551 Appendix

A CommonsenseQA Error Patterns

- 553 Throughout our experiments, we came across a variety of interesting failure cases for commonsense
- reasoning. Note that all the final answers are correct however, we take issue with the reasoning
- used in order to arrive at those answers.

556 A.1 Question Implies Answer

- 557 One key failure case was answers in the form of "the answer must be something that is <question
- property>. <answer> is <question property>. Therefore, the correct answer is <answer>." In these
- cases, the model fails to explain why the answer that it has chosen satisfies the question property.
- $_{\rm 560}$ Q: What might someone get from learning about science?
- 561 Answer Choices:
- 562 (a) headache
- 563 (b) see things differently
- 564 (c) increased knowledge
- 565 (d) accidents
- 566 (e) appreciation of nature
- 567 A: The answer must be something that someone would get from learning about
- 568 science. Learning about science would increase knowledge. Therefore, the
- 569 answer is increased knowledge (c).
- These rationales, while perhaps useful to the model, read to us as opaque and unexplanatory.

571 A.2 Begging the Question

- 572 A related but stronger version of the previous failure case, while less common, is particularly
- uninsightful. Sometimes the model will imply the answer that it has chosen in its question.
- 574 Q: The christian rock band was on a large stage, the singer's foot got caught
- on a wire and he had a small what?
- 576 Answer Choices:
- 577 (a) commit sin
- 578 (b) fail
- 579 (c) disobey
- 580 (d) stumble
- 581 (e) boo boo
- 582 A: The answer must be something that would cause the singer to stumble. The
- singer's foot got caught on a wire, so he would stumble. Therefore, the
- 584 answer is stumble (d).

85 A.3 Exercise to the Reader

- A rare failure case is when the model finds it unnecessary to justify its answer. For example:
- 587 Q: Other than school or from text where can one gain knowledge?
- 588 Answer Choices:
- 589 (a) book
- 590 (b) class
- 591 (c) thinking
- 592 (d) head
- 593 (e) meeting
- 594 A: The answer must be a place where someone can gain knowledge other than
- 595 school or from text. The answer is meeting (e).

A.4 World State Assertions

- Sometimes, the model will assume that it knows something about a subject or a person whose name 597 was used as a variable. This leads to somewhat comical examples of reasoning. Part of the reason 598 for this is that generally, there is an expectation that good rationales will leverage understanding of 599 more general classes of objects and appeal to the relationship between those general classes and the particular instance. For example, the argument that "a person would typically feel exhilaration from heights" is generally more compelling than the argument that "James would feel exhilaration from heights." 603 Q: A person's hand hurts after hitting the bottle. What might happen to 604 the bottle? 605 606 Answer Choices: (a) alcoholism 607 (b) breaking (c) fly 609 (d) nausea 610 (e) ticket 611 A: The answer must be something that happens to the bottle. The bottle is 612 broken. Therefore, the answer is breaking (b). 613 Q: James loved climbing. What emotion might he feel from heights? 614 Answer Choices: (a) exhaustion (b) exhilaration 617 (c) falling down 618 (d) nervousness 619 (e) vertigo 620 A: The answer must be a feeling that would cause someone to climb a mountain. 621 James would feel exhilaration from heights. Therefore, the answer is exhilaration (b). A.5 Red Herrings 624 Some errors in reasoning corresponded to the model making a statement which, while technically true, is not useful in demonstrating the claim. Q: A squirrel ran up to it's home, where is the small dog likely to be 627 barking up? Answer Choices:
- 626
- 628
- 629
- (a) manhattan apartment
- (b) wood
- (c) neighbor's yard 632
- (d) tree 633
- (e) basket 634
- A: The answer must be a place where a small dog would be likely to be 635
- barking. Squirrels are not small dogs. Therefore, the answer is tree (d). 636
- Q: John ran very fast, his feet touched the ground in what way? 637
- Answer Choices: 638
- (a) behind
- (b) loose
- (c) feverishly 641
- 642 (d) slowly
- 643 (e) lightly
- 644 A: The answer must be a way of running that is different from the way John
- ran. Running is a fast, light-footed activity. Therefore, the answer is
- lightly (e).

647 A.6 Hint Short-cutting

- In the experiments where the model was shown some examples of "hints" during training, in order to
- prevent it from losing the ability to perform rationalization over time, the model appeared to pick up
- on the fact that the final answer would always correspond to the hinted answer. This led to answers
- 651 such as
- 652 Q: Billy bought coffee and waited for his wife to arrive from France.
- 653 Where might he have been?
- 654 Answer Choices:
- 655 (a) airport
- 656 (b) grocery store
- 657 (c) internet cafe
- 658 (d) supermarket
- 659 (e) train station
- 660 A: The answer must be a place where Billy could have been waiting for his
- 661 wife to arrive from France. The airport is a place where people can wait
- 662 for flights. Therefore, the answer is train station (e).

663 B Modified CQA Prompts

```
For reference, we include our modified prompts based closely on those in [6].
664
    Q: What do people use to absorb extra ink from a fountain pen?
665
666
    Answer Choices:
    (a) shirt pocket
667
   (b) calligrapher's hand
668
   (c) inkwell
669
    (d) desk drawer
670
    (e) blotter
    A: The answer must be used to absorb extra ink. Blotters are designed to absorb
672
    liquids. Therefore, the answer is blotter (e).
673
674
675
    Q: What home entertainment equipment requires cable?
   Answer Choices:
676
    (a) radio shack
677
    (b) substation
678
    (c) television
679
    (d) cabinet
    (e) desk
681
    A: The answer must require cable. Cable is used to provide satellite channels to
682
    televisions. Therefore, the answer is television (c).
683
684
    Q: The fox walked from the city into the forest, what was it looking for?
686
   Answer Choices:
    (a) pretty flowers
687
    (b) hen house
688
    (c) natural habitat
690
    (d) storybook
    (e) dense forest
691
692
    A: The answer must be a reason for a fox to go into the forest. The forest is a fox'
    s natural habitat. Therefore, the answer is natural habitat (c).
693
694
695
   Q: Sammy wanted to go to where the people were. Where might he go?
   Answer Choices:
696
697
    (a) populated areas
698
    (b) race track
    (c) desert
699
    (d) apartment
700
    (e) roadblock
701
    A: The answer must be a place with many people. Populated areas, by definition, have
702
703
     a lot of people. Therefore, the answer is populated areas (a).
704
    Q: Where do you put your grapes just before checking out?
705
    Answer Choices:
706
    (a) mouth
708
    (b) grocery cart
    (c) super market
709
    (d) fruit basket
710
    (e) fruit market
    A: The answer should be the place where grocery items are placed before checking out
    . Of the above choices, grocery cart makes the most sense for holding grocery items.
713
     Therefore, the answer is grocery cart (b).
714
715
    Q: Google Maps and other highway and street GPS services have replaced what?
716
    Answer Choices:
717
718
   (a) united states
    (b) mexico
719
   (c) countryside
721 (d) atlas
722 (e) oceans
    A: The answer must be something that used to do what Google Maps and GPS services do
723
    , which is give directions. Atlases were also used to give directions. Therefore,
725
   the answer is atlas (d).
```

```
726
```

- 727 Q: Before getting a divorce, what did the wife feel who was doing all the work?
- 728 Answer Choices:
- 729 (a) harder
- 730 (b) anguish 731 (c) bitterness
- 732 (d) tears
- 733 (e) sadness
- $\,$ 734 $\,$ A: The answer should be a feeling which would cause someone who was doing all the
- 735 work to get divorced. If someone feels bitter towards their spouse, they are likely
- 736 to want a divorce. Therefore, the answer is bitterness (c).

