavetic, Sebastien Cevey, Ramona Comanescu, Richard Ives, Sherry Yang, 423 Cosmo Du, Bo Li, Zizhao Zhang, Mariko Iinuma, Clara Huiyi Hu, Aurko Roy, Shaan Bijwadia, 424 Zhenkai Zhu, Danilo Martins, Rachel Saputro, Anita Gergely, Steven Zheng, Dawei Jia, Ioan-425 nis Antonoglou, Adam Sadovsky, Shane Gu, Yingying Bi, Alek Andreev, Sina Samangooei, 426 Mina Khan, Tomas Kocisky, Angelos Filos, Chintu Kumar, Colton Bishop, Adams Yu, Sarah 427 Hodkinson, Sid Mittal, Premal Shah, Alexandre Moufarek, Yong Cheng, Adam Bloniarz, Jae-428 hoon Lee, Pedram Pejman, Paul Michel, Stephen Spencer, Vladimir Feinberg, Xuehan Xiong, 429 Nikolay Savinov, Charlotte Smith, Siamak Shakeri, Dustin Tran, Mary Chesus, Bernd Bohnet, 430 George Tucker, Tamara von Glehn, Carrie Muir, Yiran Mao, Hideto Kazawa, Ambrose Slone, 431 Kedar Soparkar, Disha Shrivastava, James Cobon-Kerr, Michael Sharman, Jay Pavagadhi, Car-432 los Araya, Karolis Misiunas, Nimesh Ghelani, Michael Laskin, David Barker, Qiujia Li, An-433 ton Briukhov, Neil Houlsby, Mia Glaese, Balaji Lakshminarayanan, Nathan Schucher, Yun-434 hao Tang, Eli Collins, Hyeontaek Lim, Fangxiaoyu Feng, Adria Recasens, Guangda Lai, Al-435 berto Magni, Nicola De Cao, Aditya Siddhant, Zoe Ashwood, Jordi Orbay, Mostafa Dehghani, 436 Jenny Brennan, Yifan He, Kelvin Xu, Yang Gao, Carl Saroufim, James Molloy, Xinyi Wu, Seb 437 Arnold, Solomon Chang, Julian Schrittwieser, Elena Buchatskaya, Soroush Radpour, Martin 438 Polacek, Skye Giordano, Ankur Bapna, Simon Tokumine, Vincent Hellendoorn, Thibault Sot-439 tiaux, Sarah Cogan, Aliaksei Severyn, Mohammad Saleh, Shantanu Thakoor, Laurent Shefey, 440 Siyuan Qiao, Meenu Gaba, Shuo yiin Chang, Craig Swanson, Biao Zhang, Benjamin Lee, 441 Paul Kishan Rubenstein, Gan Song, Tom Kwiatkowski, Anna Koop, Ajay Kannan, David 442 Kao, Parker Schuh, Axel Stjerngren, Golnaz Ghiasi, Gena Gibson, Luke Vilnis, Ye Yuan, 443 Felipe Tiengo Ferreira, Aishwarya Kamath, Ted Klimenko, Ken Franko, Kefan Xiao, Indro 444 Bhattacharya, Miteyan Patel, Rui Wang, Alex Morris, Robin Strudel, Vivek Sharma, Peter 445 Choy, Sayed Hadi Hashemi, Jessica Landon, Mara Finkelstein, Priya Jhakra, Justin Frye, 446 Megan Barnes, Matthew Mauger, Dennis Daun, Khuslen Baatarsukh, Matthew Tung, Wael 447 Farhan, Henryk Michalewski, Fabio Viola, Felix de Chaumont Quitry, Charline Le Lan, Tom 448 Hudson, Qingze Wang, Felix Fischer, Ivy Zheng, Elspeth White, Anca Dragan, Jean baptiste 449 Alayrac, Eric Ni, Alexander Pritzel, Adam Iwanicki, Michael Isard, Anna Bulanova, Lukas 450 451 Zilka, Ethan Dyer, Devendra Sachan, Srivatsan Srinivasan, Hannah Muckenhirn, Honglong Cai, Amol Mandhane, Mukarram Tariq, Jack W. Rae, Gary Wang, Kareem Ayoub, Nicholas 452 FitzGerald, Yao Zhao, Woohyun Han, Chris Alberti, Dan Garrette, Kashyap Krishnakumar, 453 Mai Gimenez, Anselm Levskaya, Daniel Sohn, Josip Matak, Inaki Iturrate, Michael B. Chang, 454 Jackie Xiang, Yuan Cao, Nishant Ranka, Geoff Brown, Adrian Hutter, Vahab Mirrokni, Nanxin 455 Chen, Kaisheng Yao, Zoltan Egyed, Francois Galilee, Tyler Liechty, Praveen Kallakuri, Evan 456 Palmer, Sanjay Ghemawat, Jasmine Liu, David Tao, Chloe Thornton, Tim Green, Mimi Jasare-457 vic, Sharon Lin, Victor Cotruta, Yi-Xuan Tan, Noah Fiedel, Hongkun Yu, Ed Chi, Alexander 458 Neitz, Jens Heitkaemper, Anu Sinha, Denny Zhou, Yi Sun, Charbel Kaed, Brice Hulse, Swa-459 roop Mishra, Maria Georgaki, Sneha Kudugunta, Clement Farabet, Izhak Shafran, Daniel 460 Vlasic, Anton Tsitsulin, Rajagopal Ananthanarayanan, Alen Carin, Guolong Su, Pei Sun, 461 Shashank V, Gabriel Carvajal, Josef Broder, Iulia Comsa, Alena Repina, William Wong, War-462 463 ren Weilun Chen, Peter Hawkins, Egor Filonov, Lucia Loher, Christoph Hirnschall, Weiyi Wang, Jingchen Ye, Andrea Burns, Hardie Cate, Diana Gage Wright, Federico Piccinini, 464 Lei Zhang, Chu-Cheng Lin, Ionel Gog, Yana Kulizhskaya, Ashwin Sreevatsa, Shuang Song, 465 Luis C. Cobo, Anand Iyer, Chetan Tekur, Guillermo Garrido, Zhuyun Xiao, Rupert Kemp, 466 Huaixiu Steven Zheng, Hui Li, Ananth Agarwal, Christel Ngani, Kati Goshvadi, Rebeca 467 Santamaria-Fernandez, Wojciech Fica, Xinyun Chen, Chris Gorgolewski, Sean Sun, Roopal 468 Garg, Xinyu Ye, S. M. Ali Eslami, Nan Hua, Jon Simon, Pratik Joshi, Yelin Kim, Ian Tenney, 469 Sahitya Potluri, Lam Nguyen Thiet, Quan Yuan, Florian Luisier, Alexandra Chronopoulou, 470 Salvatore Scellato, Praveen Srinivasan, Minmin Chen, Vinod Koverkathu, Valentin Dalibard, 471 Yaming Xu, Brennan Saeta, Keith Anderson, Thibault Sellam, Nick Fernando, Fantine Huot, 472