C Human-evaluated Test Prompts

We also selected a random sampling of 50 questions which were correctly answered both few-shot 738 and by a STaR-trained model (without rationalization), as discussed in 4.4. Presented in a random 739 order, twenty crowdworkers preferred the STaR-generated answers. We reproduce the examples here 740 with the few-shot rationale first, the STaR-trained rationale second, and the human rationale third, 741 though these were shuffled when presented to participants. We selected human answers from [3]'s 742 original split rationales where possible, finding that duplicate rationales were much more common in 743 the new split rationales. For example, the explanation "Rivers flow trough valleys," appeared over 744 400 times verbatim in the new split dataset, and "This word was most relevant" appeared over 150 times. [3]'s dataset also includes explanations like "The only answer that makes sense" or "BOB WILL NOT POKEMON CARDS WERE COMMON AND WORTHLESS BUT WRONG ABOUT THEM SO FEEL REALLY RARE TO DELAY" or restatements of the answer. We append the phrase 748 "Therefore, the answer is ANSWERTEXT (ANSWERLETTER)" with ANSWERTEXT replaced 749 by the correct answer's text and ANSWERLETTER replaced by the correct answer letter. This is 750 done 1) to make it less obvious that one of the answers is generated by a different source and 2) to 751 prioritize differences in rationales, not the answer format. 752

Per Before the questions and after the consent form, we presented the following directions:

```
Each question will have three explanations for one answer, which is a pre-determined correct ("best") answer.

Each question will have three explanations for one answer, which is a pre-determined correct ("best") answer.

Please rank the explanations for each question from best to worst (with 1 as the best and 3 as the worst) based on how well they justify the correct answer.

Note there are some typos and grammatical errors in the examples, in the questions, answers, and the explanation. Please treat the answer letter (a / b / c / d / e) at the end of the explanations as the correct answer letter, even if another answer is valid (and perhaps more reasonable), and even if it does not match with the answer text preceding it.
```

The examples were subsampled and presented to the crowdworkers:

```
764
      Q: Who is likely yo have a caring heart?
                                                                        A: Having fun is enjoyable. Therefore, the answer is
765
      Answer Choices:
                                                                812
                                                                        enjoyable (e).
      (a) person
      (b) species
(c) artichoke
767
                                                                 814
768
                                                                 815
      (d) all mammals
                                                                 816
                                                                       Q: What happens when I make a pig of myself eating breakfast
770
      (e) live animal
                                                                817
771
       A: The answer must be a person. All mammals have a caring818
                                                                       Answer Choices:
       heart. Therefore, the answer is person (a).
                                                                       (a) full stomach
       A: The answer must be someone who is likely to have a
773
                                                                 820
                                                                       (b) gain energy
       caring heart. Humans are the most likely to have a caring821
                                                                       (c) dieting
775
       heart. Therefore, the answer is person (a).
776
       A: A person is the only human being capable of having a
                                                                823
                                                                       (e) feeling satisfied
       caring heart. Therefore, the answer is person (a).
                                                                 825
                                                                        A: The answer must be a feeling which would cause someone
779
      Q: If a person wanted to become a good writer what should 826
                                                                        to feel full after eating breakfast. The answer is full
781
      Answer Choices:
                                                                 828
                                                                        A: The answer must be a feeling which would cause someone
                                                                 829
782
      (a) word sentence
                                                                        to make a pig of themselves eating breakfast. If someone
783
      (b) own animal
                                                                 830
                                                                        feels full, they are likely to stop eating. Therefore, the
      (c) read the newspaper
784
                                                                 831
                                                                        answer is full stomach (a).
      (d) catch cold
                                                                        A: A colloquial phrase for over indulging in food.
      (e) study literature
                                                                        Therefore, the answer is full stomach (a)
786
                                                                 833
787
      A: The answer must be something that would help a person 834
       become a good writer. The answer is study literature (e).835
                                                                       Q: In order to see a story on the big screen what must you
       A: The answer must be something that would help a person 836
789
                                                                       do?
790
                                                                       Answer Choices:
       become a good writer. Literature is a form of study.
                                                                 837
       Therefore, the answer is study literature (e).
                                                                       (a) go to movies
       A: studying literature will give one skills of writing.
                                                                 839
                                                                       (b) visualize
793
                                                                 840
       Therefore, the answer is study literature (e).
                                                                       (c) reading
795
      Q: The human always would have fun making up questions for 842
                                                                       (e) sketching a picture
796
      the A.I. overlords, he found the task quite what?
                                                                 843
                                                                        A: The answer must be something that you do to see a story \ensuremath{\mathsf{A}}
      Answer Choices:
                                                                 844
798
      (a) do enjoy
                                                                845
                                                                        on the big screen. Movies are a way to see a story on the
                                                                        big screen. Therefore, the answer is movies (a).
799
      (b) eat cake
                                                                846
ຂດດ
      (c) enjoy living
                                                                           The answer must be something that is required to see a
                                                                 848
801
      (d) get laid
                                                                        story on the big screen. Movies are a form of storytelling.
802
                                                                         Therefore, the answer is go to movies (a).
      (e) enjoyable
803
                                                                 850
                                                                        A: The big screen is a colloquial term meaning a movie
804
       A: The answer must be something that the human would enjogs51
                                                                        theater. Therefore, the answer is go to movies (a).
       doing. The human enjoys making up questions for the A.I. 852
806
       overlords. Therefore, the answer is enjoyable (e).
                                                                 853
                                                                       Q: What is the opposite of remembering?
      Answer Choices:
                                                                       (a) answering question
809
       for the A.I. overlords enjoyable. Therefore, the answer {\rm i} 8\!\!\! 56
                                                                       (b) stopping to think
       enjoyable (e).
                                                                       (c) knowing
                                                                       (d) closing eyes
```

```
859
                                                                     950
                                                                             A: A machine part is the only thing listed that would fix
       (e) forgetting
       A: The answer must be something that is the opposite of
860
                                                                     951
                                                                              the car. Therefore, the answer is machine part (d)
861
       remembering. The answer is forgetting (e).
                                                                     952
       A: The answer must be a feeling which would cause someone953
                                                                            Q: He always traveled up the mountain when winter arrived,
863
       to not remember something. If someone forgets something, 954
                                                                            he had a passion and desire to do what?
864
       they are likely to not remember it. Therefore, the answer955 is forgetting (e). $956\,
                                                                            Answer Choices:
                                                                             (a) play volleyball
       A: Health complications. Therefore, the answer is
                                                                             (b) play hockey
866
                                                                     957
867
       forgetting (e).
                                                                     958
                                                                             (c) ski
868
                                                                             (d) knit
      \mathtt{Q}\colon If you aren't experiencing curiosity and want to ensure 960
869
                                                                             (e) skate
      viewing enjoyment, what may you watch?
870
                                                                     961
                                                                             A: The answer must be something that the person does when
                                                                              winter arrives. The answer is skiing (c).
       Answer Choices:
872
       (a) examine thing
                                                                     963
                                                                             A: The answer must be something that the person did when
873
                                                                     964
                                                                             winter arrived. The answer is ski (c).
       (b) stare into a mirror
874
       (c) go somewhere
                                                                              A: Skiing is the only option that is done on a mountain.
875
       (d) hear news
                                                                     966
                                                                             Therefore, the answer is ski (c)
876
                                                                     967
       (e) see favorite show
       A: The answer must be something that will make you want t968
                                                                            Q: Bob thought that his Pokemon cards were common and
877
878
       watch. If you are not experiencing curiosity, you may wan $69
                                                                            worthless, but he was wrong about them. They were really
       to watch something that will make you want to watch.
879
                                                                            what?
       Therefore, the answer is watch (e).
ጸጸበ
                                                                            Answer Choices
       A: The answer must be something that will not cause you 1972 want to watch. If you are not experiencing curiosity, you973
881
                                                                             (a) personal
                                                                             (b) special
882
883
       are likely to want to watch something that is entertainin@74
                                                                             (c) shiny
884
         Therefore, the answer is favorite show (e).
                                                                             (d) rare
885
       A: see favorite show can you do in front of a tv if you
                                                                             (e) irregular
888
       have curiosity about what is being displayed on the tv.
                                                                     977
                                                                             A: The answer must be something that is not common and
887
       Therefore, the answer is favorite show (e).
                                                                             worthless. Pokemon cards are not common and worthless.
                                                                             Therefore, the answer is rare (d).
888
      Q: The carotid is a main artery susceptible to damage wher
889
                                                                             A: The answer must be something that are rare. Pokemon
890
       Answer Choices:
                                                                             cards are rare. Therefore, the answer is rare (d).
                                                                     981
                                                                              A: BOB WILL NOT POKEMON CARDS WERE COMMON AND WORTHLESS BUT
891
       (a) neck
                                                                     982
                                                                              WRONG ABOUT THEM SO FEEL REALLY RARE TO DELAY. Therefore,
892
       (b) face
                                                                     983
893
       (c) busy city
                                                                             the answer is rare (d).
894
       (d) torso
                                                                     985
                                                                            Q: If you're lighting a candle to see what are you in?
895
                                                                     986
       (e) human body
       A: The answer must be a place where the carotid artery is987
                                                                             Answer Choices:
897
       susceptible to damage. The carotid artery is located in \ensuremath{\mathfrak{t}}\xspace3488
                                                                             (a) dimly lit room
898
        neck. Therefore, the answer is neck (a).
                                                                     989
                                                                             (b) synagogue
899
       A: The answer must be a place where the carotid is
                                                                     990
                                                                             (c) sunlight
900
       susceptible to damage. The carotid is susceptible to dama@91
                                                                             (d) birthday cake
901
        in the neck. Therefore, the answer is neck (a).
                                                                     992
                                                                             (e) bedroom
ana
       A: The carotid artery is located in the neck. Therefore, 993
                                                                             A: The answer must be a place where you can see what you
                                                                             are in. The answer is a room with dim lighting. Therefore, the answer is dimly lit room (a).
903
       the answer is neck (a).
                                                                     994
904
                                                                      995
ans
      Q: The king needed to feel safe, where did he go?
                                                                             A: The answer must be a place where you can see a candle.
                                                                     age
906
      Answer Choices:
                                                                     997
                                                                             Candles are used to see things in the dark. Therefore, the
907
       (a) castle
                                                                             answer is dimly lit room (a).
908
       (b) throne room
                                                                     999
                                                                             A: Lighting or illumination is the deliberate use of light
                                                                    1000
909
       (c) deck of cards
                                                                             to achieve a practical or aesthetic effect. Lighting
                                                                              includes the use of both artificial light sources like
910
       (d) fort
                                                                     1001
911
       (e) court
                                                                    1002
                                                                             lamps ... Therefore, the answer is dimly lit room (a).
912
       A: The answer must be a place where the king feels safe.1003
913
       The king's castle is a place where he feels safe. Therefb004
                                                                            Q: The person was thirsty, what should he have done?
914
         the answer is castle (a).
                                                                            Answer Choices:
915
       A: The answer must be a place where the king can feel saf@06
                                                                             (a) eat
         Castles are places where kings feel safe. Therefore, the 007
916
                                                                             (b) sunny days
917
       answer is castle (a).
                                                                             (c) compliments
918
       A: In general, King live in castle. Therefore, the answef009
                                                                             (d) drink water
                                                                             (e) all kinds of things
919
       is castle (a).
                                                                    1010
920
                                                                    1011
                                                                             A: The answer must be something that would make the person
                                                                             feel better. If the person is thirsty, he should drink