Junehyuk Jung, Mani Varadarajan, Michael Quinn, Amit Raul, Maigo Le, Ruslan Habalov, Jon 473 Clark, Komal Jalan, Kalesha Bullard, Achintya Singhal, Thang Luong, Boyu Wang, Sujeevan 474 Rajayogam, Julian Eisenschlos, Johnson Jia, Daniel Finchelstein, Alex Yakubovich, Daniel 475 Balle, Michael Fink, Sameer Agarwal, Jing Li, Dj Dvijotham, Shalini Pal, Kai Kang, Jaclyn 476 Konzelmann, Jennifer Beattie, Olivier Dousse, Diane Wu, Remi Crocker, Chen Elkind, Sid-477 dhartha Reddy Jonnalagadda, Jong Lee, Dan Holtmann-Rice, Krystal Kallarackal, Rosanne 478 Liu, Denis Vnukov, Neera Vats, Luca Invernizzi, Mohsen Jafari, Huanjie Zhou, Lilly Taylor, 479 Jennifer Prendki, Marcus Wu, Tom Eccles, Tianqi Liu, Kavya Kopparapu, Francoise Beaufays, 480 Christof Angermueller, Andreea Marzoca, Shourya Sarcar, Hilal Dib, Jeff Stanway, Frank Per-481 bet, Nejc Trdin, Rachel Sterneck, Andrey Khorlin, Dinghua Li, Xihui Wu, Sonam Goenka, 482 David Madras, Sasha Goldshtein, Willi Gierke, Tong Zhou, Yaxin Liu, Yannie Liang, Anais 483 White, Yunjie Li, Shreya Singh, Sanaz Bahargam, Mark Epstein, Sujoy Basu, Li Lao, Ad-484 nan Ozturel, Carl Crous, Alex Zhai, Han Lu, Zora Tung, Neeraj Gaur, Alanna Walton, Lucas 485 Dixon, Ming Zhang, Amir Globerson, Grant Uy, Andrew Bolt, Olivia Wiles, Milad Nasr, 486 Ilia Shumailov, Marco Selvi, Francesco Piccinno, Ricardo Aguilar, Sara McCarthy, Misha 487 Khalman, Mrinal Shukla, Vlado Galic, John Carpenter, Kevin Villela, Haibin Zhang, Harry 488 Richardson, James Martens, Matko Bosnjak, Shreyas Rammohan Belle, Jeff Seibert, Mah-489 moud Alnahlawi, Brian McWilliams, Sankalp Singh, Annie Louis, Wen Ding, Dan Popovici, 490 Lenin Simicich, Laura Knight, Pulkit Mehta, Nishesh Gupta, Chongyang Shi, Saaber Fatehi, 491 Jovana Mitrovic, Alex Grills, Joseph Pagadora, Dessie Petrova, Danielle Eisenbud, Zhishuai 492 Zhang, Damion Yates, Bhavishya Mittal, Nilesh Tripuraneni, Yannis Assael, Thomas Brov-493 elli, Prateek Jain, Mihajlo Velimirovic, Canfer Akbulut, Jiaqi Mu, Wolfgang Macherey, Ravin 494 Kumar, Jun Xu, Haroon Qureshi, Gheorghe Comanici, Jeremy Wiesner, Zhitao Gong, Anton 495 Ruddock, Matthias Bauer, Nick Felt, Anirudh GP, Anurag Arnab, Dustin Zelle, Jonas Roth-496 fuss, Bill Rosgen, Ashish Shenoy, Bryan Seybold, Xinjian Li, Jayaram Mudigonda, Goker 497 Erdogan, Jiawei Xia, Jiri Simsa, Andrea Michi, Yi Yao, Christopher Yew, Steven Kan, Isaac 498 Caswell, Carey Radebaugh, Andre Elisseeff, Pedro Valenzuela, Kay McKinney, Kim Paterson, 499 Albert Cui, Eri Latorre-Chimoto, Solomon Kim, William Zeng, Ken Durden, Priya Ponna-500 palli, Tiberiu Sosea, Christopher A. Choquette-Choo, James Manyika, Brona Robenek, Har-501 sha Vashisht, Sebastien Pereira, Hoi Lam, Marko Velic, Denese Owusu-Afriyie, Katherine 502 Lee, Tolga Bolukbasi, Alicia Parrish, Shawn Lu, Jane Park, Balaji Venkatraman, Alice Tal-503 bert, Lambert Rosique, Yuchung Cheng, Andrei Sozanschi, Adam Paszke, Praveen Kumar, 504 Jessica Austin, Lu Li, Khalid Salama, Wooyeol Kim, Nandita Dukkipati, Anthony Barysh-505 nikov, Christos Kaplanis, XiangHai Sheng, Yuri Chervonyi, Caglar Unlu, Diego de Las Casas, 506 Harry Askham, Kathryn Tunyasuvunakool, Felix Gimeno, Siim Poder, Chester Kwak, Matt 507 Miecnikowski, Vahab Mirrokni, Alek Dimitriev, Aaron Parisi, Dangyi Liu, Tomy Tsai, Toby 508 Shevlane, Christina Kouridi, Drew Garmon, Adrian Goedeckemeyer, Adam R. Brown, Anitha 509 510 Vijayakumar, Ali Elqursh, Sadegh Jazayeri, Jin Huang, Sara Mc Carthy, Jay Hoover, Lucy Kim, Sandeep Kumar, Wei Chen, Courtney Biles, Garrett Bingham, Evan Rosen, Lisa Wang, 511 Oijun Tan, David Engel, Francesco Pongetti, Dario de Cesare, Dongseong Hwang, Lily Yu, 512 Jennifer Pullman, Srini Narayanan, Kyle Levin, Siddharth Gopal, Megan Li, Asaf Aharoni, 513 Trieu Trinh, Jessica Lo, Norman Casagrande, Roopali Vij, Loic Matthey, Bramandia Ramad-514 hana, Austin Matthews, CJ Carey, Matthew Johnson, Kremena Goranova, Rohin Shah, Shereen 515 Ashraf, Kingshuk Dasgupta, Rasmus Larsen, Yicheng Wang, Manish Reddy Vuyyuru, Chong 516 Jiang, Joana Ijazi, Kazuki Osawa, Celine Smith, Ramya Sree Boppana, Taylan Bilal, Yuma 517 Koizumi, Ying Xu, Yasemin Altun, Nir Shabat, Ben Bariach, Alex Korchemniy, Kiam Choo, 518 Olaf Ronneberger, Chimezie Iwuanyanwu, Shubin Zhao, David Soergel, Cho-Jui Hsieh, Irene 519 Cai, Shariq Iqbal, Martin Sundermeyer, Zhe Chen, Elie Bursztein, Chaitanya Malaviya, Fadi 520 Biadsy, Prakash Shroff, Inderjit Dhillon, Tejasi Latkar, Chris Dyer, Hannah Forbes, Massimo 521 Nicosia, Vitaly Nikolaev, Somer Greene, Marin Georgiev, Pidong Wang, Nina Martin, Hanie 522 Sedghi, John Zhang, Praseem Banzal, Doug Fritz, Vikram Rao, Xuezhi Wang, Jiageng Zhang, 523 Viorica Patraucean, Dayou Du, Igor Mordatch, Ivan Jurin, Lewis Liu, Ayush Dubey, Abhi 524 Mohan, Janek Nowakowski, Vlad-Doru Ion, Nan Wei, Reiko Tojo, Maria Abi Raad, Drew A. 525 Hudson, Vaishakh Keshava, Shubham Agrawal, Kevin Ramirez, Zhichun Wu, Hoang Nguyen, 526 Ji Liu, Madhavi Sewak, Bryce Petrini, DongHyun Choi, Ivan Philips, Zivue Wang, Ioana 527 Bica, Ankush Garg, Jarek Wilkiewicz, Priyanka Agrawal, Xiaowei Li, Danhao Guo, Emily 528 Xue, Naseer Shaik, Andrew Leach, Sadh MNM Khan, Julia Wiesinger, Sammy Jerome, Ab-529 hishek Chakladar, Alek Wenjiao Wang, Tina Ornduff, Folake Abu, Alireza Ghaffarkhah, Mar-530 cus Wainwright, Mario Cortes, Frederick Liu, Joshua Maynez, Andreas Terzis, Pouya Saman-531

- gouei, Riham Mansour, Tomasz Kepa, Francois-Xavier Aubet, Anton Algymr, Dan Banica,
   Agoston Weisz, Andras Orban, Alexandre Senges, Ewa Andrejczuk, Mark Geller, Niccolo Dal
   Santo, Valentin Anklin, Majd Al Merey, Martin Baeuml, Trevor Strohman, Junwen Bai, Slav
   Petrov, Yonghui Wu, Demis Hassabis, Koray Kavukcuoglu, Jeffrey Dean, and Oriol Vinyals.
- 536 Gemini 1.5: Unlocking multimodal understanding across millions of tokens of context, 2024.
- [23] Vikrant Varma, Rohin Shah, Zachary Kenton, János Kramár, and Ramana Kumar. Explaining
   grokking through circuit efficiency. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2309.02390*, 2023.
- Johannes Von Oswald, Eyvind Niklasson, Ettore Randazzo, João Sacramento, Alexander
   Mordvintsev, Andrey Zhmoginov, and Max Vladymyrov. Transformers learn in-context by
   gradient descent. In *International Conference on Machine Learning*, pages 35151–35174.
   PMLR, 2023.
- [25] Jason Wei, Yi Tay, Rishi Bommasani, Colin Raffel, Barret Zoph, Sebastian Borgeaud, Dani
   Yogatama, Maarten Bosma, Denny Zhou, Donald Metzler, et al. Emergent abilities of large
   language models. *TMLR*, 2022.
- [26] Jian Xie, Kai Zhang, Jiangjie Chen, Tinghui Zhu, Renze Lou, Yuandong Tian, Yanghua Xiao,
   and Yu Su. Travelplanner: A benchmark for real-world planning with language agents, 2024.
- [27] Tian Ye, Zicheng Xu, Yuanzhi Li, and Zeyuan Allen-Zhu. Physics of language models: Part
   2.1, grade-school math and the hidden reasoning process. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2407.20311*, 2024.
- [28] Gilad Yehudai, Haim Kaplan, Asma Ghandeharioun, Mor Geva, and Amir Globerson. When can transformers count to n? *arXiv preprint arXiv:2407.15160*, 2024.
- [29] Ziqian Zhong, Ziming Liu, Max Tegmark, and Jacob Andreas. The clock and the pizza: Two
   stories in mechanistic explanation of neural networks. *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems*, 36, 2024.
- [30] Tianyi Zhou, Deqing Fu, Vatsal Sharan, and Robin Jia. Pre-trained large language models use
   fourier features to compute addition. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2406.03445*, 2024.

### 558 A Constructing global optimizers

As mentioned in the main text, we find a mechanism to construct global optimizers from partial solutions that only make a subset of terms vanish in the loss function. This motivates us to find the "seed" solutions that satisfy individual constraints (MPs) in the loss, and then combine them. For this, we group MPs from the loss (Eqn. 3) into three types of constraints. Next, we discuss the partial solutions that satisfy a subset of them, which can be combined to obtain global optimizers.

**Definition 6** (Sets of Constraints). *Four sets of constraints exist in MSE loss (Eqn. 3):* 

• The main term constraints  $R_+ := \{ z | r_{kkk}(z) = 1/2d \};$ 

• The cross term constraints  $R_c := \{ \boldsymbol{z} | r_{k_1 k_2 k}(\boldsymbol{z}) = 0 \text{ except for } k_1 = k_2 = k \};$ 

• The norm constrains  $R_n := \{ z | r_{p0k'k}(z) = \sum_j |z_{pk'j}|^2 z_{ckj} = 0 \};$ 

• The circular convolution constraints  $R_{\circledast} = \{ \boldsymbol{z} | r_{pmk'k}(\boldsymbol{z}) = 0 \text{ for } m \neq 0 \}.$ 

#### 569 A.1 Global Optimizers leveraging Fourier Bases

We first consider the case that the solution is only nonzero at frequency  $k_0$  but not others, i.e.,  $z_{pkj} = 0$  for  $k \neq \pm k_0$ . Such solution corresponds to Fourier bases in the original domain.

Lemma 2 (Solutions satisfying  $R_c$ ). All order-1 or order-2 solutions satisfying  $R_c$  must have  $r_{kkk} = 0$  for all k. With small  $L_2$  regularization, all order-3 solutions can be decomposed into  $\mathbf{z} = \tilde{\mathbf{z}}_{k_0} * \mathbf{y}$  for certain frequency  $k_0$ , where  $\tilde{\mathbf{z}}_{k_0} = {\tilde{z}_{pkj}}$  has order 3 and corresponds to Fourier bases in the original domain:

$$\tilde{z}_{pk_0} = [1, \omega_3, \omega_3^2] / \sqrt[3]{6d}$$
(5)

where  $\omega_3 := e^{-2\pi i/3}$  and  $\boldsymbol{y}$  is a order-1 unit.

Note that by simple calculation,  $\tilde{z}_{k_0} \in R_n$  but  $\tilde{z}_{k_0} \notin R_{\circledast}$ . Fortunately, leveraging the property of ring homomorphism, we can construct another solution  $z'_{k_0} \in R_{\circledast}$  of order-2, and they combined to form global optimizers.

**Corollary 2** (Order-6 global optimizers of Eqn. 3). *The following* " $3 \times 2$ " *Fourier solutions satisfies the global optimality condition (Eqn. 4):* 

$$\boldsymbol{z}_{F6} = \sum_{k=1}^{(d-1)/2} \tilde{\boldsymbol{z}}_k * \boldsymbol{z}'_k * \boldsymbol{y}_k$$
 (6)

where  $\mathbf{z}'_k$  is order-2 (see Proof). As a result,  $\operatorname{ord}(\mathbf{z}_{F6}) = 3 \cdot 2 \cdot 1 \cdot (d-1)/2 = 3(d-1)$  and each frequency is affiliated with 6 hidden nodes (order-6).