      Q: What is the result of instituting civil action?
                                                                     1012
922
       Answer Choices:
                                                                    1013
                                                                             water. Therefore, the answer is drink water (d).
923
                                                                    1014
                                                                             A: The answer must be something that would make someone
       (a) bad feelings
                                                                     1015
                                                                              feel better if they were thirsty. If someone is thirsty,
       (b) confusion
925
       (c) going to court
                                                                    1016
                                                                             they are likely to want to drink water. Therefore, the
926
       (d) hurt feelings
                                                                    1017
                                                                             answer is drink water (d).
927
       (e) sandwiches
                                                                     1018
                                                                              A: The person was thirsty, so drink water. Therefore, the
928
       A: The answer must be a result of instituting civil actibal9
                                                                             answer is drink water (d)
         The result of instituting civil action is a lawsuit.
930
       Therefore, the answer is going to court (c).
                                                                    1021
                                                                            Q: Where would you find many products for sale?
       A: The answer must be a result of instituting civil actit@22
If someone goes to court, they are likely to feel hurt 1023
931
                                                                            Answer Choices:
                                                                             (a) market
933
       feelings. Therefore, the answer is going to court (c). 1024
A: Anger and Trial will not institute a court case. 1025
                                                                             (b) cost one dollar
934
                                                                             (c) shelf
       Therefore, the answer is going to court (c).
                                                                             (d) salon
                                                                     1027
                                                                             (e) demonstration
                                                                    1028
                                                                             A: The answer must be a place where many products are sold.
936
      Q: The person wanted to fix his car, what did he order?
                                                                              A market is a place where many products are sold.
937
       Answer Choices:
                                                                    1030
                                                                             Therefore, the answer is market (a)
938
       (a) selling things
                                                                     1031
                                                                             A: The answer must be a place with a lot of products for
939
       (b) gas
                                                                              sale. Markets are the most common place to buy products.
                                                                     1032
940
       (c) feel resentful
                                                                     1033
                                                                             Therefore, the answer is market (a)
       (d) machine part
941
                                                                     1034
                                                                             A: The only place products are for sale are in markets and
942
       (e) cross street
       (e) cross street 1035
A: The answer must be something that would help the person 1036
                                                                              stores. Therefore, the answer is market (a).
       A: The answer must be someoning that south and reserve things, 1036 fix his car. The person would not want to sell things, 1037 because he would not want to give up his car. Therefore,1038
944
                                                                            Q: If man and mammoth wanted to meet, they would probably
945
                                                                            have to do it during when?
946
       the answer is machine part (d).
       A: The answer must be something that would be used to fix
                                                                            Answer Choices:
947
                                                                             (a) a baby shower
         car. Machine parts are used to fix cars. Therefore, the 1041
                                                                             (b) ancient history
       answer is machine part (d).
```

```
1042
        (c) storybook
                                                                        1133
                                                                                 A: The answer must be a physical gesture that is used to
1043
                                                                                 greet someone. The answer is handshake (c).
                                                                        1134
1044
        (e) forest
                                                                        1135
                                                                                  A: The answer must be a gesture used to meet people. If
         A: The answer must be a time when man and mammoth would 1136
                                                                                  someone wants to meet people, they are likely to want to
1046
         meet. Stone age is the time when man and mammoth lived. 1137
                                                                                  shake hands. Therefore, the answer is shaking hands (c).
1047
         Therefore, the answer is stone age (d).
                                                                                 A: A handshake is a globally widespread. Therefore, the
         A: The answer must be a time when man and mammoth would be39
1048
                                                                                  answer is shaking hands (c).
1049
         1050
          would be able to meet. Therefore, the answer is stone at 41
                                                                                Q: What do dogs get that make them itch?
1051
                                                                                Answer Choices:
         A: During the stone age is the only time mammoths lived.1143
Therefore, the answer is stone age (d).
1052
                                                                                 (a) bones
1053
                                                                                 (b) fleas
1054
                                                                                 (c) bad breath
        Q: They prided themselves on being a wealth of knowledge,1146 and that's why many chose to attend their what? $1147
1055
                                                                                 (d) wagging tails
1056
                                                                                 (e) four legs
                                                                                 A: The answer must be something that makes dogs itch. Dogs
        Answer Choices:
1057
                                                                        1148
                                                                                  get fleas, which make them itch. Therefore, the answer is
1058
        (a) book store
                                                                        1149
1059
                                                                                  fleas (b).
        (b) university
                                                                        1150
1060
                                                                        1151
                                                                                  A: The answer must be something that dogs get that make
        (c) meeting
1061
        (d) class
                                                                        1152
                                                                                 them itch. Fleas are a common cause of dog itch. Therefore,
1062
                                                                        1153
                                                                                  the answer is fleas (b).
        (e) encyclopedia
1063
         A: The answer must be a place where people go to learn
                                                                        1154
                                                                                 A: fleas makes you itch. Therefore, the answer is fleas (b).
1064
         about things. The answer is university (b).
                                                                        1155
1065
         A: The answer must be a place where people go to learn
1066
         about things. Universities are places where people go to 1157 learn about things. Therefore, the answer is university (158
                                                                                \ensuremath{\mathbb{Q}} \colon What is ignorance often equated with?
1067
                                                                                Answer Choices:
                                                                                 (a) bliss
1068
1069
         A: because in the university you get more knowledge.
                                                                        1160
                                                                                 (b) hostility
1070
         Therefore, the answer is university (b).
                                                                        1161
                                                                                 (c) peace
1071
                                                                                 (d) accidents
                                                                        1162
1072
        0: what happens when visiting museum that have narrow hall1863
                                                                                 (e) find truth
1073
        Answer Choices:
                                                                                 A: The answer must be something that is often equated with
                                                                        1164
1074
        (a) sore feet
                                                                                  ignorance. Bliss is often equated with ignorance. Therefore,
                                                                        1165
1075
        (b) amazement
                                                                        1166
                                                                                  the answer is bliss (a).
1076
        (c) retrospection
                                                                        1167
                                                                                  A: The answer must be a feeling which would cause someone
1077
        (d) boredom
                                                                        1168
                                                                                  to be ignorant. If someone feels bliss, they are likely to
1078
                                                                                 be ignorant. Therefore, the answer is bliss (a).
        (e) crowding
                                                                        1169
1079
         A: The answer must be something that happens when visitiht 70
                                                                                  A: bliss comes from ignorance. Therefore, the answer is
         a museum that has narrow halls. Crowding is a common 1171 problem in museums. Therefore, the answer is crowding (e)172
1080
1081
1082
         A: The answer must be something that would cause someone 1 t23
                                                                                Q: The two teams were competing all the time, what likely
1083
          have sore feet if they are walking in narrow halls. If 1174
                                                                                developed between them?
         someone feels cramped, they are likely to want to go somewhere else. Therefore, the answer is crowding (e). 1176
                                                                                Answer Choices:
1084
1085
                                                                                 (a) accomplishment
1086
         A: museum is one of the crowdest place. Therefore, the 1177
                                                                                 (b) enemies
1087
         answer is crowding (e).
                                                                                 (c) rivalry
1088
                                                                        1170
                                                                                 (d) friendship
        Q: On their hike they brought a filtering straw, they were 180 worried about germs in the what?
1089
                                                                                 (e) bad blood
1090
                                                                                 A: The answer must be something that developed between the
1091
        Answer Choices:
                                                                        1182
                                                                                 two teams. The teams were competing all the time. Therefore,
1092
                                                                                  the answer is rivalry (c).
        (a) make sick
                                                                        1183
                                                                                 A: The answer must be a feeling which would cause two teams
1093
        (b) doctor
                                                                                  to compete all the time. Rivalry is a common feeling which would cause two teams to compete all the time. Therefore,
1094
        (c) water
                                                                        1185
1095
                                                                        1186
        (d) stream
1096
                                                                                  the answer is rivalry (c).
1097
         A: The answer must be something that can filter out germ$188
                                                                                 A: likely developed between them of rivalry. Therefore, the
         Filtering straws are used to filter out germs. Therefore,189
1098
                                                                                  answer is rivalry (c).
         the answer is filtering straw (c).
1099
         A: The answer must be something that would cause someone 1t91 bring a filtering straw on a hike. Filtering straws are 1192
1100
                                                                                Q: James doesn't want a relationship. He thinks that loving
1101
                                                                                another will only create what?
1102
         used to filter water. Therefore, the answer is water (c)1193
                                                                                Answer Choices:
1103
         A: straw it something used to drink water. Therefore, the 194
                                                                                 (a) satisfaction
         answer is water (c).
                                                                                 (b) jealousy
1105
                                                                        1196
                                                                                 (c) happiness
1106
        Q: If I am not good at playing poker, I will begin what iff197
                                                                                 (d) wonderful
        play?
Answer Choices:
1108
                                                                        1199
                                                                                 A: The answer must be something that would make James feel
                                                                                 bad about not having a relationship. If someone feels
1109
        (a) discord
                                                                        1200
1110
        (b) social event
                                                                        1201
                                                                                 jealous, they are likely to want a relationship. Therefore,
1111
        (c) losing money
                                                                        1202
                                                                                 the answer is jealousy (b).
A: The answer must be a feeling which would cause someone
1112
        (d) competition
1113
        (e) heightened awareness
                                                                        1204
                                                                                  who doesn't want a relationship to not want one. If someone
         A: The answer must be something that will happen if you 1205 not good at playing poker. If you are not good at playing 1606
                                                                                 feels jealous of another, they are likely to not want a relationship. Therefore, the answer is jealousy (b).
1114
1115
                                                                                 A: Jealousy is a negative emotion. Therefore, the answer is jealousy (b).
         poker, you will begin to lose money. Therefore, the answe207
1116
1117
         is losing money (c).
         A: The answer must be something that will help you if you209
1118
         are not good at playing poker. If you are losing money, 1/210 are likely to want to stop playing. Therefore, the answer11
1119
                                                                                \mathbb{Q}\colon The had a reputation for celebrating in a debaucherous
1120
                                                                                manner, what often happened as a result?
1121
         is losing money (c).
                                                                        1212
                                                                                 Answer Choices:
1122
         A: Poker is a game in which people lose their money.
                                                                        1213
                                                                                 (a) drunkenness
1123
         Therefore, the answer is losing money (c).
                                                                        1214
                                                                                 (b) enjoyment
                                                                                 (c) have fun
1124
        Q: People are meeting people, what is the likely physical 216
1125
                                                                                 (d) hang over
1126
                                                                        1217
                                                                                 (e) fighting
        gesture?
1127
        Answer Choices:
                                                                        1218
                                                                                 A: The answer must be a result of a celebration. The answer
1128
        (a) introducing yourself
                                                                        1219
                                                                                  is drunkenness (a).
1129
        (b) smiling
                                                                        1220
                                                                                  A: The answer must be something that would cause someone to
1130
        (c) shake hands
                                                                        1221
                                                                                  have a reputation for celebrating in a debaucherous manner.
        (d) share a hug
1131
                                                                        1222
                                                                                  Alcohol is a depressant. Therefore, the answer is
        (e) talking
                                                                        1223
```

```
1224
         A: it is normal not a good idea to get drunk. Therefore, 1315
                                                                             Q: James was cooking s stew in his apartment kitchen. Where
                                                                             might he look for a potato.
1225
         the answer is drunkenness (a).
1226
                                                                     1317
                                                                             Answer Choices:
1227
       Q: The paper towels are usually in plain sight in the
                                                                      1318
                                                                              (a) restaurants
1228
       kitchen, where did the dad go next to find them?
                                                                      1319
                                                                              (b) casserole
1229
       Answer Choices:
                                                                     1320
                                                                              (c) root cellar
1230
        (a) pantry
                                                                      1321
                                                                              (d) pockets
1231
        (b) cabinet
                                                                     1322
                                                                              (e) pantry
                                                                              A: The answer must be a place where potatoes are stored.
1232
        (c) procery store
                                                                     1323
1233
        (d) waste bin
                                                                      1324
                                                                              The answer is pantry (e).
1234
        (e) market
                                                                     1325
                                                                              A: The answer must be a place where potatoes are stored.
         A: The answer must be a place where the dad would go to 1326
1235
                                                                               Pantries are the most likely place to store potatoes.
         find the paper towels. The pantry is a place where food 1327
1236
                                                                               Therefore, the answer is pantry (e).
1237
         stored. Therefore, the answer is pantry (a).
                                                                     1328
                                                                              A: apartments do not often have root cellars, and are not
1238
         A: The answer must be a place where paper towels are stof 329
                                                                              restaurants. a pantry is closest to James inside his
          Pantries are the most likely place to store paper towel $230
                                                                               apartment. Therefore, the answer is pantry (e).
1239
        Therefore, the answer is pantry (a).

A: The pantry is in the kitchen and stores things.
1240
                                                                     1331
1241
                                                                             Q: If ships are in a storm and the sun comes out, what has
                                                                     1332
1242
         Therefore, the answer is pantry (a).
                                                                     1333
                                                                             happened?
1243
                                                                     1334
                                                                             Answer Choices:
       Q: My house is very dry, with little water in the air. Whas35
1244
                                                                              (a) sinks
1245
        tool should I use to fix this?
                                                                     1336
                                                                              (b) cross river
1246
       Answer Choices:
                                                                     1337
                                                                              (c) collide
1247
        (a) humidifier
                                                                      1338
                                                                              (d) bottom out
1248
        (b) surface of earth
                                                                     1339
                                                                              (e) carry people
1249
                                                                              A: The answer must be a thing that happens when ships are
        (c) skating rink
                                                                      1340
1250
        (d) ice cube
                                                                      1341
                                                                               in a storm and the sun comes out. Ships are in a storm when
1251
        (e) burn it to the ground
                                                                     1342
                                                                               they are in the middle of the ocean. Therefore, the answer
         A: The answer must be a tool that will make the air in y60243
1252
                                                                               is bottom out (d).
1253
                                                                               A: The answer must be something that happens when the sun
          house moist. A humidifier is a tool that will make the 1344
1254
          in your house moist. Therefore, the answer is humidifier345
                                                                              comes out. The sun is a source of energy. Therefore, the
1255
                                                                               answer is bottom out (d).
1256
         A: The answer must be something that would make the air 1347
                                                                               A: the sun comes out so its not a storm any more. Therefore,
1257
         my house more humid. A humidifier is used to make the ait348
                                                                               the answer is bottom out (d).
         in a room more humid. Therefore, the answer is humidifief349
1258
                                                                             Q: Where do all marmot live before they are captured?
1259
         A: This word was most relevant. Therefore, the answer is1351
1260
                                                                             Answer Choices:
1261
                                                                              (a) switzerland
1262
                                                                      1353
                                                                              (b) spain
1263
       Q: A motorcycle is quicker because it isn't as what as a 13254
                                                                              (c) vancouver island
                                                                              (d) wilderness
1264
                                                                     1355
1265
        Answer Choices:
                                                                     1356
                                                                              (e) australia
                                                                              A: The answer must be a place where marmots live. Marmots live in the wilderness. Therefore, the answer is wilderness
1266
                                                                     1357
        (a) heavy
        (b) shiny
1267
                                                                      1358
1268
        (c) red
                                                                     1359
                                                                               (d).
1269
        (d) obesity
                                                                               A: The answer must be a place where marmots are found. The
1270
        (e) expensive
                                                                     1361
                                                                              wilderness is the most likely place to find marmots.
        A: The answer must be something that is not as heavy as 1362 car. A motorcycle is lighter than a car. Therefore, the 1363
1271
                                                                              Therefore, the answer is wilderness (d).
                                                                               A: Marmots don't live in Australia or Switzerland.
1272
1273
        answer is not heavy (a). 1364
A: The answer must be something that is not as quick as 4365
                                                                              Therefore, the answer is wilderness (d).
1274
1275
         motorcycle. Motorcycles are not as heavy as cars. Thereft366
                                                                             Q: Where does one wait on a bench for something on tracks?
        the answer is heavy (a). 1367
A: Because it is much smaller. Therefore, the answer is 1368
1276
                                                                             Answer Choices:
1277
                                                                              (a) train station
1278
         heavy (a).
                                                                              (b) state park
1279
                                                                     1370
                                                                              (c) crosswalk
1280
       Q: The baseball team was playing ball. It was time for the 371
                                                                              (d) bus stop
       pitcher to act. How did the pitcher get the ball to the 1372
1281
1282
        batter?
                                                                     1373
                                                                              A: The answer must be a place where one waits for a train.
        Answer Choices:
1283
                                                                      1374
                                                                              bus, or other vehicle. The answer is train station (a).
1284
        (a) lose
                                                                     1375
                                                                              A: The answer must be a place where one can wait for a
1285
        (b) injury
                                                                     1376
                                                                              train. Train stations are places where trains stop.
        (c) competition
                                                                              Therefore, the answer is train station (a).
        (d) throwing
1287
                                                                     1378
                                                                              A: Only trains are on tracks. Therefore, the answer is
1288
        (e) rolled
                                                                     1379
                                                                              train station (a).
1289
            The answer must be a way to get the ball to the batte1380
1290
         The pitcher is the one who throws the ball. Therefore, that1
                                                                             Q: What can planning vacation lead to between a couple when
1291
         answer is throwing (d).
                                                                     1382
                                                                             they disagree?
1292
         A: The answer must be a way for the pitcher to get the ba383
                                                                             Answer Choices:
1293
         to the batter. The pitcher is the person who is 1384 responsible for getting the ball to the batter. Therefore385
                                                                              (a) relaxation
1294
                                                                              (b) enjoying
1295
         the answer is throwing (d).
                                                                     1386
                                                                              (c) arguments
        A: The pitcher threw the ball to the batter so that he could hit it. Therefore, the answer is throwing (d).
1296
                                                                     1387
                                                                              (d) going abroad
1297
                                                                              (e) spending money
                                                                     1389
                                                                              A: The answer must be something that can happen when a
1298
       Q: In what sort of container should you keep your figus? 1390
                                                                              couple disagrees. Arguments are a common result of disagreements. Therefore, the answer is arguments (c).
1299
1300
        Answer Choices:
                                                                      1391
1301
        (a) refigerator
                                                                     1392
                                                                              A: The answer must be a result of planning vacation.
1302
        (b) screened porch
                                                                      1393
                                                                              Arguments are a common result of planning vacation.
1303
        (c) clay pot
                                                                      1394
                                                                               Therefore, the answer is arguments (c).
1304
        (d) shady places
                                                                     1395
                                                                              A: Arguments are the direct result of disagreements.
1305
        (e) arboretum
                                                                     1396
                                                                              Therefore, the answer is arguments (c).
         A: The answer must be a container that keeps the ficus if 397
1306
                                                                             O: A sloth climbs slow but it can eventually reach all the
1307
          shady place. Clay pots are used to keep plants in shady1398
1308