Fig. 2 shows a case with d = 7. In this case, each frequency, out of (d - 1)/2 = 3 total number of frequencies, is associated with 6 hidden nodes. If we remove the last term in the loss that corresponds

to constraints  $R_{\Re}$ , then an order-3 solution suffices.

Interestingly, there also exists a lower-order solution,  $2 \times 2$ , which involves  $\omega_8 := e^{-\pi i/4}$ , that meets  $R_c$  and  $R_{\oplus}$  but not  $R_n$ :

**Corollary 3** (Order-4 "almost" global optimizers). The following order-2 solution satisfies  $R_c$  exsept for  $r_{k_0,k_0,-k_0} = 0$ ,  $R_{\circledast}$  and  $r_{k_0k_0k_0} = 1/\sqrt{2d}$ :

$$z_{ak_0} = [1, \bar{\omega}_8^2] / \sqrt{2}, \quad z_{bk_0} = [\bar{\omega}_8, \omega_8] / \sqrt{2}, \quad z_{ck_0} = [\omega_8, \omega_8] / \sqrt{2d}$$
(7)

and the following order-2 solution satisfies  $r_{k_0,k_0,-k_0} = 0$  and  $r_{k_0k_0k_0} = 1/\sqrt{2d}$ :

$$z_{ak_0} = [1, \omega_8] / \sqrt{2}, \quad z_{bk_0} = [\omega_8, \bar{\omega}_8^2] / \sqrt{2}, \quad z_{ck_0} = [\bar{\omega}_8, \omega_8] / \sqrt{2d}$$
(8)

Therefore, their product  $z_{F4}$ , an "2 × 2" order-4 solution satisfies both  $R_c$  and  $R_{\odot}$ .

<sup>593</sup> Note that this solution is perceived in the experiments, in particular for larger scale problems, show-<sup>594</sup> ing a strong preference of gradient descent towards lower order solutions.



Figure 3: The convergence path of  $z_{a..}$  when training modular addition using Adam optimizer (learning rate 0.05, weight decay 0.005). The final solution contains 2 order-6 ( $z_{F6}$ ) and 1 order-4 ( $z_{F4}$ ) solutions. For each hidden node j, once a dominant frequency emerges, others fade away.



Figure 4: Dynamics of monomial potentials (MPs) over the training process for modular addition with d = 23and q = 1024 hidden nodes. **Top Row.** *Left*: Training/test accuracy reaches 100% and loss close to 0. Test accuracy jumps after training reaches 100% (grokking). *Mid*: After 5k epochs, the distribution of solution orders are concentrated at 4 and 6 (Corollary 2,3). *Right*: Dynamics of  $r_{k_1k_2k}$ . Summation of diagonal  $r_{kkk}$ converges towards (d - 1)/2d (dotted line) with ripple effects, while off-diagonal  $r_{k_1k_2k}$  converges towards 0. **Bottom Row.** Dynamics of different MPs. Note that order-4 and order-6 solutions have very different behaviors on  $r_{a0kk}$  (similar for  $r_{b0kk}$ ).

#### 595 A.2 Global Optimizers using Pure Memorization

- <sup>596</sup> We can also construct perfect memorization solutions as follows.
- <sup>597</sup> **Corollary 4** (Perfect Memorization). Construct the following two d-order weights  $z_a$  and  $z_b$ . <sup>598</sup> Specifically, for  $0 \le j < d$  and  $k \ne 0$ :

$$z_{akj}^{(a)} = \omega_d^{kj} / \sqrt{d}, \qquad z_{bkj}^{(a)} = 1 / \sqrt{d}, \qquad z_{ckj}^{(a)} = \omega_d^{-kj} / \sqrt{2d}$$
(9)

$$z_{bkj}^{(b)} = 1/\sqrt{d}, \qquad z_{akj}^{(b)} = \omega_d^{kj}/\sqrt{d}, \qquad z_{ckj}^{(b)} = \omega_d^{-kj}/\sqrt{2d}$$
(10)

where  $\omega_d := e^{-2\pi i/d}$  is the d-th root of unity. Here  $\mathbf{z}_a \in R_c(k_1 \neq k) \cap R_n \cap R_{\circledast}(p = b \text{ or } m \neq k)$ ,  $\mathbf{z}_b \in R_c(k_2 \neq k) \cap R_n \cap R_{\circledast}(p = a \text{ or } m \neq k)$ . Then  $\mathbf{z}_M = \mathbf{z}_a * \mathbf{z}_b$  satisfies the global optimality condition (Eqn. 4) and is the perfect memorization solution with  $\operatorname{ord}(\mathbf{z}_M) = d^2$ :

$$z_{akj_1j_2}^{(M)} = \omega^{kj_1}/d, \qquad z_{bkj_1j_2}^{(M)} = \omega^{kj_2}/d, \qquad z_{ckj_1j_2}^{(M)} = \omega^{-k(j_1+j_2)}/2d$$
(11)

602 where each hidden node is indexed by  $j = (j_1, j_2), 0 \le j_1, j_2 < d, k \ne 0$ .

To see why this corresponds to perfect memorization, simply apply an inverse Fourier transform for each hidden node  $(j_1, j_2)$ , and the original weights are (zero-mean) delta function located at  $j_1$ ,  $j_2$ and  $j_1 + j_2$  accordingly.



Figure 5: Solution distribution over different weight decay regularization for q = 512, trained with 10k epochs with Adams with learning rate 0.01 on modular addition (i.e., predicting  $a+b \mod d$ ) with  $d \in \{23, 71, 127\}$ . The two red dashed lines correspond to order-4/6 solutions. The histogram is accumulated over 5 random seeds. While heavily over-parameterized (in particular for small d), final solution order remains constant, consistent with Corollary 1. Heavy weight decay shifts the distribution to the left (i.e., low-order solutions) until model collapsing, consistent with Theorem 5.

# 606 **B** Gradient dynamics

Now we have characterized the structures of global optimizers. One natural question arises: why the optimization procedure does not converge to the perfect memorization solution  $z_M$ , but to the Fourier solutions  $z_{F6}$  and  $z_{F4}$ ? The answer is given by gradient dynamics.

Let  $\boldsymbol{r} = [r_{k_1k_2k}, r_{pmk'k}] \in \mathbb{C}^{4d^3}$  be a vector of all MPs, and  $J := \frac{\partial \boldsymbol{r}}{\partial \boldsymbol{z}} \frac{\partial \boldsymbol{z}}{\partial W}$  be the Jacobian matrix of the mapping  $\boldsymbol{r} = \boldsymbol{r}(\boldsymbol{z}(\mathcal{W}))$  in which  $\mathcal{W}$  is the collection of original weights. Note that when we take derivatives with respect to r and apply chain rules, we treat r and its complex conjugate (e.g.,  $r_{kkk}$  and  $r_{-k,-k,-k} = \bar{r}_{kkk}$ ) as independent variables.

Since we run the gradient descent on W, will such (indirect) optimization leads to a descent of rtowards the desired targets (Eqn. 4)? This is confirmed by the following theorem:

Theorem 4 (Dynamics of MPs). The dynamics of MPs satisfies  $\dot{r} = -JJ^* \overline{\nabla_r \ell}$ , which has positive inner product with the negative gradient direction  $-\overline{\nabla_r \ell}$ .

<sup>618</sup> Corollary 1 shows that by ring multiplication, we could create infinitely many global optima from a
 <sup>619</sup> base one. The following theorem answers which solution gradient dynamics picks.

**Theorem 5** (The Occam's Razer: Preference of low-order solutions). If z = y \* z' and both z (of

order q) and z' are global optimal solutions, then there exists a path of zero loss connecting z and z'

in the space of  $Z_q$ . As a result, lower-order solutions are preferred if trained with  $L_2$  regularization.

This shows that gradient dynamics with weight decay will pick a lower-order (i.e., simpler) solution. Fig. 5 verifies it with experiments.

<sup>625</sup> The following theorem shows that the dynamics also enjoys *asymptotic freedom*:

**Theorem 6** (Infinite Width Limits at Initialization). Considering the modified loss of Eqn. 3 with only the first two terms:  $\tilde{\ell}_k := r_{kkk} + d \sum_{k_1k_2} |r_{k_1k_2k}|^2$ , if the weights are i.i.d Gaussian and network width  $q \to +\infty$ , then  $JJ^*$  converge to diagonal and the dynamics of MPs is decoupled.

Intuitively, this means that a large enough network width  $(q \rightarrow +\infty)$  makes the dynamics much easier to analyze, while the final solution may not require that large M. As analyzed in Corollary 2, for each frequency, to achieve global optimality, only 6 hidden nodes are needed.

**Ripple effects.** While Theorem 6 only holds at initialization, the resulting decoupled MP dynamics, e.g.,  $dr_{kkk}/dt = 1 - 2dr_{kkk}$  that leads to  $r_{kkk}(t) = (1 - e^{-t})/2d$ , already captures the rough shape of the curve (Fig. 4 top right). To capture its fine structures (e.g., ripples before stabilization), we can also model the dynamics of the diagonal element in  $JJ^*$ . Consider a symmetric 1D case on a fixed frequency k, where all diagonal  $r_{kkk} = r_0 - r$  (where  $r_0 = 1/2d$ ) and all off-diagonal  $r_{k_1k_2k} = r$ , 637 then

$$\dot{r} = -\dot{r}_{kkk} = \kappa(r_{kkk} - r_0) = -\kappa r, \quad \dot{\kappa} = \alpha(r_0 - r_{kkk}) - (1 - \alpha)r_{k_1k_2k} - c_0 = (2\alpha - 1)r - c_0$$
(12)

where  $\kappa > 0$  is the diagonal element of  $JJ^*$  and  $\alpha$  is a coefficient that characterizes the relative strength of two negative gradient  $-\overline{\nabla}_{r_{kkk}}\ell = r_0 - r_{kkk}$  and  $-\overline{\nabla}_{r_{k_1k_2k}}\ell = -r_{k_1k_2k}$ , and  $c_0$  is the gradient terms caused by asymmetry and/or other frequencies. This yields a second-order ODE that has complex roots in the characteristic function when  $c_0 > 0$ .

# 642 C Conclusion and future work

In this work, we propose CaGO (*Crafting Global Optimizers*), a theoretical framework that models 643 the algebraic structure of global optimizers when training a 2-layer network on reasoning tasks of 644 Abelian group with  $L_2$  loss. We find that the global optimizers can be algebraically composited (i.e., 645 "crafted") by non-optimal partial solutions that only fit to parts of the loss, using ring operations 646 defined in the solution space of the 2-layer neural networks across different network widths. Our 647 constructed solutions (i.e.,  $z_{F4}$  and  $z_{F6}$ , see Corollary 3 and Corollary 2) are verified in modular 648 addition tasks. Under CaGO, we also analyze the training dynamics, show the benefit of over-649 parameterization, and the inductive bias towards simpler solutions due to topological connectivity 650 651 between algebraically linked high-order (i.e., involving more hidden nodes) and low-order global optimizers. 652

**Develop novel training algorithms.** Our analysis suggests that instead of applying (stochastic) 653 gradient descent to a greatly overparameterized network, we may be able to decompose the loss, 654 construct low-order solutions and combine them to achieve the final solutions on the fly using al-655 gebraic operations. Such an approach may be more efficient (it takes a long time to get model 656 657 training converged), and more scalable than a holistic end2end approach using gradient descent, due to its factorizable nature. Also our framework works for any loss function that is a combination of 658 monomial potentials ( $L_2$  loss is just one example), which opens a new dimension for loss function 659 design. 660

**Putting different widths into the same framework**. Many existing theoretical works often assume that the network has a fixed width. However, our study demonstrates that nice mathematical structures can emerge when we consider networks of different widths together, which can be an interesting direction to consider in the future work.

**Grokking**. When learning modular addition, there exists a phase transition from *memorization* to *generalization* during training, known as *grokking* [23, 20], long after the training performance becomes (almost) perfect. While our work focuses more on what representation is learned on a uniform training data distribution, by applying it to different data distribution, grokking can be studied.

Extension to other activation functions. One key assumption of our approach is that the activation function is quadratic. For other activation functions (e.g., SiLU) with  $\sigma(0) = 0$ , we can do a Taylor expansion around the origin and the same framework can still apply (with higher rank MPs).

# 673 **D** Decoupling $L_2$ Loss (Proof)

We use the *character function*  $\phi : G \to \mathbb{C}$ , which maps a group element g into a complex number.

**Lemma 3.** For finite Abelian group, the character function  $\phi$  has the following properties [7, 21]:

• It is a 1-dimensional (irreducible) representation of the group G, i.e.,  $|\phi(g)| = 1$  for  $g \in G$ and for any  $g_1, g_2 \in G$ ,  $\phi(g_1g_2) = \phi(g_1)\phi(g_2)$ .

678 679

680

• There exists d character functions  $\{\phi_k\}$  that satisfy the orthonormal condition  $\frac{1}{d}\sum_{g\in G}\phi_k(g)\overline{\phi_{k'}}(g) = \mathbb{I}(k = k')$ . Here  $\overline{\phi}$  is the complex conjugate of  $\phi$  and is also a character function.

• The set of character functions  $\{\phi_k\}$  forms a character group  $\hat{G}$  under pairwise multiplication:  $\phi_{k_1+k_2} = \phi_{k_1} \circ \phi_{k_2}$ .

Note that the *frequency* k goes from 0 to d-1, where  $\phi_0 \equiv 1$  is the trivial representation (i.e., all *g*  $\in$  *G* maps to 1). According to the Fundamental Theorem of Finite Abelian Groups, each finite Abelian group can be decomposed into a direct sum of cyclic groups, and the character function of each cyclic group is exactly (scaled) Fourier bases. Therefore, in Abelian group, k is a multidimensional frequency index. [3] shows that  $\hat{G} \cong G$  (Theorem 3.13) so each character function  $\phi \in \hat{G}$  can also be indexed by g itself. Right now we keep the index k.

For convenience, we define  $\phi_{-k} := \overline{\phi}_k$  as the conjugate representation of  $\phi_k$ .

Let  $\phi_k = [\phi_k(g)]_{g \in G} \in \mathbb{C}^d$  be the vector that contains the value of the character function  $\phi_k$ . Then  $\{\phi_k\}$  form an orthogonal base in  $\mathbb{C}^d$  and we can represent the weight vector  $\mathbf{w}_j$  and  $v_j$  as the following:

$$\mathbf{w}_j = U_{G_1} \sum_{k \neq 0} z_{akj} \phi_k + U_{G_2} \sum_{k \neq 0} z_{bkj} \phi_k, \qquad \mathbf{v}_j = \sum_{k \neq 0} z_{ckj} \bar{\phi}_k \tag{13}$$

where  $z := \{z_{pkj}\}$  are the complex coefficients  $(p \in \{a, b, c\}, 0 \le k < d \text{ and } j \text{ runs through hidden}$ nodes). Then it is clear that  $\mathbf{w}_j^{\top} \boldsymbol{f}[i] = \sum_{k \neq 0} h_{akj} \phi_k(\iota_0(g[i])) + \sum_{k \neq 0} h_{bkj} \phi_k(x[i]).$ 

**Theorem 1** (Analytic form of  $L_2$  loss with quadratic activation). The objective of 2-layer MLP network with quadratic activation can be written as  $\ell = \sum_{k \neq 0} \ell_k + (d-1)/d$ , where

$$\ell_{k} = -4r_{kkk} + 4d\sum_{k_{1}k_{2}}|r_{k_{1}k_{2}k}|^{2} + d\left|\sum_{p\in\{a,b\}}\sum_{k'}r_{p0k'k}\right|^{2} + d\sum_{m\neq0}\sum_{p\in\{a,b\}}\left|\sum_{k'}r_{pmk'k}\right|^{2} (3)$$

697 Here  $r_{k_1k_2k} := \sum_j z_{ak_1j} z_{bk_2j} z_{ckj}$  and  $r_{pmk'k} := \sum_j z_{pk'j} z_{p,m-k',j} z_{ckj}$ .

# 698 *Proof.* Note that the objective $\ell$ can be written down as

$$= \mathbb{E}_{g,x} \left[ \| P_1^{\perp}(\boldsymbol{o}(g,x) - \boldsymbol{e}_{gx}) \|^2 \right]$$
(14)

$$= \mathbb{E}_{g,x} \left[ \boldsymbol{o}^{\top} P_1^{\perp} \boldsymbol{o} - 2 \boldsymbol{o}^{\top} P_1^{\perp} \boldsymbol{e}_{gx} + \boldsymbol{e}_{gx}^{\top} P_1^{\perp} \boldsymbol{e}_{gx} \right]$$
(15)

699 For  $\mathbb{E}\left[\boldsymbol{o}^{\top} P_1^{\perp} \boldsymbol{e}_{gx}\right]$ , since

$$\boldsymbol{e}_{gx}^{\top} P_1^{\perp} \boldsymbol{o} = \sum_j \boldsymbol{e}_{gx}^{\top} P_1^{\perp} \boldsymbol{v}_j \sigma(\mathbf{w}_j^{\top} \boldsymbol{f}(g, x))$$
(16)

$$= \sum_{j} \left( \sum_{k' \neq 0} c_{k'j} \bar{\phi}_{k'}(gx) \right) \left( \sum_{k} a_{kj} \phi_k(\iota_0(g)) + b_{kj} \phi_k(x) + \boldsymbol{e}_g^\top \mathbf{w}_j^\perp \right)^2 \quad (17)$$

Note that by our previous analysis, there exists  $y_1 := \iota_0(g)$  so that  $gy = x_1y$ . Let  $x_2 := x$ . For notation brevity, let  $z_{akj} := a_{kj}, z_{bkj} := b_{kj}$  and  $z_{ckj} := c_{kj}$ , then we have:

$$\boldsymbol{e}_{gx}^{\top} P_1^{\perp} \boldsymbol{o} = \sum_j \left( \sum_{k' \neq 0} c_{k'j} \bar{\phi}_{k'}(x_1 x_2) \right) \left( \sum_k \sum_p z_{pkj} \phi_k(x_p) + \boldsymbol{e}_{x_1}^{\top} \mathbf{w}_j^{\perp} \right)^2$$
(18)

702 Therefore, we have:

$$\mathbb{E}_{g,x}\left[\boldsymbol{e}_{gx}^{\top}P_{1}^{\perp}\boldsymbol{o}\right] = \sum_{k_{1},k_{2},k'\neq 0,p_{1},p_{2},j} c_{k'j} z_{p_{1}k_{1}j} z_{p_{2}k_{2}j} \mathbb{E}\left[\bar{\phi}_{k'}(x_{1})\bar{\phi}_{k'}(x_{2})\phi_{k_{1}}(x_{p_{1}})\phi_{k_{2}}(x_{p_{2}})\right]$$
(19)

Note that due to the fact that  $\mathbb{E}_{g \in \iota_0^{-1}(x_1)} \left[ \mathbf{e}_g^\top \mathbf{w}_j^\perp \right] = 0$  and  $\mathbb{E}_{g \in \iota_0^{-1}(x_1)} \left[ \mathbf{e}_g \mathbf{e}_g^\top \right]$  is only a function of  $x_1$  and becomes 0 if multiplied with  $\sum_{k' \neq 0} c_{k'j} \bar{\phi}_{k'}(x_1 x_2)$  and taking expectation w.r.t  $x_2$ , in the final expression, all terms involving  $\mathbf{w}_j^\perp$  vanish.