         places. Therefore, the answer is clay pot (c).
                                                                             way up where?
1309
         A: The answer must be a container in which ficus can be 1400
                                                                              Answer Choices:
1310
         kept. Ficus are tropical plants. Therefore, the answer it401
                                                                              (a) forest canopy
1311
         clay pot (c).
                                                                              (b) universe
                                                                              (c) tropical rainforest
1312
         A: Clay pot is the only type of container listed. Therefb403
1313
          the answer is clay pot (c).
                                                                     1404
                                                                              (d) large trees
1314
                                                                      1405
                                                                              (e) nature preserve
```

```
1406
        A: The answer must be a place where a sloth can climb. Th498
                                                                            A: The answer must be something that would protect legs
1407
        forest canopy is the highest point in the forest. Therefb499
                                                                             from getting dirty on the farm. Jeans are used to protect
1408
         the answer is forest canopy (a).
                                                                   1500
                                                                            legs from getting dirty. Therefore, the answer is wear
1409
        A: The answer must be a place where a sloth can climb. The 01
                                                                            jeans (a).
1410
        canopy of a forest is the highest point in a forest.
                                                                    1502
                                                                             A: Jeans cover over legs. Therefore, the answer is wear
1411
        Therefore, the answer is canopy of a forest (a). 1503
A: The sloth is a mammal that lives in the trees of South504
                                                                            ieans (a)
1413
        America. They have a slow and peculiar way of moving about 505
                                                                           Q: What types of stoves are there?
1414
         In fact, they are the slowest land mammals and travel vertoo
                                                                           Answer Choices:
1415
                                                                            (a) these twos are irrelevent to the questions
         sluggishly on the ground (0.025 m/s-0.050 m/s). Therefol:507
1416
         the answer is canopy of a forest (a).
                                                                            (b) warm pot of beans
                                                                    1508
1417
                                                                    1509
                                                                            (c) brown meat
1418
       Q: Where in America is known for theaters?
                                                                    1510
                                                                            (d) warm room
                                                                            (e) gas or electric
1419
       Answer Choices:
                                                                    1511
                                                                            A: The answer must be a type of stove. The stove is used to
1420
                                                                    1512
       (a) new york city
                                                                             heat food. Therefore, the answer is gas or electric (e).
1421
        (b) shopping mall
                                                                    1513
1422
       (c) downtown area
                                                                    1514
                                                                            A: The answer must be a type of stove. Stoves are used to
1423
                                                                            warm rooms. Therefore, the answer is electric (e).
                                                                    1515
       (d) skating rink
1424
                                                                    1516
                                                                            A: stoves are gas or electric. Therefore, the answer is gas
       (e) military base
1425
                                                                    1517
                                                                             or electric (e).
1426
        A: The answer must be a place where people go to see movi588
1427
         Theaters are places where people go to see movies.
                                                                           {\tt Q}\colon In what geological feature will you find fungus growing?
                                                                    1519
        Therefore, the answer is theater (a).
1428
                                                                    1520
                                                                           Answer Choices:
1429
        A: The answer must be a place with a lot of theaters.
                                                                            (a) shower stall
1430
        York City is known for its many theaters. Therefore, the 1522
                                                                            (b) toenails
1431
        answer is New York City (a).
                                                                    1523
                                                                            (c) basement
1432
        A: New York City is the main region in US known for
                                                                    1524
                                                                            (d) forrest
1433
        theaters. Therefore, the answer is New York City (a).
                                                                    1525
                                                                            (e) cave
1434
                                                                    1526
                                                                            A: The answer must be a place where fungus grows. The
1435
       Q: What does hearing someone play violin beautifully make 527
                                                                             answer is cave (e).
1436
       you?
                                                                    1528
                                                                            A: The answer must be a place where fungus grows. Fungus
1437
       Answer Choices:
                                                                    1529
                                                                            grows in caves. Therefore, the answer is cave (e).
1438
                                                                    1530
                                                                             A: Rivers flow trough valleys. Therefore, the answer is
        (a) buy earplugs
1439
       (b) inspiring
                                                                    1531
                                                                            cave (e).
1440
       (c) guitar
                                                                    1532
1441
        (d) make music
                                                                    1533
                                                                           \mathbb{Q}: What is our sun considered to be the center of?
1442
                                                                    1534
       (e) like music
                                                                           Answer Choices:
1443
        A: The answer must be something that makes you feel
                                                                    1535
                                                                            (a) universe
        inspired. Hearing someone play violin beautifully makes 1506 feel inspired. Therefore, the answer is inspiring (b). 1537
1444
                                                                            (b) solar system
1445
                                                                            (c) outer space
1446
        A: The answer must be a feeling which would cause someon $638
                                                                            (d) star
1447
        to want to hear someone play violin beautifully. Music i\$539
                                                                            (e) beans
1448
         form of art. Therefore, the answer is inspiring (b).
                                                                    1540
                                                                            A: The answer must be something that is considered to be
1//0
        A: Hearing someone play a violin beautifully makes me
                                                                             the center of the universe. The sun is the center of the
                                                                    1541
1450
        inspired. Therefore, the answer is inspiring (b).
                                                                    1542
                                                                            solar system. Therefore, the answer is solar system (b).
1451
                                                                    1543
                                                                            A: The answer must be a place where the sun is the center
1/52
       Q: What emotion does committing murder induce?
                                                                    1544
                                                                            of. The sun is the center of the solar system. Therefore,
1453
       Answer Choices:
                                                                    1545
                                                                            the answer is solar system (b).
        (a) fear
                                                                            A: It is the best option because it is the closest.
1454
                                                                    1546
1455
       (b) go to jail
                                                                    1547
                                                                            Therefore, the answer is solar system (b).
                                                                    1548
1456
       (c) problems
1457
        (d) cruel
                                                                    1549
                                                                           Q: What are people in a library likely doing?
       (e) dead
1458
                                                                    1550
                                                                           Answer Choices:
1459
        A: The answer must be a feeling that would cause someone 15551
                                                                            (a) talk to each other
1460
         commit murder. Murder is a crime. Therefore, the answer1552
                                                                            (b) board ships
1461
         fear (a).
                                                                    1553
                                                                            (c) study books
1462
        A: The answer must be a feeling which would cause someon $654
                                                                            (d) suffer hunger
        to commit murder. If someone feels fear, they are likely1555
1463
                                                                            (e) playing games
1464
         want to avoid committing murder. Therefore, the answer 1556
                                                                            A: The answer must be something that people in a library
1465
                                                                             are likely to be doing. People in a library are likely to
        fear (a).
                                                                            be studying books. Therefore, the answer is study books (c).
1466
        A: The only feeling. Therefore, the answer is fear (a). 1558
1467
                                                                    1559
1468
       Q: Sitting to close while watching TV can cause what sort1560
                                                                            A: The answer must be something that is likely to happen in
1469
        pain?
                                                                    1561
                                                                             a library. Libraries are places where people study books.
       Answer Choices:
1470
                                                                    1562
                                                                            Therefore, the answer is studying books (c). A: Books shelved as study-skills: How to Become a Straight-
1471
        (a) brain problems
                                                                    1563
1472
       (b) laziness
                                                                    1564
                                                                            A Student by Cal Newport, The Study Skills Handbook by
1473
                                                                    1565
       (c) get fat
                                                                            Stella Cottrell, Make It Stick: The Scienc... Therefore,
1474
        (d)
           headache
                                                                    1566
                                                                             the answer is study books (c)
1475
       (e) laughter
                                                                    1567
1476
                                                                           Q: A shark isn't something you have to worry about at the
        A: The answer must be a pain that comes from sitting too1568
1477
        close to the TV. Sitting too close to the TV can cause 1569
                                                                           lake in the woods, but there are plenty of dangers in the
        headaches. Therefore, the answer is headache (d). 1570 A: The answer must be a type of pain which can occur if 1571
1478
                                                                           what?
                                                                           Answer Choices:
         are sitting too close to the TV. Headaches are a common 572
1480
                                                                            (a) great oceans
1481
        side effect of sitting too close to the TV. Therefore, the 73
                                                                            (b) great outdoors
        answer is headache (d).
1482
                                                                            (c) tropical waters
1483
        A: the process of aging in humans. Therefore, the answer 15\mbox{\em E}
                                                                            (d) pacific ocean
1484
         headache (d).
                                                                    1576
                                                                            (e) gulf of mexico
1485
                                                                            A: The answer must be something that is dangerous in the
1486
       Q: What might people do to protect their legs from getting 78
                                                                            great outdoors. The great outdoors is a place where there
1487
                                                                    1579
                                                                            are many dangers. Therefore, the answer is great outdoors (
       dirty on the farm?
       Answer Choices:
1488
                                                                    1580
1489
       (a) wear ieans
                                                                    1581
                                                                            A: The answer must be a place where sharks are a danger.
1490
       (b) milk cow
                                                                    1582
                                                                            Lakes in the woods are not a place where sharks are a
                                                                             danger. Therefore, the answer is great outdoors (b)
1491
        (c) believe in god
                                                                    1583
1492
       (d) avoid mud
                                                                    1584
                                                                            A: The great outdoors is the only choice where you would
1493
       (e) plant flowers
                                                                    1585
                                                                            find a lake in the woods. Therefore, the answer is great
1494
        A: The answer must be something that people do to prot
                                                                  oc<del>1</del>586
1495
        their legs from getting dirty. Of the above choices,
                                                                    1587
1496
        wearing jeans is the most logical. Therefore, the answer 1588
                                                                           Q: You can share files with someone if you have a connection
1497
         jeans (a).
                                                                    1589
                                                                            to a what?
```