Since  $\mathbb{E}_x \left[ \phi_k(x) \overline{\phi}_{k'}(x) \right] = \mathbb{I}(k = k')$ , there are only a few cases that the summand is nonzero:

707 • 
$$p_1 = 1, p_2 = 2, k' = k_1 = k_2 \neq 0.$$

708 • 
$$p_1 = 2, p_2 = 1, k' = k_1 = k_2 \neq 0$$

In both cases, the summation reduces to  $\sum_{k \neq 0,j} c_{kj} z_{1kj} z_{2kj} = \sum_{k \neq 0,j} c_{kj} a_{kj} b_{kj}$ . Let  $r_{k_1 k_2 k'} := \sum_{j} a_{k_1 j} b_{k_2 j} c_{k' j}$ , then we have

$$\mathbb{E}\left[\boldsymbol{o}^{\top} P_1^{\perp} \boldsymbol{e}_{gy}\right] = 2 \sum_{k \neq 0, j} a_{kj} b_{kj} c_{kj} = 2 \sum_{k \neq 0} x_{kkk}$$
(20)

711 For  $\mathbb{E}\left[\boldsymbol{o}^{\top}P_{1}^{\perp}\boldsymbol{o}\right]$ , if  $\mathbf{w}_{i}^{\perp}=0$ , then we have:

$$\boldsymbol{o}^{\top} P_1^{\perp} \boldsymbol{o} = \sum_{j,j'} \boldsymbol{v}_j^{\top} P_1^{\perp} \boldsymbol{v}_{j'} \sigma(\mathbf{w}_j^{\top} \boldsymbol{f}(g, y)) \sigma(\mathbf{w}_{j'}^{\top} \boldsymbol{f}(g, y))$$
(21)

712 here

$$\boldsymbol{v}_{j}^{\top} P_{1}^{\perp} \boldsymbol{v}_{j'} = \left(\sum_{k' \neq 0} c_{k'j} \bar{\boldsymbol{\phi}}_{k'}\right)^{\top} \left(\sum_{k'' \neq 0} \bar{c}_{k''j'} \boldsymbol{\phi}_{k''}\right) = d \sum_{k' \neq 0} c_{k'j} \bar{c}_{k'j'}$$
(22)

713 due to the fact that  $\phi_k^{\top} \phi_{k'} = \sum_y \phi_k(y) \phi_{k'}(y) = d\mathbb{I}(k = k').$ 

Then the key part is to compute the following terms:

=

=

$$\mathbb{E}_{y_1,y_2}\left[z_{p_1k_1j_1}z_{p_2k_2j_1}z_{p_3k_3j_2}z_{p_4k_4j_2}c_{k'j_1}\bar{c}_{k'j_2}\phi_{k_1}(y_{p_1})\phi_{k_2}(y_{p_2})\phi_{k_3}(y_{p_3})\phi_{k_4}(y_{p_3})\right]$$
(23)

summing over  $\{p_1, p_2, p_3, p_4, k_1, k_2, k_3, k_4, k' \neq 0, j_1, j_2\}$ . Note that since each  $p \in \{a, b\}$ , there are  $2^4 = 16$  choices of  $(p_1, p_2, p_3, p_4)$ . For notation brevity, we use (1, 3) to represent the subset of p that takes the value of a (e.g., (1, 3) means that  $p_1 = p_3 = a$  and  $p_2 = p_4 = b$ ). It is clear that for odd assignments such as (1, 2, 3), since  $z_{p0j} = 0$ , the summation is zero. Then, we only discuss the even cases as follows:

**Case 1:** (1,3), (2,4), (1,4), (2,3). The 4 cases are identical so we only need to analyze one. We take (1,3) as an example. For (1,3),  $p_1 = p_3 = a$ ,  $p_2 = p_4 = b$  and the only nonzero terms is when  $k_1 + k_3 = 0 \mod d$ ,  $k_2 + k_4 = 0 \mod d$ , since  $\mathbb{E}_{y_1} [\phi_{k_1}(y_1)\phi_{k_3}(y_1)] = \mathbb{I}(k_1 + k_3 = 0 \mod d)$ (and similar in other cases). Then Eqn. 23 becomes:

$$\sum_{k_1,k_2,k'\neq 0} \sum_{j_1j_2} z_{ak_1j_1} z_{bk_2j_1} z_{a,-k_1,j_2} z_{b,-k_2,j_2} c_{k'j_1} \overline{c}_{k'j_2}$$
(24)

$$= \sum_{k_1,k_2,k'\neq 0} \sum_{j_1} z_{ak_1j_1} z_{bk_2j_1} c_{k'j_1} \overline{\sum_{j_2} z_{ak_1j_2} z_{bk_2j_2} c_{k'j_2}}$$
(25)

$$= \sum_{k_1,k_2,k'\neq 0} \sum_{j_1} a_{k_1j_1} b_{k_2j_1} c_{k'j_1} \overline{\sum_{j_2} a_{k_1j_2} b_{k_2j_2} c_{k'j_2}}$$
(26)

$$= \sum_{k_1,k_2,k'\neq 0} r_{k_1k_2k'} \overline{r_{k_1k_2k'}} = \sum_{k_1,k_2,k'\neq 0} |r_{k_1k_2k'}|^2$$
(27)

<sup>724</sup> Since there are 4 such cases, we have:

$$\epsilon_1 = 4 \sum_{k' \neq 0} \sum_{k_1 k_2} |r_{k_1 k_2 k'}|^2 \tag{28}$$

Case 2: (1,2) and (3,4). The two cases are identical. Take (1,2) as an example. In this case,  $p_1 = p_2 = a$  and  $p_3 = p_4 = b$ . The only non-zero terms are when  $k_1 + k_2 = 0$ ,  $k_3 + k_4 = 0$ . Then Eqn. 23 becomes:

$$\sum_{k_1,k_3,k'\neq 0} \sum_{j_1j_2} z_{ak_1j_1} \bar{z}_{ak_1j_1} z_{bk_3j_2} \bar{z}_{bk_3j_2} c_{k'j_1} \bar{c}_{k'j_2}$$
(29)

$$= \sum_{k_1,k_3,k'\neq 0} \sum_{j_1} |a_{k_1j_1}|^2 c_{k'j_1} \sum_{j_2} |b_{k_3j_2}|^2 \bar{c}_{k'j_2}$$
(30)

$$= \sum_{k' \neq 0} \left[ \sum_{j_1} \left( \sum_{k_1} |a_{k_1 j_1}|^2 \right) c_{k' j_1} \right] \left[ \sum_{j_2} \left( \sum_{k_3} |b_{k_3 j_2}|^2 \right) \bar{c}_{k' j_2} \right]$$
(31)

The Let  $r_{amk'}^{\circledast} := \sum_{j} \left( \sum_{k_1+k_2=m} a_{k_1j} a_{k_2j} \right) c_{k'j}$  (similar for  $r_{bmk'}^{\circledast}$ ), then the above becomes  $\sum_{k'\neq 0} r_{a0k'}^{\circledast} \overline{r}_{b0k'}^{\circledast}$ .

Similarly, for (3, 4), the above equation becomes  $\sum_{k' \neq 0} \bar{r}^{\circledast}_{a0k'} r^{\circledast}_{b0k'}$ . Therefore, we have:

$$\epsilon_2 = \sum_{k' \neq 0} r^{\circledast}_{a0k'} \bar{r}^{\circledast}_{b0k'} + \bar{r}^{\circledast}_{a0k'} r^{\circledast}_{b0k'}$$
(32)

- Note that this term can be negative. However, we will see that when it is combined with the following
   terms, all terms will be non-negative.
- 733 **Case 3:** (1, 2, 3, 4) and (). In this case we have:

$$\sum_{k' \neq 0} \sum_{j_1 j_2} \sum_{p \in \{1,2\}} \sum_{k_1 + k_2 + k_3 + k_4 = 0} z_{pk_1 j_1} z_{pk_2 j_1} z_{pk_3 j_2} z_{pk_4 j_2} c_{k' j_1} \bar{c}_{k' j_2}$$
(33)

$$= \sum_{k' \neq 0} \sum_{j_1 j_2} \sum_{p \in \{1,2\}} \sum_{k_1 + k_2 = k_3 + k_4} z_{pk_1 j_1} z_{pk_2 j_1} \bar{z}_{pk_3 j_2} \bar{z}_{pk_4 j_2} c_{k' j_1} \bar{c}_{k' j_2}$$
(34)

$$= \sum_{k'\neq 0} \sum_{m} \sum_{p\in\{1,2\}} \sum_{j_1j_2} \sum_{p\in\{1,2\}} \sum_{k_1+k_2=m} \sum_{k_3+k_4=m} z_{pk_1j_1} z_{pk_2j_1} \bar{z}_{pk_3j_2} \bar{z}_{pk_4j_2} c_{k'j_1} \bar{c}_{k'j_2}$$
(35)

$$=\sum_{k'\neq 0}\sum_{m}\sum_{p\in\{1,2\}}\left[\sum_{j_{1}}\left(\sum_{k_{1}+k_{2}=m}z_{pk_{1}j_{1}}z_{pk_{2}j_{1}}\right)c_{k'j_{1}}\right]\left[\sum_{j_{2}}\left(\sum_{k_{3}+k_{4}=m}\overline{z_{pk_{3}j_{2}}z_{pk_{4}j_{2}}}\right)\bar{c}_{k'j_{2}}\right]$$
$$=\sum_{k'\neq 0}\sum_{m}|r_{amk'}^{\circledast}|^{2}+|r_{bmk'}^{\circledast}|^{2}$$
(36)

<sup>734</sup> In particular, when m = 0, we have  $\sum_{k' \neq 0} |r_{a0k'}^{\circledast}|^2 + |r_{b0k'}^{\circledast}|^2$ . Therefore, we have

$$\epsilon_2 + \epsilon_{3,m=0} = \sum_{k' \neq 0} |r_{a0k'}^{\circledast} + r_{b0k'}^{\circledast}|^2$$
(37)

<sup>735</sup> Finally, putting them together, we have:

$$\mathbb{E}\left[\boldsymbol{o}^{\top} P_{1}^{\perp} \boldsymbol{o}\right] = d(\epsilon_{1} + \epsilon_{2} + \epsilon_{3}) = d(\epsilon_{1} + (\epsilon_{2} + \epsilon_{3,m=0}) + \epsilon_{3,m\neq0})$$
(38)  
$$= d\sum_{k'\neq0} \left( 4\sum_{k_{1}k_{2}} |r_{k_{1}k_{2}k'}|^{2} + |r_{a0k'}^{\circledast} + r_{b0k'}^{\circledast}|^{2} + \sum_{m\neq0} |r_{amk'}^{\circledast}|^{2} + |r_{bmk'}^{\circledast}|^{2} \right)$$
$$\geq 0$$
(39)

736

<sup>737</sup> **Lemma 1** (A Sufficient Conditions of Global optimizers of Eqn. 3). If a solution z to Eqn. 3 satisfies <sup>738</sup> the following, then it is a global optimizer with zero loss  $\ell(z) = 0$ .

$$r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{z}) = \mathbb{I}(k \neq 0)/2d, \quad r_{k_1k_2k}(\boldsymbol{z}) = 0, \quad r_{pmk'k}(\boldsymbol{z}) = 0$$
 (4)

*Proof.* Note that  $d^{-1} \sum_{k} r_{kkk} - \sum_{k} |r_{kkk}|^2$  has a minimizer  $r_{kkk} = 1/2d$ . Therefore, the best loss value any assignment of weights is able to achieve is the following: 739 740

$$r_{k_1k_2k'} = \sum_j a_{k_1j} b_{k_2j} c_{k'j} = \frac{1}{2d} \mathbb{I}(k_1 = k_2 = k') \qquad \qquad k' \neq 0 \qquad (40)$$

$$r_{a0k'}^{\circledast} + r_{b0k'}^{\circledast} := \sum_{j} \left( \sum_{k} |a_{kj}|^2 + |b_{kj}|^2 \right) c_{k'j} = 0 \qquad \qquad k' \neq 0 \qquad (41)$$

$$r_{amk'}^{\circledast} := \sum_{j} \left( \sum_{k_1 + k_2 = m} a_{k_1 j} a_{k_2 j} \right) c_{k' j} = 0 \qquad \qquad k' \neq 0, m \neq 0 \qquad (42)$$

$$r_{bmk'}^{\circledast} := \sum_{j} \left( \sum_{k_1 + k_2 = m} b_{k_1 j} b_{k_2 j} \right) c_{k' j} = 0 \qquad \qquad k' \neq 0, m \neq 0 \qquad (43)$$

Therefore the sufficient conditions (Eqn. 4) will make all above come true. 741

#### Е Semi-ring structure of $\mathcal{Z}$ (Proof) 742

**Theorem 2** (Algebraic Structure of  $\mathcal{Z}$ ).  $\langle \mathcal{Z}, +, * \rangle$  is a commutative semi-ring. 743

Proof. Straightforward from the definition of addition and multiplication (Def. 3) and identification 744 of hidden nodes under permutation (Def. 2). Note that ring addition (i.e., concatenation) does not 745 have inverse and thus it is a semi-ring. 746 

**Theorem 3.** For any monomial potential  $r : Z \mapsto \mathbb{C}$ , r(1) = 1,  $r(z_1 + z_2) = r(z_1) + r(z_2)$  and 747  $r(z_1 * z_2) = r(z_1)r(z_2)$  and thus r is a ring homomorphism. 748

*Proof.* Let  $r(z) = \sum_{j} \prod_{(p,k) \in idx(r)} z_{pkj}$ . Since the ring identity 1 is order-1 and all  $z_{pkj} = 1$ , it is obvious that r(1) = 1. 749 750

Let supp $(z_1)$  be the subset of the hidden nodes that corresponds to  $z_1$  in the concatenated solution 751  $z_1 + z_2$ , similar for supp $(z_2)$ . Note that 752

$$r(\boldsymbol{z}_{1} + \boldsymbol{z}_{2}) = \sum_{j \in \text{supp}(\boldsymbol{z}_{1})} \prod_{(p,k) \in \text{idx}(r)} z_{pkj}^{(1)} + \sum_{j \in \text{supp}(\boldsymbol{z}_{2})} \prod_{(p,k) \in \text{idx}(r)} z_{pkj}^{(2)} = r(\boldsymbol{z}_{1}) + r(\boldsymbol{z}_{2})$$
(44)

On the other hand, we have 753

$$r(\boldsymbol{z}_{1} * \boldsymbol{z}_{2}) = \sum_{j_{1}j_{2}} \prod_{(p,k) \in idx(r)} \left( z_{pkj_{1}}^{(1)} z_{pkj_{2}}^{(2)} \right)$$
(45)

$$=\sum_{j_1j_2} \left(\prod_{(p,k)\in \mathrm{idx}(r)} z_{pkj_1}^{(1)}\right) \left(\prod_{(p,k)\in \mathrm{idx}(r)} z_{pkj_2}^{(2)}\right)$$
(46)

$$= \left(\sum_{j_1} \prod_{(p,k)\in idx(r)} z_{pkj_1}^{(1)}\right) \left(\sum_{j_2} \prod_{(p,k)\in idx(r)} z_{pkj_2}^{(1)}\right)$$
(47)  
$$= r(\mathbf{z}_1)r(\mathbf{z}_2)$$
(48)

$$\begin{array}{cccc} & & & & \\ & & & \\ r(\boldsymbol{z}_1)r(\boldsymbol{z}_2) \end{array} \end{array} / \begin{array}{cccc} & & & & \\ & & & & \\ \end{array}$$

754

**Corollary 1.** If z is a global optimizer and y is a unit, then z \* y is also a global optimizer. 755

*Proof.* Straightforward by leveraging the property of ring homomorphism. E.g., 756

$$r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{z} \ast \boldsymbol{y}) = r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{z})r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{y}) = r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{z})$$
(49)

and the proof is complete. 757

# 758 F Solution Construction (Proof)

**Lemma 2** (Solutions satisfying  $R_c$ ). All order-1 or order-2 solutions satisfying  $R_c$  must have  $r_{kkk} = 0$  for all k. With small  $L_2$  regularization, all order-3 solutions can be decomposed into  $\mathbf{z} = \tilde{\mathbf{z}}_{k_0} * \mathbf{y}$ for certain frequency  $k_0$ , where  $\tilde{\mathbf{z}}_{k_0} = {\tilde{\mathbf{z}}_{pkj}}$  has order 3 and corresponds to Fourier bases in the original domain:

$$\tilde{z}_{pk_0} = [1, \omega_3, \omega_3^2] / \sqrt[3]{6d}$$
(5)

where  $\omega_3 := e^{-2\pi i/3}$  and  $\boldsymbol{y}$  is a order-1 unit.

*Proof.* We first prove that  $\tilde{z}_{k_0}$  satisfies  $R_c$ . To see this, we have

$$r_{k_1k_2k} = \sum_j \mathbb{I}(k_1 = k_2 = k = k_0)\omega_3^{3j} + \sum_j \mathbb{I}(-k_1 = k_2 = k = k_0)\omega_3^j$$
(50)

$$+\ldots + \sum_{j} \mathbb{I}(-k_1 = -k_2 = -k = k_0)\bar{\omega}_3^{3j}$$
(51)

$$= \Im[(k_1 = k_2 = k = k_0) + \Im[(k_1 = k_2 = k = -k_0)]$$
(52)

Note that all cross terms are gone since  $\sum_{j} \omega_{3}^{j} = 0$ . It is clear that  $r_{k_{1}k_{2}k} \neq 0$  unless  $k_{1} = k_{2} = k$ so  $z_{0}$  satisfies  $R_{c}$ .

To show the reverse direction, first notice that for any order-1 solution, for any k, in order to make  $r_{k,-k,k} = z_{ak0}z_{b,-k,0}z_{ck0} = z_{ak0}\overline{z}_{bk0}z_{ck0} = 0$ , either  $z_{ak0}$ ,  $z_{bk0}$  or  $z_{ck0}$  has to be zero, which means that  $r_{kkk} = 0$ .

For order-2, first of all if any  $z_{pk0} = 0$  for any  $p \in \{a, b, c\}$ , then a constraint like  $r_{k,k,-k} = z_{ak0}z_{bk0}\overline{z}_{ck0} + z_{ak1}z_{bk1}\overline{z}_{ck1} = 0$  yields  $z_{ak1}z_{bk1}z_{ck1} = 0$  and thus  $r_{kkk} = 0$ . If not, then for any two complex numbers  $z_{pk0}$  and  $z_{pk1}$ , there always exist four real numbers  $\theta_p \in (-\pi, \pi], \theta'_p \in (-\pi, \pi], m_{p0} > 0$  and  $m_{p1} > 0$  so that

$$z_{pk0} = m_{p0} e^{i\theta'_p} e^{i\theta_p}, \qquad z_{pk1} = m_{p1} e^{i\theta'_p} e^{-i\theta_p}$$
(53)

Then a constraint like  $r_{k,k,-k} = z_{ak0}z_{bk0}\overline{z}_{ck0} + z_{ak1}z_{bk1}\overline{z}_{ck1} = 0$  can be written as  $z_{ak0}z_{bk0}\overline{z}_{ck0} = -z_{ak1}z_{bk1}\overline{z}_{ck1}$ , or equivalently:

$$m_{a0}m_{b0}m_{c0}e^{i(\theta_{a}'+\theta_{b}'+\theta_{c}')}e^{i(\theta_{a}+\theta_{b}-\theta_{c})} = -m_{a1}m_{b1}m_{c1}e^{i(\theta_{a}'+\theta_{b}'+\theta_{c}')}e^{-i(\theta_{a}+\theta_{b}-\theta_{c})}$$
(54)

$$m_{a0}m_{b0}m_{c0}e^{\mathrm{i}\theta_a}e^{\mathrm{i}\theta_b}e^{-\mathrm{i}\theta_c} = -m_{a1}m_{b1}m_{c1}e^{-\mathrm{i}\theta_a}e^{-\mathrm{i}\theta_b}e^{\mathrm{i}\theta_c}$$
(55)

Comparing their magnitude and phase, we have  $m_{a0}m_{b0}m_{c0} = m_{a1}m_{b1}m_{c1}$  and

$$\theta_a + \theta_b - \theta_c = \pm \pi/2 \mod 2\pi \tag{56}$$

777 Similarly, we have:

 $\theta_a + \theta_c - \theta_b = \pm \pi/2 \mod 2\pi, \qquad \theta_b + \theta_c - \theta_a = \pm \pi/2 \mod 2\pi$  (57)

<sup>778</sup> Solving the three equations and we have 6 solutions:

$$(\theta_a, \theta_b, \theta_c) = (0, 0, \pm \pi/2) \mod 2\pi \tag{58}$$

$$(\theta_a, \theta_b, \theta_c) = (0, \pm \pi/2, 0) \mod 2\pi$$
(59)

$$(\theta_a, \theta_b, \theta_c) = (\pm \pi/2, 0, 0) \mod 2\pi \tag{60}$$

For all such solutions, we have  $r_{kkk} = 0$ .