1590 1591 1592	(a) freeway	1606 1607 1608	Q: What can an injury happen to? Answer Choices:
1592	* · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	1609	(a) emergency room (b) doctor's office
1594	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	1610	
	***		(c) living thing
1595	(e) electrical circuit	1611	(d) bones
1596	A: The answer must be a way to share files. The answer i	£612	(e) accident
1597	computer network (d).	1613	A: The answer must be something that can happen to a living
1598	A: The answer must be a connection which allows you to	1614	thing. The answer is living thing (c).
1599	share files. A computer network is a collection of	1615	A: The answer must be something that can happen to a living
1600	computers which are connected to each other. Therefore,	t646	thing. If someone is injured, they are likely to want to
1601	answer is computer network (d).	1617	go to the emergency room. Therefore, the answer is living
1602	A: Files can be transmitted over a computer network, and	11618	thing (c).
1603	not a freeway. "wires" doesnt make any sense. Therefore,	1619	A: Living things feel pain, and therefore can be injured.
1604	the answer is computer network (d).	1620	Therefore, the answer is living thing (c).
1605			

1621 D Example Rationalizations on CQA

1622 We include a randomly sampled set of rationalizations which the model is able to produce before fine-tuning. We observe that sometimes, the model constructs an argument roughly of the form "the 1623 answer must have a set of properties. correct answer has those properties. therefore, the answer is 1624 correct answer." This structure of argument is fairly standard, but given that the model originally 1625 answered those questions incorrectly, it resembles template-matching more than reasoning. The 1626 technique of rephrasing the question in a simpler way before answering it directly is also often 1628 effective. In general, the rationales from the pretrained model's rationalization appears to be of 1629 similar quality to the pretrained model's rationale generation. We reference the pretrained model here rather than the STaR-trained model, as the final iteration's rationales are the ones which the model 1630 1631 struggled to learn from – that is, if the rationales were good, then we might expect that the model would have already incorporated them into its rationale generation. 1632

```
Q: Why do I eat just enough when eating breakfast?
1633
1634
     Answer Choices:
1635
     (a) gas
     (b) full stomach
1636
1637
     (c) feeling satisfied (CORRECT)
     (d) have energy
1638
1639
     (e) bloated
     A: The answer must be a reason for eating just enough when eating breakfast. Eating
1640
     just enough is a way to feel satisfied. Therefore, the answer is feeling satisfied (
1641
1642
1643
     Q: How is a dog likely to communicate with another dog?
1644
     Answer Choices:
1645
1646
     (a) reproduce
     (b) bark (CORRECT)
1647
     (c) do many things
1648
1649
     (d) clone
     (e) jump up
1650
     A: The answer must be a way for a dog to communicate with another dog. Dogs bark to
1651
1652
     communicate with each other. Therefore, the answer is bark (b).
1653
     Q: If a person is trying to weasel out of punishment for a crime, where are they
1654
1655
     likely to be?
     Answer Choices:
1656
     (a) court room (CORRECT)
1657
     (b) cherry tree
1658
     (c) chicken coop
1659
1660
     (d) natural history museum
1661
     (e) jail
     A: The answer must be a place where a person would be trying to get out of
1662
     punishment for a crime. The answer is court room (a).
1663
1665
     Q: What would easily hide a snake?
     Answer Choices:
1666
     (a) living room of a house
1667
1668
     (b) kew gardens
     (c) terrarium
     (d) thick forest (CORRECT)
1670
1671
     (e) tropical forest
1672
     A: The answer must be something that would hide a snake. The answer is thick forest
     (d).
1673
1674
     Q: The person didn't like the varying size of the cake slices handed out, she demand
1675
     more what?
1676
     Answer Choices:
1677
     (a) fairness (CORRECT)
1678
     (b) candies
1679
     (c) compliments
1680
1681
     (d) well fed
     (e) arguements
1682
```

```
A: The answer must be a reason for the person to demand more cake. The person is not
1683
      happy with the size of the cake slices. Therefore, the answer is fairness (a).
1684
1685
     Q: In America, the courthouse of any given town has a likely location, where is it?
1686
1687
     Answer Choices:
     (a) electrical circuit
1688
1689
     (b) getting married
     (c) capital city
1690
     (d) center of town (CORRECT)
1691
1692
     (e) michigan
1693
     A: The answer must be a location where a courthouse is located. The capital city is
     the location of the capital of a state. Therefore, the answer is center of town (d).
1694
1695
     Q: Where might I find a bowl nestled among other bowls in the kitchen?
1696
     Answer Choices:
1697
1698
     (a) refrigerator
    (b) kitchen top
1699
     (c) cupboard (CORRECT)
1700
     (d) dishwasher
1701
1702
     (e) apartment
     A: The answer must be a place where a bowl is found. The kitchen is a place where
1703
     bowls are found. Therefore, the answer is cupboard (c).
1704
1705
    Q: Which state has blue ridge mountains that are called Blue Mountain?
1707 Answer Choices:
    (a) appalachians
1708
     (b) virginia
1709
     (c) pennsylvania (CORRECT)
1710
     (d) north carolina
1711
     (e) montana
1712
1713 A: The answer must be a state with mountains. The answer is Pennsylvania (c).
    Q: Where could you find many radio studio?
    Answer Choices:
1716
     (a) radio station
1717
     (b) country
1718
1719
     (c) clear area
1720
     (d) office building
     (e) large city (CORRECT)
1721
     A: The answer must be a place where many radio studios are located. Radio studios
1722
     are used to broadcast radio programs. Therefore, the answer is large city (e).
1723
1724
1725 Q: Where would someone bring you a cup?
1726 Answer Choices:
     (a) apartment
1727
1728
     (b) closet
     (c) restaurant (CORRECT)
1729
    (d) table
1730
     (e) party
1731
     A: The answer must be a place where someone would bring you a cup. A restaurant is a
```

place where people bring cups. Therefore, the answer is restaurant (c).

1734 E STaR Without Rationalization (Rationale Generation Bootstrapping)

For convenience, we include the rationale generation bootstrapping algorithm alone here. However, it is simply Algorithm 1, with the blue components removed.

Algorithm 2 Rationale Generation Bootstrapping (STaR without rationalization)

```
Input M: a pretrained LLM; dataset \mathcal{D} = \{(x_i, y_i)\}_{i=1}^D (w/ few-shot prompts)

1: M_0 \leftarrow M # Copy the original model

2: for n in 1...N do # Outer loop

3: (\hat{r}_i, \hat{y}_i) \leftarrow M_{n-1}(x_i) \quad \forall i \in [1, D] # Perform rationale generation

4: \mathcal{D}_n \leftarrow \{(x_i, \hat{r}_i, y_i) \mid i \in [1, D] \land \hat{y}_i = y_i\} # Filter rationales using ground truth answers

5: M_n \leftarrow \operatorname{train}(M, \mathcal{D}_n) # Finetune the original model on the correct solutions - inner loop

6: end for
```

1737 F Case Study

- Q: John wants to eat at an Indian restaurant in on top of the space needle, where would he have to go?
 Answer Choices:
 (a) reservation (b) curry
 (c) britsh town (d) seattle
- (e) large city
 A: The answer must be a place with
- A: The answer must be a place with a space needle. The space needle is a landmark in Seattle. Therefore, the answer is Seattle (d).
- Q: I put a towel in a cardboard box for the kitten, I wanted it to have what? Answer Choices:
- (a) farmhouse (b) zoos (c) cold place(d) floor (e) warm placeA: The answer must be a place where the
- kitten would be comfortable. The kitten would be comfortable in a warm place. Therefore, the answer is warm place (e).
- Q: Needlepoint requires many accessories, what holds the work taut? Answer Choices:
- (a) sewing (b) collection of folk art(c) livingroom (d) frame (e) bathroomA: The answer must be something thatholds the work taut. The work is tautbecause it is held in place. Therefore,the answer is frame (d).
- (a) Problems where the model was able to solve questions which it had previously answered incorrectly.

- Q: They prided themselves on being a wealth of knowledge, and that's why many chose to attend their what?

 Answer Choices:
- (a) book store (b) university (c) meeting(d) class (e) encyclopedia
- A: The answer must be a place where people go to learn about things. The answer is university (b).
- A: The answer must be a place where people go to learn about things. Universities are places where people go to learn about things. Therefore, the answer is university (b).
- Q: You want a real estate agent that is straight forward with you, the last thing you want is for them to what a house's quality?

 Answer Choices:
- (a) cover up (b) offer price
- (c) misrepresent (d) lie (e) falsify A: The answer must be a way to determine the quality of a house. The answer is misrepresent (c).
- A: The answer must be something that would be a bad thing for the real estate agent to do. The real estate agent would be misrepresenting the house's quality if they were to lie about it. Therefore, the answer is misrepresent (c).
- (b) Problems where the model was already able to answer them with few-shot reasoning, but was able to answer better after more iterations.

Figure 7: Case study on STaR. We highlight some problems which the model is not initially able to solve, as well as rationales which are initially correct but improve. We note that for CQA, one is tasked with selecting the "best" answer, where multiple answers may be technically correct.

G Further Limitations and Impacts

Bias It is important to note that STaR is designed to amplify the reasoning leading to correct solutions on a dataset. Another implication is that if biases are "useful" in solving a dataset then they will be amplified. This is made worse by rationalization, as biased answers that the model may not naturally arrive at are, in a sense, pulled out of the model. The exact interaction between the bias in a dataset and the pre-existing bias learned by the model is unclear, and something to consider before real-world deployment of all large language models in general, but STaR-trained models in particular.

We find some encouraging initial results on this however: for questions where gender is not relevant, the model appears to disregard it in its explanation. For example: "Q: Where is a good place for a woman to store her sunglasses? \rightarrow A: The answer must be a place where sunglasses are stored. Sunglasses are stored in purses. Therefore, the answer is purse (e)." or "Q: The only baggage the woman checked was a drawstring bag, where was she heading with it? \rightarrow A: The answer must be a place where a drawstring bag is checked. The answer is airport (e)." We believe this question warrants a much more comprehensive study.

Faithfulness One important challenge with models which seek to be interpretable or provide explanations for their reasoning is that of faithfulness. While our primary emphasis is not on the explainability benefits that STaR may bring, there is a fundamental challenge around evaluating explanations and rationales: namely, faithfulness [37, 38]. [38] describe faithful explanations as those which "accurately [represent] the reasoning process behind the model's prediction." While STaR encourages the use of reasoning in rationales which leads the model to correct answers, it is difficult, if not impossible, to ensure that the rationales reflect the model's internal processing. For example, it is straightforward to imagine the model implicitly selecting a particular answer immediately and then generating a rationale to justify that selected answer. This would allow a model to generate unbiased rationales while selecting answers in a biased way.