For order-3 solutions, for each k, let  $a_j := z_{akj}$ ,  $b_j := z_{bkj}$  and  $c_j := z_{ckj}$ . Let  $\boldsymbol{a} = [a_j] \in \mathbb{C}^3$ ,  $\boldsymbol{b} = [b_j] \in \mathbb{C}^3$  and  $\boldsymbol{c} = [c_j] \in \mathbb{C}^3$ . Then the conditions yield that

$$(\boldsymbol{a}\circ\bar{\boldsymbol{b}})^{\top}\boldsymbol{c}=0, \quad (\boldsymbol{a}\circ\bar{\boldsymbol{b}})^{\top}\bar{\boldsymbol{c}}=0, \quad (\bar{\boldsymbol{a}}\circ\boldsymbol{b})^{\top}\boldsymbol{c}=0, \quad (\bar{\boldsymbol{a}}\circ\boldsymbol{b})^{\top}\bar{\boldsymbol{c}}=0$$
 (61)

which means that in  $\mathbb{R}^3$  space, the following condition holds:

$$\operatorname{span}(\Re(\boldsymbol{a}\circ\boldsymbol{\bar{b}}),\Im(\boldsymbol{a}\circ\boldsymbol{\bar{b}}))\perp\operatorname{span}(\Re(\boldsymbol{c}),\Im(\boldsymbol{c}))$$
(62)

where  $\Re(\cdot)$  and  $\Im(\cdot)$  are real and imaginary parts of a complex vector. Since Eqn. 62 holds in  $\mathbb{R}^3$ ,

it must be the case that either  $\Re(a \circ \overline{b})$  is co-linear with  $\Im(a \circ \overline{b})$ , or  $\Re(c)$  is co-linear with  $\Im(c)$ .

If the former is true (i.e., there exists  $\beta$  so that  $\Re(c) = \beta \Im(c)$ ), then there exists a scalar  $\theta$  so that  $ce^{-i\theta} = c_R \in \mathbb{R}^3$ , since all angles in the components of c are the same. Then we have:

$$r_{kkk} = (\boldsymbol{a} \circ \boldsymbol{b})^{\top} \boldsymbol{c} = (\boldsymbol{a} \circ \boldsymbol{b})^{\top} \bar{\boldsymbol{c}} e^{2\mathrm{i}\theta} = 0$$
(63)

787 If the latter is true, then there exists  $\theta_{a\bar{b}}$  so that

$$(\boldsymbol{a} \circ \bar{\boldsymbol{b}}) e^{-\mathrm{i}\theta_{a\bar{b}}} \in \mathbb{R}^3_+$$
 (64)

Applying the same reasoning symmetrically, in order to find cases such that  $r_{kkk} \neq 0$ , a necessary condition is that

$$(\boldsymbol{a}\circ\bar{\boldsymbol{b}})e^{-\mathrm{i}\theta_{a\bar{b}}}\in\mathbb{R}^{3}_{+},\quad (\boldsymbol{b}\circ\bar{\boldsymbol{c}})e^{-\mathrm{i}\theta_{b\bar{c}}}\in\mathbb{R}^{3}_{+},\quad (\boldsymbol{c}\circ\bar{\boldsymbol{a}})e^{-\mathrm{i}\theta_{c\bar{a}}}\in\mathbb{R}^{3}_{+}$$
(65)

with the condition that  $\theta_{a\bar{b}} + \theta_{b\bar{c}} + \theta_{c\bar{a}} = 0 \mod 2\pi$ . To determine these angles, we look at  $a_0, b_0$ and  $c_0$  and their angles  $\theta_{a0}, \theta_{b0}$ , and  $\theta_{c0}$ , it is clear that

$$\theta_{a\bar{b}} = \theta_{a0} - \theta_{b0} \mod 2\pi \tag{66}$$

$$\theta_{b\bar{c}} = \theta_{b0} - \theta_{c0} \mod 2\pi \tag{67}$$

$$\theta_{c\bar{a}} = \theta_{c0} - \theta_{a0} \mod 2\pi \tag{68}$$

Therefore, if we multiple a, b and c with  $e^{-i\theta_{a0}}$ ,  $e^{-i\theta_{b0}}$  and  $e^{-i\theta_{c0}}$ , and still note the resulting vectors to be a, b and c, then we have:

$$\boldsymbol{a} \circ \bar{\boldsymbol{b}} \in \mathbb{R}^3_+, \quad \boldsymbol{b} \circ \bar{\boldsymbol{c}} \in \mathbb{R}^3_+, \quad \boldsymbol{c} \circ \bar{\boldsymbol{a}} \in \mathbb{R}^3_+$$
(69)

Note that is equivalent to a decomposition of z into a multiplication of 1-order term and another 3-order term. Then we have  $\theta_{a0} = \theta_{b0} = \theta_{c0} = \theta_0 = 0$ ,  $\theta_{a1} = \theta_{b1} = \theta_{c1} = \theta_1$ ,  $\theta_{a2} = \theta_{b2} = \theta_{c2} = \theta_2$ .

Letting  $m_j := |a_j||b_j||c_j|$ , then the corresponding  $r_{kkk}$  can be written as:

$$r_{kkk} = \sum_{j=0}^{2} m_j e^{3\mathrm{i}\theta_j} \tag{70}$$

with the constraints that  $\sum_{j=0}^{2} m_j e^{i\theta_j} = 0$  imposed by  $R_A$ . One interesting question is that what is the minimal norm representation that achieves the highest objective? For this we can solve the following optimization problem:

$$\max_{\{m_j,\theta_j\}} \sum_j m_j (e^{3i\theta_j} + e^{-3i\theta_j}) - \epsilon \sum_j m_j^2 \quad \text{s.t.} \ \sum_j m_j e^{i\theta_j} = 0 \tag{71}$$

which achieves the maximal when  $m_j = 1/\epsilon$ ,  $\theta_1 = 2\pi j/3$  and  $\theta_2 = 4\pi j/3$  (or vise versa). Note that  $\theta_j$  is fixed no matter how small the regularization  $\epsilon$  is.

803 To see that, let  $u_j := e^{i\theta_j}$ . Then we have:

$$\sum_{j} m_j (u_j + \bar{u}_j)^3 = \sum_{j} m_j [u_j^3 + 3u_j \bar{u}_j (u_j + \bar{u}_j) + \bar{u}_j^3] = \sum_{j} m_j (u_j^3 + \bar{u}_j^3)$$
(72)

<sup>804</sup> Therefore, we can instead solve the following optimization in  $\mathbb{R}$ :

$$\max_{\{m_j, -2 \le x_j \le 2, x_0 = 2\}} \sum_j m_j x_j^3 - \epsilon \sum_j m_j^2 \quad \text{s.t.} \ \sum_j m_j x_j = 0 \tag{73}$$

805 whose solutions give a sufficient condition. Using Lagrangian multiplier, we have:

$$\frac{\partial L}{\partial x_j} = m_j (3x_j^2 - \lambda) = 0, \qquad \frac{\partial L}{\partial m_j} = x_j^3 - 2\epsilon m_j - \lambda x_j = 0$$
(74)

which leads to  $\lambda = 3$ ,  $m_j = 1/\epsilon$  and  $x_1 = x_2 = -1$ . Therefore,  $u_1 = \omega_3$  and  $u_2 = \omega_3^2$  for 3-th root of unity  $\omega_3 = e^{2\pi/3}$  (or vise versa).

**Constructing**  $\mathbf{z}' \in R_{\circledast}$ . It is clear that  $r_{pmk_0k_0}(\tilde{\mathbf{z}}_{k_0}) \neq 0$  for  $m = \pm 2k_0$  so  $\tilde{\mathbf{z}}_{k_0} \notin R_{\circledast}$ . We construct  $\mathbf{z}'$  of order-2 so that  $r_{pmk_0k_0}(\mathbf{z}'_{k_0}) = 0$ :

$$z'_{pk1} = \mathbb{I}(k = k_0)\xi_p + \mathbb{I}(k = -k_0)\bar{\xi_p}, \qquad z'_{pk2} = \mathbb{I}(k = k_0)\bar{\xi_p} + \mathbb{I}(k = -k_0)\xi_p$$
(75)

with the constraint that  $\Re(\xi_p^2\xi_c) = 0$  (i.e., pure imaginary) for  $p \in \{a, b\}$  so that  $r_{pmk_0k_0}(z') = \xi_p^2\xi_c + \overline{\xi_p^2\xi_c} = 0$ , but  $\Re(\xi_a\xi_b\xi_c) > 0$  so that  $r_{k_0k_0k_0} = \xi_a\xi_b\xi_c + \overline{\xi_a\xi_b\xi_c} > 0$ . This is possible, e.g., by setting  $\xi_b = \overline{\xi_a} = e^{\pm \pi i/4}$  (i.e.,  $\omega_8$  or  $\overline{\omega}_8$ ),  $\xi_c = 1$ . **Corollary 4** (Perfect Memorization). Construct the following two d-order weights  $z_a$  and  $z_b$ . Specifically, for  $0 \le j < d$  and  $k \ne 0$ :

$$z_{akj}^{(a)} = \omega_d^{kj} / \sqrt{d}, \qquad z_{bkj}^{(a)} = 1 / \sqrt{d}, \qquad z_{ckj}^{(a)} = \omega_d^{-kj} / \sqrt{2d}$$
(9)

$$z_{bkj}^{(b)} = 1/\sqrt{d}, \qquad z_{akj}^{(b)} = \omega_d^{kj}/\sqrt{d}, \qquad z_{ckj}^{(b)} = \omega_d^{-kj}/\sqrt{2d}$$
 (10)

where  $\omega_d := e^{-2\pi i/d}$  is the d-th root of unity. Here  $\mathbf{z}_a \in R_c(k_1 \neq k) \cap R_n \cap R_{\circledast}(p = b \text{ or } m \neq k)$ ,  $\mathbf{z}_b \in R_c(k_2 \neq k) \cap R_n \cap R_{\circledast}(p = a \text{ or } m \neq k)$ . Then  $\mathbf{z}_M = \mathbf{z}_a * \mathbf{z}_b$  satisfies the global optimality condition (Eqn. 4) and is the perfect memorization solution with  $\operatorname{ord}(\mathbf{z}_M) = d^2$ :

$$z_{akj_1j_2}^{(M)} = \omega^{kj_1}/d, \qquad z_{bkj_1j_2}^{(M)} = \omega^{kj_2}/d, \qquad z_{ckj_1j_2}^{(M)} = \omega^{-k(j_1+j_2)}/2d$$
(11)

818 where each hidden node is indexed by  $j = (j_1, j_2), 0 \le j_1, j_2 < d, k \ne 0$ .

Proof. Simply plugging in the solution and check whether the equations specified the equations. For  $z_a$ , for k = 0 everything is zero; for  $k \neq 0$ , we have:

$$r_{k_1k_2k}(\boldsymbol{z}_a) = \sum_j a_{k_1j} b_{k_2j} c_{kj} = \frac{1}{d\sqrt{2d}} \sum_j \omega^{j(k_1-k)} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2d}} \mathbb{I}(k_1 = k \neq 0)$$
(76)

$$r_{amk'k}(\boldsymbol{z}_a) = \sum_{j} a_{k'j} a_{m-k',j} c_{kj} = \frac{1}{d\sqrt{2d}} \sum_{j} \omega^{j(m-k)} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2d}} \mathbb{I}(m = k \neq 0) \quad (77)$$

$$r_{bmk'k}(\boldsymbol{z}_a) = \sum_{j} b_{k'j} b_{m-k',j} c_{kj} = \frac{1}{d\sqrt{2d}} \sum_{j} \omega^{-jk} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2d}} \mathbb{I}(k=0) = 0$$
(78)

Therefore,  $z_a \in R_c(k_1 \neq k) \cap R_n \cap R_{\circledast}(p = b \text{ or } m \neq k)$ . Similar for  $z_b$ . For  $z_M := z_a * z_b$ , it satisfies all constraints (i.e., for any r, either  $z_a$  satisfies with  $r(z_a) = 0$ , or  $z_b$  satisfies with  $r(z_b) = 0$ ) and we have:

$$r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{z}_a \ast \boldsymbol{z}_b) = r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{z}_a)r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{z}_b) = 1/2d$$
(80)

So  $z_M$  satisfies the sufficient conditions (Eqn. 4).

# 825 G Gradient Dynamics (Proof)

**Theorem 4** (Dynamics of MPs). The dynamics of MPs satisfies  $\dot{\mathbf{r}} = -JJ^* \overline{\nabla_r \ell}$ , which has positive inner product with the negative gradient direction  $-\overline{\nabla_r \ell}$ .

Proof. By gradient descent of  $\mathcal{W}$ , we have  $\dot{\mathcal{W}} = -\overline{\nabla_{\mathcal{W}}\ell}$ . By chain rule, we have:

$$\dot{\mathcal{W}} = -\overline{\nabla_{\mathcal{W}}\ell} = -\overline{J^{\top}\nabla_{\boldsymbol{r}}\ell} = -J^*\overline{\nabla_{\boldsymbol{r}}\ell}$$
(81)

Then the dynamics of r = r(z(W)), as driven by the dynamics of W, is given by

$$\dot{\boldsymbol{r}} = J\dot{\mathcal{W}} = -JJ^*\overline{\nabla_{\boldsymbol{r}}\ell} \tag{82}$$

830 To show positive inner product, we have:

$$-\overline{\nabla_{\boldsymbol{r}}\ell}^*\dot{\boldsymbol{r}} = \overline{\nabla_{\boldsymbol{r}}\ell}^*JJ^*\overline{\nabla_{\boldsymbol{r}}\ell} = \|J^*\overline{\nabla_{\boldsymbol{r}}\ell}\|_2^2 \ge 0$$
(83)

831

**Theorem 5** (The Occam's Razer: Preference of low-order solutions). If z = y \* z' and both z (of order q) and z' are global optimal solutions, then there exists a path of zero loss connecting z and z'in the space of  $Z_q$ . As a result, lower-order solutions are preferred if trained with  $L_2$  regularization.

Proof. Let  $\operatorname{ord}(\boldsymbol{z}) = q$  and  $\operatorname{ord}(\boldsymbol{z}') = q'$ . Then q'|q. Since both  $\boldsymbol{z}$  and  $\boldsymbol{z}'$  are global optimal. Since  $r_{kkk}$  is ring homomorphism, we know that  $r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{z}) = r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{z}')r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{y}) = 1/2d = r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{z}')$  and thus  $r_{kkk}(\boldsymbol{y}) = 1$  for all  $k \neq 0$ . Let the augmented identity  $e \in \mathbb{Z}_q$  be  $e_{pmj} = \mathbb{I}(j=0)$ . Then  $r_{kkk}(e) = 1$  for all  $k \neq 0$ .

We want to construct a path in  $Z_q$ , the space of order-q solutions as follows:

$$\tilde{\boldsymbol{z}}(t) = \tilde{\boldsymbol{y}}(t) * \boldsymbol{z}', \qquad 0 \le t \le 1$$
(84)

in which  $\tilde{y}(0) = e$ ,  $\tilde{y}(1) = y$ , and  $r_{kkk}(\tilde{y}(t)) = 1$  for any t. To see why this is possible, pick a continuous family of trajectories  $\hat{y}(t; \lambda)$  with  $\lambda \in [0, 1]$  so that they satisfies

$$\hat{\boldsymbol{y}}(0;\lambda) = \boldsymbol{e}, \quad \hat{\boldsymbol{y}}(1;\lambda) = \boldsymbol{y}, \quad r_{kkk}(\hat{\boldsymbol{y}}(t;0)) \le 1, \quad r_{kkk}(\hat{\boldsymbol{y}}(t;1)) \le 1$$
(85)

which can always be achieved by scaling some trajectory with a factor that depends on  $\lambda$ . Then by intermediate theorem, there exists  $\lambda(t)$  so that  $r_{kkk}(\hat{y}(t;\lambda(t))) = 1$  for some k. Note that for different frequency k and k',  $r_{kkk}$  and  $r_{k'k'k'}$  involves disjoint components of z so we could find such a path for all  $k \neq 0$ .

Therefore, for any monomial potential r included in MSE loss (Eqn. 3), we have

$$r(\tilde{\boldsymbol{z}}(t)) = r(\tilde{\boldsymbol{y}}(t))r(\boldsymbol{z}') = \begin{cases} \text{finite} \cdot 0 = 0 & r \neq r_{kkk} \\ 1 \cdot 1/2d = 1/2d & r = r_{kkk} \end{cases}$$
(86)

and thus the entire trajectory  $\tilde{z}(t) = \tilde{y}(t) * z' \in \mathbb{Z}_q$  connecting z and e \* z', which is z' in the space of  $\mathbb{Z}_q$ , is also globally optimal.

To see why weight decay regularization leads to lower-order solution, we could simply compare the  $\ell_2$  norm of z = y \* z' and e \* z'. At each frequency k, this reduces to the following optimization

851 problem:

$$\min \sum_{j} |a_j|^2 + |b_j|^2 + |c_j|^2, \qquad \text{s.t.} \sum_{j} a_j b_j c_j = 1$$
(87)

where  $a_j := y_{akj}$ ,  $b_j := y_{bkj}$  and  $c_j := y_{ckj}$ . Since we know that arithmetic mean is no less than geometric mean:

$$\frac{|a_j|^2 + |b_j|^2 + |c_j|^2}{3} \ge \sqrt[3]{|a_j b_j c_j|^2}$$
(88)

854 We have:

$$\sum_{j} |a_j|^2 + |b_j|^2 + |c_j|^2 \ge 3 \sum_{j} |a_j b_j c_j|^{2/3} \ge 3$$
(89)

The last inequality holds because (1) if any  $|a_jb_jc_j| \ge 1$ , then it holds, (2) if all  $|a_jb_jc_j| < 1$ , then since  $a^x$  is a decreasing function for a < 1,  $\sum_j |a_jb_jc_j|^{2/3} \ge \sum_j |a_jb_jc_j| \ge |\sum_j a_jb_jc_j| = 1$ .

The minimizer is reached when  $|a_j| = |b_j| = |c_j|$ . Note that if  $a_j b_j c_j$  has any complex phase or negative, then in order to satisfy  $\sum_j a_j b_j c_j = 1$ , objective function needs to be larger. So without loss of generality, we could study  $a_j = b_j = c_j = x_j \ge 0$  and the optimization problem becomes

$$\min \sum_{j} x_{j}^{2}, \quad \text{s.t.} \sum_{j} x_{j}^{3} = 1, \quad x_{j} \ge 0$$
(90)

which has a minimizer at the corners (1, 0, ...). This corresponds to  $a_j = b_j = c_j = \mathbb{I}(j = 0)$ , which is the augmented identity  $e \in \mathbb{Z}_q$ .

**Theorem 6** (Infinite Width Limits at Initialization). Considering the modified loss of Eqn. 3 with only the first two terms:  $\tilde{\ell}_k := r_{kkk} + d \sum_{k_1k_2} |r_{k_1k_2k}|^2$ , if the weights are i.i.d Gaussian and network width  $q \to +\infty$ , then  $JJ^*$  converge to diagonal and the dynamics of MPs is decoupled.

#### Proof. For each component of $H = JJ^*$ , after computation, they can be written as the following:

$$h_{k_1k_2k_3,k_1'k_2'k_3'} = \sum_{pmj} \frac{\partial r_{k_1k_2k_3}}{\partial z_{pmj}} \frac{\partial r_{k_1'k_2'k_3'}}{\partial z_{pmj}}$$
(91)

$$= \mathbb{I}(k_1 = k_1') \sum_j b_{k_2 j} \bar{b}_{k_2' j} c_{k_3 j} \bar{c}_{k_3' j}$$
(92)

$$+ \mathbb{I}(k_2 = k_2') \sum_j a_{k_1 j} \bar{a}_{k_1' j} c_{k_3 j} \bar{c}_{k_3' j}$$
(93)

$$+ \mathbb{I}(k_3 = k'_3) \sum_j a_{k_1 j} \bar{a}_{k'_1 j} b_{k_2 j} \bar{b}_{k'_2 j}$$
(94)

- where  $a_{kj} := z_{akj}, b_{kj} := z_{bkj}$  and  $c_{kj} := z_{ckj}$ . Then for component  $(k_1k_2k_3, k'_1, k'_2, k'_3)$ , if any  $k_p \neq k'_p$  for some  $p \in \{a, b, c\}$ , then the corresponding  $z_{pk_pj}\bar{z}_{pk'_pj}$  has random phase for hidden node j, and  $h_{k_1k_2k_3,k'_1k'_2k'_3} \to 0$  when  $q \to +\infty$ .