The fact that our model outperforms one fine-tuned to directly predict the answers, and ablation studies from papers such as [6] make it clear that the generation of a rationale before producing an answer non-trivially improves the model's answer quality. However, it is difficult to evaluate the degree to which any particular answer's rationale is faithful. However, we note that there problems are not unique to STaR, but are symptomatic of the difficulty of understanding large language models and in particular the rationales generated by large language models.

Scale Finally, we note there is no guarantee that our results would generalize to larger models. However, [39] and [40] suggest that the benefits of rationales increases with scale on numerous problems, which is perhaps reason for optimism. On the other hand, a limitation of STaR on small models is that in order for the first iteration of STaR to succeed, few-shot performance must be above chance. This implies that the initial model must be big enough to have some reasoning capabilities. For instance we found that GPT-2 was not able to bootstrap from few-shot reasoning in even the arithmetic domain. A further limitation is that settings with a high level of chance performance (e.g. binary decisions) yield many poor rationales, confounding the STaR approach. As discussed, filtering bad reasoning paired with correct answers remains an open question.

H Hyperparameters

GPT-J is a 28-layer decoder-only transformer, with an embedding size of 1024, 16 attention heads of dimension 256, and an FFN hidden layer of size 16384. It was pre-trained on the Pile [41], with a vocabulary size of 50.4K

In general, unless otherwise stated, we use a batch size of 8 sequences, each of length 1024. We also use packing, namely, packing the shorter examples to form longer sequences (up to length 1024) to improve TPU utilization. We do not use weight decay, and we train and sample on a single TPU-v3 node. We performed a hyperparameter search over learning rates from 10^{-7} to 10^{-4} using the Adam optimizer [42]. We found that 10^{-6} was consistently the best-performing learning rate.

786 I GSM8K Few-shot Prompt

```
We include the following few-shot prompts for GSM8K, based on the examples in [9].
1787
     Q: Natalia sold clips to 48 of her friends in April, and then she sold half as many
1788
1789
     clips in May. How many clips did Natalia sell altogether in April and May?
     A: Natalia sold 48/2 = <<48/2 = 24>>24 clips in May.
     Natalia sold 48+24 = <<48+24=72>>72 clips altogether in April and May.
1791
1792
1793
1794
     Q: Betty is saving money for a new wallet which costs $100. Betty has only half of
1795
     the money she needs. Her parents decided to give her $15 for that purpose, and her
     grandparents twice as much as her parents. How much more money does Betty need to
1796
     buy the wallet?
1797
     A: In the beginning, Betty has only 100 / 2 = <<100/2=50>>50.
1798
     Betty's grandparents gave her 15 * 2 = $<<15*2=30>>30.
     This means, Betty needs 100 - 50 - 30 - 15 = $<<100-50-30-15=5>>5 more.
1800
1801
1802
1803
     Q: Julie is reading a 120-page book. Yesterday, she was able to read 12 pages and
     today, she read twice as many pages as yesterday. If she wants to read half of the
1804
1805
     remaining pages tomorrow, how many pages should she read?
     A: Maila read 12 x 2 = <<12*2=24>>24 pages today.
1806
     So she was able to read a total of 12 + 24 = <<12+24=36>>36 pages since yesterday.
1807
     There are 120 - 36 = <<120-36=84>>84 pages left to be read.
1809
     Since she wants to read half of the remaining pages tomorrow, then she should read
     84/2 = <<84/2=42>>42 pages.
1810
     #### 42
1811
1812
     Q: Mark has a garden with flowers. He planted plants of three different colors in it
1813
     . Ten of them are yellow, and there are 80\% more of those in purple. There are only
1814
     25% as many green flowers as there are yellow and purple flowers. How many flowers
1815
     does Mark have in his garden?
     A: There are 80/100 * 10 = <<80/100*10=8>>8 more purple flowers than yellow flowers.
     So in Mark's garden, there are 10 + 8 = <<10+8=18>>18 purple flowers.
1818
     Purple and yellow flowers sum up to 10 + 18 = <<10+18=28>>28 flowers.
1819
1820
     That means in Mark's garden there are 25/100 * 28 = <<25/100*28=7>>7 green flowers.
1821
     So in total Mark has 28 + 7 = \langle 28 + 7 = 35 \rangle 35 plants in his garden.
1822
     #### 35
1823
     Q: Alexis is applying for a new job and bought a new set of business clothes to wear
1824
     to the interview. She went to a department store with a budget of $200 and spent
1825
     $30 on a button-up shirt, $46 on suit pants, $38 on a suit coat, $11 on socks, and
1827
     $18 on a belt. She also purchased a pair of shoes, but lost the receipt for them.
     She has $16 left from her budget. How much did Alexis pay for the shoes?
1828
     A: Let S be the amount Alexis paid for the shoes.
1829
     She spent S + 30 + 46 + 38 + 11 + 18 = S + << +30 + 46 + 38 + 11 + 18 = 143 >> 143.
1831
     She used all but $16 of her budget, so S + 143 = 200 - 16 = 184.
     Thus, Alexis paid S = 184 - 143 = $<<184-143=41>>41 for the shoes.
1832
     #### 41
1833
1834
     Q: Tina makes $18.00 an hour. If she works more than 8 hours per shift, she is
     eligible for overtime, which is paid by your hourly wage + 1/2 your hourly wage. If
1836
     she works 10 hours every day for 5 days, how much money does she make?
1837
1838
     A: She works 8 hours a day for $18 per hour so she makes 8*18 = $
     <<8*18=144.00>>144.00 per 8-hour shift
     She works 10 hours a day and anything over 8 hours is eligible for overtime, so she
1840
     gets 10-8 = \langle \langle 10-8=2 \rangle \rangle 2 hours of overtime
1841
     Overtime is calculated as time and a half so and she makes $18/hour so her overtime
1842
     pay is 18*.5 = $<<18*.5=9.00>>9.00
     Her overtime pay is 18+9 = $<<18+9=27.00>>27.00
     Her base pay is $144.00 per 8-hour shift and she works 5 days and makes 5 * $144 = $
1845
     <<144*5=720.00>>720.00
1846
     Her overtime pay is $27.00 per hour and she works 2 hours of overtime per day and
```

makes 27*2 = \$<<27*2=54.00>>54.00 in overtime pay

^{1849 2} hours of overtime pay for 5 days means she makes 54*5 = \$270.001850 In 5 days her base pay is \$720.00 and she makes \$270.00 in overtime pay so she makes 1851 \$720 + \$270 = \$<<720+270=990.00>>990.00

^{1852 #### 990}

553 J STaR GSM8K Solutions

We observe some interesting patterns with the GSM8K solutions proposed by the STaR-trained model. Typically, when the solution takes substantially fewer calculation steps than the ground truth, it corresponds to an instance where the model accidentally answered the question correctly despite mistakes in its reasoning. In some cases, however, the model produces simpler solutions than those in the ground truth. One example is shown in Figure 8.

Q: A van is delivering 180 bottles of drinks to a neighborhood, and each bottle contains

either cider or beer or a mixture of two. Out of the 180 bottles, 40 contain only cider, 80 contain only beer, and the rest are a mixture of the two drinks. If the delivery man gives half the number of each bottle of drink to the first house, how many bottles does the first house get? Human (Ground truth from GSM8K dataset): STaR (on GPT-J): The total number of bottles containing The delivery man gives half the number of cider or beer is 40+80 = (<40+80=120>>120each bottle of drink to the first house. If the number of bottles in the van was So he gives $180/2 = \langle (180/2 = 90) \rangle 90$ bottles 180, then 180-120 =<<180-120=60>>60 of drink to the first house. contains a mixture of the two drinks. #### 90 At the first house, the delivery man dropped $1/2*40 = \langle \langle 1/2*40=20 \rangle \rangle 20$ bottles. There were also $1/2*80 = \langle \langle 1/2*80=40 \rangle \rangle 40$ bottles of beer that the delivery man gave to the first house. Together, the first house received 40+20 = <<40+20=60>>60 bottles of cider and beer The total number of bottles that had a mixture of the two drinks that were dropped at the first house is 1/2*60 =<<1/2*60=30>>30 The first house got 60+30 = (<60+30=90>>90bottles of all types of drinks. #### 90

Figure 8: An example problem in the training set where STaR derives a significantly simpler solution than the ground truth.